

STATISTICAL SCIENCE

a review journal of the institute of mathematical statistics

Volume 2

Number 3

August 1987

Featuring

**Joseph L. Gastwirth on
THE STATISTICAL PRECISION OF
MEDICAL SCREENING PROCEDURES**

**James S. Hodges on
UNCERTAINTY, POLICY ANALYSIS
AND STATISTICS**

**Paul R. Rosenbaum on
THE ROLE OF A SECOND CONTROL GROUP**

**James Berger and Mohan Delampady on
TESTING PRECISE HYPOTHESES**

An Interview with GEORGE BOX

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Morris H. DeGroot
Carnegie Mellon University

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

Tina Lynne Rees

EDITORS

Ingram Olkin
Stanford University

Stephen Stigler
University of Chicago

James V. Zidek
University of British Columbia

MANAGING EDITOR

Paul Shaman
University of Pennsylvania

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

Tammy Morrow

The aim of *Statistical Science* is to present the full range of contemporary statistical thought at a technical level accessible to the broad community of practitioners, teachers, researchers, and students of statistics and probability.

The journal will publish discussions of methodological and theoretical topics of current interest and importance, surveys of substantive research areas with promising statistical applications, comprehensive book reviews, discussions of classic articles from the statistical literature, and interviews with distinguished statisticians and probabilists.

SUBMISSION POLICY

Statistical Science welcomes the submission of expository, review, and survey papers in all areas of the theory, methodology, and applications of statistics and probability. Articles that synthesize research that has been published in diverse sources or that has been developed from diverse points of view are especially valuable.

Four nonreturnable copies of any manuscript submitted for consideration are requested for the reviewing process. Copies should be mailed first class to:

Professor Morris H. DeGroot
Executive Editor, *Statistical Science*
Department of Statistics
Carnegie Mellon University
Pittsburgh, PA 15213

The manuscripts should be typed on $8\frac{1}{2} \times 11$ -inch white paper, on one side only, and double-spaced throughout, including the references, with margins of at least $1\frac{1}{2}$ inches on all four sides. Pages should be numbered consecutively. The manuscript should contain an abstract of 200 or fewer words, followed by approximately 5 or 6 key words or phrases. A short author's note providing the name, address, present position or rank, and affiliation of each author should also be included.

A condition of submission is that the manuscript has not previously been published and is not simultaneously being considered for publication elsewhere.

Statistical Science is copyrighted and authors will be asked to sign a copyright transfer to the IMS before publication.

STATISTICAL SCIENCE

Volume 2, Number 3

August 1987

In This Issue	211
The Statistical Precision of Medical Screening Procedures:	
Application to Polygraph and AIDS Antibodies Test Data . . . <i>Joseph L. Gastwirth</i>	213
Comment: The Polygraph and the PVP <i>D. H. Kaye</i>	223
Comment: Base Rates and the Statistical Precision	
of Polygraph Tests in Various Applications . <i>John C. Kircher and David C. Raskin</i>	226
Comment <i>Janet Wittes</i>	228
Comment <i>Judith D. Goldberg</i>	230
Comment <i>Seymour Geisser</i>	231
Comment <i>Beth C. Gladen</i>	233
Rejoinder <i>Joseph L. Gastwirth</i>	234
A Conversation with George Box	239
Uncertainty, Policy Analysis and Statistics <i>James S. Hodges</i>	259
Comment <i>David Freedman</i>	276
Comment <i>Seymour Geisser</i>	277
Comment <i>Peter J. Huber</i>	279
Comment <i>Joseph B. Kadane</i>	281
Comment <i>Albert Madansky</i>	282
Comment <i>Adrian F. M. Smith</i>	286
Rejoinder <i>James S. Hodges</i>	288
The Role of a Second Control Group in an Observational Study . . . <i>Paul R. Rosenbaum</i>	292
Comment <i>Paul W. Holland</i>	306
Comment: The Use of Multiple Control Groups	
in Designed Experiments <i>Barry H. Margolin</i>	308
Comment <i>Richard G. Cornell</i>	310
Comment <i>Norman Breslow</i>	311
Rejoinder <i>Paul R. Rosenbaum</i>	313
Testing Precise Hypotheses <i>James O. Berger and Mohan Delampady</i>	317
Comment <i>D. R. Cox</i>	335
Comment <i>Morris L. Eaton</i>	337
Comment <i>Arnold Zellner</i>	339
Comment <i>M. J. Bayarri</i>	342
Comment <i>George Casella and Roger L. Berger</i>	344
Comment <i>Joseph B. Kadane</i>	347
Rejoinder <i>James O. Berger and Mohan Delampady</i>	348

Statistical Science (ISSN 0883-4237), Volume 2, Number 3, August 1987. Published in February, May, August, and November by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics, 3401 Investment Boulevard #7, Hayward, California 94545. Second-class postage paid at Hayward, California and at additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** Send address changes to *Statistical Science*, Institute of Mathematical Statistics, 3401 Investment Boulevard #7, Hayward, California 94545.

Copyright © 1987 by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics
Printed in the United States of America

IMS CORPORATE MEMBERS

THE AEROSPACE CORPORATION
Los Angeles, California

AT&T BELL LABORATORIES
Murray Hill, New Jersey

BELL COMMUNICATIONS RESEARCH
Morristown, New Jersey

GENERAL MOTORS CORPORATION
Research Laboratories
Warren, Michigan

INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS MACHINES CORP.
Thomas J. Watson Research Center
Yorktown Heights, New York

SPRINGER-VERLAG NEW YORK INCORPORATED
New York, New York

IMS INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS

ACADEMIA SINICA
Inst. of Statistics
Taipei, Taiwan

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics
Tempe, Arizona

AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY
Canberra, ACT, Australia

BOWLING GREEN STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Bowling Green, Ohio

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY AT FULLERTON
Depts. of Mathematics and Management Science
Fullerton, California

CASE WESTERN RESERVE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Cleveland, Ohio

CENTERS FOR DISEASE CONTROL
Atlanta, Georgia

CENTRE INTERNATIONAL DE RECONTRE MATH
Marseille, France

CORNELL UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics
Ithaca, New York

FLORIDA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Tallahassee, Florida

GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Washington, DC

HARVARD UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Cambridge, Massachusetts

INDIANA UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics
Bloomington, Indiana

IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics and Statistical Laboratory
Ames, Iowa

JOHNS HOPKINS UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Biostatistics
Baltimore, Maryland

KANSAS STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Manhattan, Kansas

MARA INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
Selangor, Malaysia

MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
Dept. of Mathematics
Cambridge, Massachusetts

MIAMI UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Oxford, Ohio

MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics and Probability
East Lansing, Michigan

NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY
Fort George G. Meade, Maryland

NEW MEXICO STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
Las Cruces, New Mexico

NORTH CAROLINA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Raleigh, North Carolina

NORTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
DeKalb, Illinois

OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Columbus, Ohio

OREGON STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Corvallis, Oregon

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
University Park, Pennsylvania

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
Princeton, New Jersey

PURDUE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
West Lafayette, Indiana

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Kingston, Ontario, Canada

RICE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
Houston, Texas

THE ROCKEFELLER UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
New York, New York

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada

SOUTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics, Statistics, and Computer Science
Edwardsville, Illinois

SOUTHERN METHODIST UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Dallas, Texas

STANFORD UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Statistics
 Stanford, California

TEMPLE UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

TEXAS TECH UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Lubbock, Texas

UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Tucson, Arizona

UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF CALGARY
 Div. of Statistics
 Calgary, Alberta, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Berkeley, California

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
 Div. of Statistics
 Davis, California

UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Gainesville, Florida

UNIVERSITY OF GEORGIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Athens, Georgia

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS
 Dept. of Statistics
 Champaign, Illinois

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS AT CHICAGO
 Dept. of Mathematics, Statistics, and Computer Science
 Chicago, Illinois

UNIVERSITY OF IOWA
 Dept. of Statistics and Actuarial Science
 Iowa City, Iowa

UNIVERSITY OF MANITOBA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND
 Dept. of Mathematics
 College Park, Maryland

UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Amherst, Massachusetts

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
 Dept. of Statistics
 Ann Arbor, Michigan

UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA
 School of Statistics
 Minneapolis, Minnesota

UNIVERSITY OF MISSOURI AT COLUMBIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Columbia, Missouri

UNIVERSITY OF MONTREAL
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Montreal, Quebec, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Lincoln, Nebraska

UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Albuquerque, New Mexico

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Chapel Hill, North Carolina

UNIVERSITY OF OREGON
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Eugene, Oregon

UNIVERSITY OF OTTAWA
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Columbia, South Carolina

UNIVERSITY OF STOCKHOLM
 Institute of Actuarial Mathematics
 and Mathematical Statistics
 Stockholm, Sweden

UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Austin, Texas

UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT SAN ANTONIO
 Div. of Mathematics, Computer Science,
 and Systems Design
 San Antonio, Texas

UNIVERSITY OF VICTORIA
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Victoria, British Columbia, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Charlottesville, Virginia

UNIVERSITY OF WASHINGTON
 Depts. of Statistics and Mathematics
 Seattle, Washington

UNIVERSITY OF WATERLOO
 Dept. of Statistics and Actuarial Science
 Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN AT MILWAUKEE
 Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
 Milwaukee, Wisconsin

VIRGINIA COMMONWEALTH UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
 Richmond, Virginia

**VIRGINIA POLYTECHNIC INSTITUTE
 AND STATE UNIVERSITY**
 Dept. of Statistics
 Blacksburg, Virginia

WAYNE STATE UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Detroit, Michigan

YORK UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Downsview, Ontario, Canada