

# STATISTICAL SCIENCE

a review journal of the institute of mathematical statistics

**Volume 3**

**Number 1**

**February 1988**

## **Featuring**

**D. A. Freedman and H. Zeisel on  
CANCER RISK ASSESSMENT:  
FROM MOUSE TO MAN**

Golden Oldies: A Discussion of Harold Hotelling's  
**THE TEACHING OF STATISTICS and  
THE PLACE OF STATISTICS IN THE UNIVERSITY**

Adrian C. Darnell on the life of  
**HAROLD HOTELLING**

**Satish Iyengar and Joel B. Greenhouse on  
SELECTION MODELS AND  
THE FILE DRAWER PROBLEM**

**A Conversation with  
FREDERICK MOSTELLER and JOHN W. TUKEY**

---

**EXECUTIVE EDITOR**

Morris H. DeGroot  
Carnegie Mellon University

**EDITORIAL ASSISTANT**

Tina Lynne Rees

**EDITORS**

Ingram Olkin  
Stanford University

Stephen Stigler  
University of Chicago

James V. Zidek  
University of British Columbia

**MANAGING EDITOR**

Paul Shaman  
University of Pennsylvania

**EDITORIAL ASSISTANT**

Tammy Morrow

---

The aim of *Statistical Science* is to present the full range of contemporary statistical thought at a technical level accessible to the broad community of practitioners, teachers, researchers, and students of statistics and probability.

The journal will publish discussions of methodological and theoretical topics of current interest and importance, surveys of substantive research areas with promising statistical applications, comprehensive book reviews, discussions of classic articles from the statistical literature, and interviews with distinguished statisticians and probabilists.

**SUBMISSION POLICY**

*Statistical Science* welcomes the submission of expository, review, and survey papers in all areas of the theory, methodology, and applications of statistics and probability. Articles that synthesize research that has been published in diverse sources or that has been developed from diverse points of view are especially valuable.

Four nonreturnable copies of any manuscript submitted for consideration are requested for the reviewing process. Copies should be mailed first class to:

Professor Morris H. DeGroot  
Executive Editor, *Statistical Science*  
Department of Statistics  
Carnegie Mellon University  
Pittsburgh, PA 15213

The manuscripts should be typed on  $8\frac{1}{2} \times 11$ -inch white paper, on one side only, and double-spaced throughout, including the references, with margins of at least  $1\frac{1}{2}$  inches on all four sides. Pages should be numbered consecutively. The manuscript should contain an abstract of 200 or fewer words, followed by approximately 5 or 6 key words or phrases. A short author's note providing the name, address, present position or rank, and affiliation of each author should also be included.

A condition of submission is that the manuscript has not previously been published and is not simultaneously being considered for publication elsewhere.

*Statistical Science* is copyrighted and authors will be asked to sign a copyright transfer to the IMS before publication.

# STATISTICAL SCIENCE

Volume 3, Number 1

February 1988

In This Issue .....		1
From Mouse-to-Man: The Quantitative Assessment of Cancer Risks		
	<i>D. A. Freedman and H. Zeisel</i>	3
Comment: Risk Assessment: Science or Policy? .....	<i>Norman Breslow</i>	28
Comment .....	<i>J. K. Haseman</i>	33
Comment .....	<i>Suresh H. Moolgavkar and Anup Dewanji</i>	39
Comment: The Use of Animal Experiments in Cancer Risk Assessment		
	<i>J. Kaldor and L. Tomatis</i>	41
Comment .....	<i>William DuMouchel</i>	43
Rejoinder .....	<i>D. A. Freedman and H. Zeisel</i>	45
Harold Hotelling 1895-1973 .....	<i>Adrian C. Darnell</i>	57
Golden Oldies: Classic Articles from the World of Statistics and Probability		
The Teaching of Statistics .....	<i>Harold Hotelling</i>	63
The Place of Statistics in the University .....	<i>Harold Hotelling</i>	72
Comment .....	<i>David S. Moore</i>	84
Comment .....	<i>James V. Zidek</i>	87
Comment .....	<i>Kenneth J. Arrow</i>	90
Comment: Academic Politics and the Teaching of Statistics ...	<i>Harold Hotelling, Jr.</i>	92
Comment .....	<i>Robert V. Hogg</i>	95
Comment: Harold Hotelling's Views on Statistics .....	<i>Ralph A. Bradley</i>	98
Comment: Recollections about Harold Hotelling .....	<i>W. Edwards Deming</i>	103
Comment .....	<i>Shanti S. Gupta</i>	104
Comment .....	<i>Ingram Olkin</i>	107
Selection Models and the File Drawer Problem		
	<i>Satish Iyengar and Joel B. Greenhouse</i>	109
Comment .....	<i>Larry V. Hedges</i>	118
Comment: Assumptions and Procedures in the File Drawer Problem		
	<i>Robert Rosenthal and Donald B. Rubin</i>	120
Comment .....	<i>Nan Laird, G. P. Patil and C. Taillie</i>	126
Comment .....	<i>M. J. Bayarri</i>	128
Comment .....	<i>C. Radhakrishna Rao</i>	131
Comment .....	<i>William DuMouchel</i>	132
Rejoinder .....	<i>Satish Iyengar and Joel B. Greenhouse</i>	133
Frederick Mosteller and John W. Tukey: A Conversation .....		136
Publications Received .....		145

**Statistical Science** (ISSN 0883-4237), Volume 3, Number 1, February 1988. Published in February, May, August and November by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics, 3401 Investment Boulevard #7, Hayward, California 94545. Second-class postage paid at Hayward, California and at additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** Send address changes to *Statistical Science*, Institute of Mathematical Statistics, 3401 Investment Boulevard #7, Hayward, California 94545.

Copyright © 1988 by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics  
 Printed in the United States of America

## IMS CORPORATE MEMBERS

THE AEROSPACE CORPORATION  
Los Angeles, California

AT&T BELL LABORATORIES  
Murray Hill, New Jersey

BELL COMMUNICATIONS RESEARCH  
Morristown, New Jersey

GENERAL MOTORS CORPORATION  
Research Laboratories  
Warren, Michigan

INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS MACHINES CORP.  
Thomas J. Watson Research Center  
Yorktown Heights, New York

SPRINGER-VERLAG NEW YORK INCORPORATED  
New York, New York

## IMS INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS

ACADEMIA SINICA  
Inst. of Statistical Science  
Taipei, Taiwan

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Tempe, Arizona

AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY  
Canberra, ACT, Australia

BOWLING GREEN STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Bowling Green, Ohio

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY AT FULLERTON  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Fullerton, California

CASE WESTERN RESERVE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Cleveland, Ohio

CENTERS FOR DISEASE CONTROL  
Atlanta, Georgia

CENTRE INTERNATIONAL DE RECONTRE MATH  
Marseille, France

CORNELL UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Ithaca, New York

FLORIDA STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
Tallahassee, Florida

GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
Washington, DC

HARVARD UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
Cambridge, Massachusetts

INDIANA UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Bloomington, Indiana

INSTITUTO MEXICANO DEL PETROLEO  
Mexico, DF, Mexico

IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics and Statistical Laboratory  
Ames, Iowa

JOHNS HOPKINS UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Biostatistics  
Baltimore, Maryland

KANSAS STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
Manhattan, Kansas

MARA INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY  
Selangor, Malaysia

MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Cambridge, Massachusetts

MIAMI UNIVERSITY LIBRARY  
Oxford, Ohio

MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics and Probability  
East Lansing, Michigan

NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY  
Fort George G. Meade, Maryland

NEW MEXICO STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences  
Las Cruces, New Mexico

NORTH CAROLINA STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
Raleigh, North Carolina

NORTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences  
DeKalb, Illinois

OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
Columbus, Ohio

OREGON STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
Corvallis, Oregon

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Statistics  
University Park, Pennsylvania

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY LIBRARY  
Princeton, New Jersey

PURDUE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY  
West Lafayette, Indiana

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Kingston, Ontario, Canada

RICE UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences  
Houston, Texas

RICE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY  
Houston, Texas

THE ROCKEFELLER UNIVERSITY LIBRARY  
New York, New York

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada

SOUTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Edwardsville, Illinois

**SOUTHERN METHODIST UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Dallas, Texas

**STANFORD UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Stanford, California

**TEMPLE UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

**TEXAS TECH UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Lubbock, Texas

**UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Tucson, Arizona

**UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada

**UNIVERSITY OF CALGARY**  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Calgary, Alberta, Canada

**UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Berkeley, California

**UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA**  
Div. of Statistics  
Davis, California

**UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Gainesville, Florida

**UNIVERSITY OF GEORGIA**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Athens, Georgia

**UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Champaign, Illinois

**UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS AT CHICAGO**  
Dept. of Mathematics, Statistics, and Computer Science  
Chicago, Illinois

**UNIVERSITY OF IOWA**  
Dept. of Statistics and Actuarial Science  
Iowa City, Iowa

**UNIVERSITY OF MANITOBA**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada

**UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
College Park, Maryland

**UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS**  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Amherst, Massachusetts

**UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Ann Arbor, Michigan

**UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA**  
School of Statistics  
Minneapolis, Minnesota

**UNIVERSITY OF MISSOURI**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Columbia, Missouri

**UNIVERSITY OF MONTREAL**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Montreal, Quebec, Canada

**UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA**  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Lincoln, Nebraska

**UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO**  
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics  
Albuquerque, New Mexico

**UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Chapel Hill, North Carolina

**UNIVERSITY OF OREGON**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Eugene, Oregon

**UNIVERSITY OF OTTAWA**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

**UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Columbia, South Carolina

**UNIVERSITY OF STOCKHOLM**  
Institute of Actuarial Mathematics  
and Mathematical Statistics  
Stockholm, Sweden

**UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Austin, Texas

**UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT SAN ANTONIO**  
Div. of Mathematics, Computer Science,  
and Systems Design  
San Antonio, Texas

**UNIVERSITY OF VICTORIA**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Victoria, British Columbia, Canada

**UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Charlottesville, Virginia

**UNIVERSITY OF WASHINGTON**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Seattle, Washington

**UNIVERSITY OF WATERLOO**  
Dept. of Statistics and Actuarial Sciences  
Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

**VIRGINIA COMMONWEALTH UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences  
Richmond, Virginia

**VIRGINIA POLYTECHNIC INSTITUTE  
AND STATE UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Statistics  
Blacksburg, Virginia

**WAYNE STATE UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Detroit, Michigan

**YORK UNIVERSITY**  
Dept. of Mathematics  
Downsview, Ontario, Canada