

STATISTICAL SCIENCE

a review journal of the institute of mathematical statistics

Volume 7

Number 2

May 1992

Featuring

Clifford C. Clogg on
THE IMPACT OF SOCIOLOGICAL METHODOLOGY
ON STATISTICAL METHODOLOGY

Stephen E. Fienberg
THE HISTORY OF STATISTICS: A REVIEW ESSAY

THREE PAPERS ON META-ANALYSIS

F. Mosteller and T. C. Chalmers

K. B. G. Dear and C. B. Begg

L. V. Hedges

NEW RESEARCHERS' REPORT: COMMENTS

WOMEN IN STATISTICS by Deborah Nolan

and A Conversation with Boris Gnedenko

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Robert E. Kass
Carnegie Mellon University

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT

Heidi Rhodes

EDITORS

Leon Jay Gleser
University of Pittsburgh
David Griffeath
University of Wisconsin

Terry Speed
University of California, Berkeley
Ramanathan Gnanadesikan
Rutgers University

Nancy Reid
University of Toronto
Michael Titterington
University of Glasgow

MANAGING EDITOR

Roger L. Berger
North Carolina State University

PRODUCTION EDITOR

Patrick Kelly

PAST EXECUTIVE EDITORS

Morris H. DeGroot, 1986–1988

Carl N. Morris, 1989–1991

The aim of *Statistical Science* is to present the full range of contemporary statistical thought at a technical level accessible to the broad community of practitioners, teachers, researchers and students of statistics and probability.

The journal will publish discussions of methodological and theoretical topics of current interest and importance, surveys of substantive research areas with promising statistical applications, comprehensive book reviews, discussions of classic articles from the statistical literature, and interviews with distinguished statisticians and probabilists.

SUBMISSION POLICY

Statistical Science welcomes the submission of expository, review, and survey papers in all areas of the theory, methodology, and applications of statistics and probability. Articles that synthesize research that has been published in diverse sources or that has been developed from diverse points of view are especially valuable.

Four nonreturnable copies of any manuscript submitted for consideration are requested for the reviewing process. Copies should be mailed first class to:

Professor Robert E. Kass
Executive Editor, *Statistical Science*
Department of Statistics
Carnegie Mellon University
Pittsburgh, PA 15213-3890
statsci@stat.cmu.edu

The manuscripts should be typed on 8½ × 11-inch white paper, on one side only, and double-spaced throughout, including the references, with margins of at least 1½ inches on all four sides. Pages should be numbered consecutively. The manuscript should contain an abstract of 200 or fewer words, followed by approximately 5 or 6 key words or phrases. A short author's note providing the name, address, present position or rank and affiliation of each author should also be included.

A condition of submission is that the manuscript has not previously been published and is not simultaneously being considered for publication elsewhere.

All authors must transfer copyright to the Institute prior to publication.

Page charges are \$45 per printed page. Payment of some or all of the estimated page charges associated with articles is strongly encouraged. The editorial review of articles and administration of page charges are completely separate activities. Manuscripts are reviewed and accepted prior to determining whether page charges will be paid.

Corresponding authors receive 25 gratis offprints. Offprints of discussion articles include the main article(s), discussion(s) and rejoinder(s) as a package. Corresponding authors of main articles receive 25 gratis offprints; corresponding discussants receive 10 gratis offprints. Additional offprints may be purchased by using the IMS Offprint Purchase Order Form accompanying the galley.

Copyright transfer, page charges and offprints are the responsibility of the IMS Business Manager.

STATISTICAL SCIENCE

Volume 7, Number 2

May 1992

In This Issue	181
Parting Remarks from the Outgoing Editor	182
The Impact of Sociological Methodology on Statistical Methodology <i>Clifford C. Clogg</i>	183
Comment	<i>David J. Bartholomew</i> 196
Comment: It's the Interplay That's Important	<i>Paul W. Holland</i> 198
Comment	<i>Charles F. Manski</i> 201
Comment: The Fence Between Statistics and Social Research.....	<i>Ivo W. Molenaar</i> 203
Rejoinder	<i>Clifford C. Clogg</i> 205
A Brief History of Statistics in Three and One-Half Chapters: A Review Essay	
..... <i>Stephen E. Fienberg</i>	208
Meta-Analysis: Methods for Combining Independent Studies	<i>Ingram Olkin</i> 226
Some Progress and Problems in Meta-Analysis of Clinical Trials	
..... <i>Frederick Mosteller and Thomas C. Chalmers</i>	227
An Approach for Assessing Publication Bias Prior to Performing a Meta-Analysis	
..... <i>Keith B. G. Dear and Colin B. Begg</i>	237
Modeling Publication Selection Effects in Meta-Analysis.....	<i>Larry V. Hedges</i> 246
Readers' Comments to the New Researchers' Committee Report	
Comment from the National Science Foundation	
..... <i>Judith Sunley, Peter Arzberger, Keith Crank and Nell Sedransk</i>	256
Comment from the National Security Agency	<i>James R. Maar</i> 259
Comment	<i>Michael R. Chernick</i> 261
Comment	<i>Cindy L. Christiansen</i> 262
Comment	<i>Agnes M. Herzberg</i> 263
Comment	<i>R. L. Tweedie</i> 263
Rejoinder	<i>New Researchers' Committee of the IMS</i> 265
Women in Statistics in Academe: Mentors Matter	<i>Deborah Nolan</i> 267
A Conversation with Boris Vladimirovich Gnedenko	
..... <i>Nozer D. Singpurwalla and Richard L. Smith</i>	273
Acknowledgment of Referees' Services.....	284

Statistical Science (ISSN 0883-4237), Volume 7, Number 2, May 1992. Published quarterly by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics, 3401 Investment Boulevard #7, Hayward, California 94545. Second-class postage paid at Hayward, California and at additional mailing offices. **POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to *Statistical Science*, Institute of Mathematical Statistics, 3401 Investment Boulevard #7, Hayward, California 94545.

Copyright © 1992 by the Institute of Mathematical Statistics
Printed in the United States of America

IMS CORPORATE MEMBERS

THE AEROSPACE CORPORATION
Los Angeles, California

AT&T BELL LABORATORIES
Murray Hill, New Jersey

BELL COMMUNICATIONS RESEARCH
Morristown, New Jersey

GENERAL MOTORS CORPORATION
Research Laboratories
Warren, Michigan

INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS MACHINES CORP.
Thomas J. Watson Research Center
Yorktown Heights, New York

SPRINGER-VERLAG NEW YORK INCORPORATED
New York, New York

IMS INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS

ACADEMIA SINICA
Inst. of Statistical Science
Taipei, Taiwan

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Washington, D. C.

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY
Committee on Statistics
Dept. of Mathematics and Dept. of
Decision and Information Systems
Tempe, Arizona

AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY
Canberra, ACT, Australia

BOWLING GREEN STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Bowling Green, Ohio

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY AT FULLERTON
Dept. of Mathematics
Fullerton, California

CASE WESTERN RESERVE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Cleveland, Ohio

CORNELL UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics
Ithaca, New York

DALHOUSIE UNIVERSITY
Killam Memorial Library
Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada

FLORIDA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Tallahassee, Florida

GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Washington, D.C.

HARVARD UNIVERSITY
Cabot Science Library
Cambridge, Massachusetts

HARVARD UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Biostatistics
Boston, Massachusetts

HARVARD UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Cambridge, Massachusetts

INDIANA UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics
Bloomington, Indiana

INSTITUTO MEXICANO DEL PETROLEO
Mexico, DF, Mexico

IOWA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics and Statistical Laboratory
Ames, Iowa

JOHNS HOPKINS UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Biostatistics and Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
Baltimore, Maryland

KANSAS STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Manhattan, Kansas

MARA INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
Selangor, Malaysia

MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
Dept. of Mathematics
Cambridge, Massachusetts

MIAMI UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
Oxford, Ohio

MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics and Probability
East Lansing, Michigan

NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY
Fort George G. Meade, Maryland

NEW MEXICO STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
Las Cruces, New Mexico

NORTH CAROLINA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Raleigh, North Carolina

NORTH DAKOTA STATE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
Fargo, North Dakota

NORTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY
Div. of Statistics
DeKalb, Illinois

OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Columbus, Ohio

OREGON STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
Corvallis, Oregon

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Statistics
University Park, Pennsylvania

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
Princeton, New Jersey

PURDUE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
West Lafayette, Indiana

QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY
Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
Kingston, Ontario, Canada

RICE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
Houston, Texas

THE ROCKEFELLER UNIVERSITY LIBRARY
New York, New York

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada

SOUTHERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Edwardsville, Illinois

STANFORD UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Statistics
 Stanford, California

SYRACUSE UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Syracuse, New York

TEMPLE UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

TEXAS TECH UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Lubbock, Texas

UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA
 Dept. of Statistics and Applied Probability
 Edmonton, Alberta, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Tucson, Arizona

UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF CALGARY
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Calgary, Alberta, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Berkeley, California

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
 Main Library
 Irvine, California

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
 Div. of Statistics
 Davis, California

UNIVERSITY OF CONNECTICUT
 Dept. of Statistics
 Storrs, Connecticut

UNIVERSITY OF FLORIDA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Gainesville, Florida

UNIVERSITY OF GEORGIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Athens, Georgia

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS
 Dept. of Statistics
 Champaign, Illinois

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS AT CHICAGO
 Dept. of Mathematics, Statistics and Computer Science
 Chicago, Illinois

UNIVERSITY OF IOWA
 Dept. of Statistics and Actuarial Science
 Iowa City, Iowa

UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND
 Dept. of Mathematics
 College Park, Maryland

UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Amherst, Massachusetts

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
 Dept. of Statistics
 Ann Arbor, Michigan

UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA
 School of Statistics
 Minneapolis, Minnesota

UNIVERSITY OF MISSOURI
 Ellis Library
 Columbia, Missouri

UNIVERSITY OF MONTREAL
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Montreal, Quebec, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Lincoln, Nebraska

UNIVERSITY OF NEW BRUNSWICK LIBRARY
 Fredericton, New Brunswick, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO
 Dept. of Mathematics and Statistics
 Albuquerque, New Mexico

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Chapel Hill, North Carolina

UNIVERSITY OF OREGON
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Eugene, Oregon

UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA
 Dept. of Statistics
 Columbia, South Carolina

UNIVERSITY OF STOCKHOLM
 Institute of Actuarial Mathematics
 and Mathematical Statistics
 Stockholm, Sweden

UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Austin, Texas

UNIVERSITY OF VICTORIA
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Victoria, British Columbia, Canada

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Charlottesville, Virginia

UNIVERSITY OF WATERLOO
 Dept. of Statistics and Actuarial Sciences
 Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

VIRGINIA COMMONWEALTH UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematical Sciences
 Richmond, Virginia

VIRGINIA POLYTECHNIC INSTITUTE
 AND STATE UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Statistics
 Blacksburg, Virginia

WAKE FOREST UNIVERSITY
 Z. Smith Reynolds Library
 Winston-Salem, North Carolina

WAYNE STATE UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Detroit, Michigan

YORK UNIVERSITY
 Dept. of Mathematics
 Downsview, Ontario, Canada