

Asymptotic approximations for the distributions of multinomial goodness-of-fit statistics

Minoru SIOTANI and Yasunori FUJIKOSHI

(Received April 21, 1983)

§ 1. Introduction

Let $Y=(Y_1, \dots, Y_k)'$ be a random vector with the multinomial distribution $M_k(n, \boldsymbol{\pi})$, i.e.,

$$\Pr(Y_1 = n_1, \dots, Y_k = n_k) = \begin{cases} n! \prod_{j=1}^k (\pi_j^{n_j}/n_j!), & n_j = 0, 1, \dots, n \ (j=1, \dots, k) \\ & \text{and } \sum_{j=1}^k n_j = n, \\ 0 & , \text{ otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

where $\boldsymbol{\pi}=(\pi_1, \dots, \pi_k)'$, $\pi_j > 0$, $\sum_{j=1}^k \pi_j = 1$. For testing the simple hypothesis $H: \boldsymbol{\pi} = \boldsymbol{p}$ (\boldsymbol{p} a fixed vector) against $K: \boldsymbol{\pi} \neq \boldsymbol{p}$, the following three statistics are commonly used:

- (1) Pearson's chi-square statistic

$$T_1 = \sum_{j=1}^k (Y_j - np_j)^2 / (np_j),$$

- (2) Log-likelihood ratio statistic

$$T_2 = 2 \sum_{j=1}^k Y_j \log \{Y_j / (np_j)\},$$

- (3) Freeman-Tukey statistic

$$T_3 = 4 \sum_{j=1}^k (\sqrt{Y_j} - \sqrt{np_j})^2,$$

where $\boldsymbol{p}=(p_1, \dots, p_k)'$, $p_j > 0$ ($j=1, \dots, k$) and $\sum_{j=1}^k p_j = 1$.

It is well known (e.g., see Bishop, Fienberg and Holland [2, p. 313]) that under the null hypothesis these three statistics have the same chisquare distribution with $k-1$ degrees of freedom in the limit. We use the chi-square approximation when expected numbers np_j are not small. But this brings about the question of how small the numbers np_j can be without invalidating the chi-square approximation. There are many papers attempting to answer this question, in particular, for the case of T_1 , but there is wide difference of the proposed numbers for np_j . Another question arises in some practical applications when these statistics show significantly different values for a finite sample, in particular, between T_1 and T_2 or T_3 .

Yarnold [6] obtained an asymptotic expansion for the null distribution of T_1

and studied the accuracy of the chi-square and other approximations to it. In this paper we give asymptotic expansions for the null distributions of T_2 and T_3 similar to that of T_1 . Based on the asymptotic expansions, we shall propose new approximations for T_2 and T_3 .

§2. A preliminary lemma

In this paper we assume $\boldsymbol{\pi} = \boldsymbol{p}$, since we treat the null distributions of T_i . Define

$$X_j = (Y_j - np_j) / \sqrt{n}, \quad j = 1, \dots, k,$$

and let $\boldsymbol{X} = (X_1, \dots, X_r)'$, where $r = k - 1$. Then the random variable \boldsymbol{X} is a lattice random vector which takes values in

$$L = \{\boldsymbol{x} = (x_1, \dots, x_r)'; \boldsymbol{x} = (1/\sqrt{n})(\boldsymbol{m} - n\boldsymbol{q}) \text{ and } \boldsymbol{m} \in M\}$$

where $\boldsymbol{q} = (p_1, \dots, p_r)'$ and M is a set of integer vectors $\boldsymbol{m} = (m_1, \dots, m_r)'$ such that $n_j \geq 0$ and $\sum_{j=1}^r n_j \leq n$. We can express \boldsymbol{X} as

$$\boldsymbol{X} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \sum_{\alpha=1}^n (\boldsymbol{Z}_\alpha - E(\boldsymbol{Z}_\alpha))$$

where $\boldsymbol{Z}_1, \dots, \boldsymbol{Z}_n$ are independently identically distributed lattice random vectors having the distribution of a random vector obtained by deleting the k th component of the random vector with the multinomial distribution $M_k(1, \boldsymbol{p})$.

LEMMA 2.1. Let $\boldsymbol{x} = (1/\sqrt{n})(\boldsymbol{m} - n\boldsymbol{q})$. Then for any $\boldsymbol{m} \in M$,

$$(2.1) \quad \Pr(\boldsymbol{X} = \boldsymbol{x}) = n^{-r/2} \phi(\boldsymbol{x}) \left\{ 1 + \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} h_1(\boldsymbol{x}) + \frac{1}{n} h_2(\boldsymbol{x}) + O(n^{-3/2}) \right\}$$

where $\phi(\boldsymbol{x}) = (2\pi)^{-r/2} |\Omega|^{-1/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \boldsymbol{x}' \Omega^{-1} \boldsymbol{x}\right)$, $\Omega = \text{diag}(p_1, \dots, p_r) - \boldsymbol{q}\boldsymbol{q}'$,

$$h_1(\boldsymbol{x}) = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{x_j}{p_j} + \frac{1}{6} \sum_{j=1}^k x_j \left(\frac{x_j}{p_j}\right)^2,$$

$$h_2(\boldsymbol{x}) = \frac{1}{2} h_1(\boldsymbol{x})^2 + \frac{1}{12} \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j}\right) + \frac{1}{4} \sum_{j=1}^k \left(\frac{x_j}{p_j}\right)^2 - \frac{1}{12} \sum_{j=1}^k x_j \left(\frac{x_j}{p_j}\right)^3$$

and $x_k = -\sum_{j=1}^r x_j$.

PROOF. Let $Q(\boldsymbol{t})$ be the characteristic function of $\boldsymbol{Y}^* = (Y_1, \dots, Y_r)'$, which is given by

$$Q(\mathbf{t}) = \sum_{\mathbf{m} \in M} \exp(i\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{m}) \Pr(Y^* = \mathbf{m}) \\ = \{ \sum_{j=1}^r p_j \exp(it_j) + p_k \}^n$$

where $\mathbf{t}=(t_1, \dots, t_r)'$. Then, for any $\mathbf{x}=(1/\sqrt{n})(\mathbf{m} - n\mathbf{q}) \in L$, we have

$$\Pr(X=\mathbf{x}) = \Pr(Y^* = \mathbf{m}) \\ = (2\pi)^{-r} \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \dots \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} Q(\mathbf{t}) \exp(-i\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{m}) d\mathbf{t} \\ = (2\pi\sqrt{n})^{-r} \int_{-\sqrt{n}\pi}^{\sqrt{n}\pi} \dots \int_{-\sqrt{n}\pi}^{\sqrt{n}\pi} \gamma(\mathbf{t}) \exp(-i\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{x}) d\mathbf{t}$$

where $\gamma(\mathbf{t})=Q(\mathbf{t}/\sqrt{n}) \exp(-i\sqrt{n}\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{q})$. For large n and fixed \mathbf{t} , $\gamma(\mathbf{t})$ can be expanded as

$$\gamma(\mathbf{t}) = \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \mathbf{t}'\Omega\mathbf{t}\right) \{1 + \sum_{j=1}^2 n^{-j/2} b_j(\mathbf{t}) + O(n^{-3/2})\}$$

where

$$b_1(\mathbf{t}) = \frac{i^3}{6} \{ \sum_{j=1}^r p_j t_j^3 - 3(\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{q}) \mathbf{t}'\Omega\mathbf{t} - (\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{q})^3 \}, \\ b_2(\mathbf{t}) = \frac{1}{2} b_1(\mathbf{t})^2 + \frac{i^4}{24} \{ \sum_{j=1}^r p_j t_j^4 - 4(\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{q}) \sum_{j=1}^r p_j t_j^3 \\ - 3(\mathbf{t}'\Omega\mathbf{t})^2 + 6(\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{q})^2 \mathbf{t}'\Omega\mathbf{t} + 3(\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{q})^4 \}.$$

Form a discussion on the asymptotic expansions of the density functions of sums of independent identically distributed random vectors (e.g., see Bhattacharya and Ranga Rao [1, p. 231]) it follows that

$$\Pr(X=\mathbf{x}) = (2\pi\sqrt{n})^{-r} \left[\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \dots \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \exp(i\mathbf{t}'\mathbf{x}) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \mathbf{t}'\Omega\mathbf{t}\right) \right. \\ \left. \times \{1 + \sum_{j=1}^2 n^{-j/2} b_j(\mathbf{t})\} d\mathbf{t} + O(n^{-3/2}) \right].$$

Now then the formula (2.1) is obtained by substituting the above expressions of $b_1(\mathbf{t})$ and $b_2(\mathbf{t})$ and carrying out the integration with the aid of formulae of the inverse Fourier transforms for the normal density and its derivatives.

Let $D=\text{diag}(p_1, \dots, p_k)$, $\sqrt{\mathbf{p}}=(\sqrt{p_1}, \dots, \sqrt{p_k})'$, and $A=(\mathbf{a}_1, \dots, \mathbf{a}_k)'$ be a $k \times r$ matrix such that $(A, \sqrt{\mathbf{p}})$ is an orthogonal matrix. Define

$$(2.2) \quad \mathbf{z} = (z_1, \dots, z_k)' = H\mathbf{x} \\ = A'D^{-1/2} \begin{bmatrix} I_r \\ -1, \dots, -1 \end{bmatrix} \mathbf{x}.$$

Then, noting that $H\Omega H' = I$, and $\sqrt{p_j}(\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z}) = x_j$, we can express (2.1) as

$$(2.3) \quad \Pr(\mathbf{X} = \mathbf{x}) = n^{-r/2} |\Omega|^{-1/2} \{f(\mathbf{z}) + O(n^{-3/2})\}$$

where

$$(2.4) \quad f(\mathbf{z}) = (2\pi)^{-r/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} \mathbf{z}' \mathbf{z}\right) \left\{1 + \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} g_1(\mathbf{z}) + \frac{1}{n} g_2(\mathbf{z})\right\}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} g_1(\mathbf{z}) &= -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z}) + \frac{1}{6} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z})^3, \\ g_2(\mathbf{z}) &= \frac{1}{2} g_1(\mathbf{z})^2 + \frac{1}{12} \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j}\right) \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{4} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z})^2 - \frac{1}{12} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z})^4. \end{aligned}$$

§3. Asymptotic expansions for $\Pr(\mathbf{X} \in B)$

In order to get an asymptotic expansion for $\Pr(\mathbf{X} \in B)$, it is necessary to sum the local expansion (2.1) over all the points in $B \cap L$. It is known (Esséen [3], Ranga Rao [5]) that such a lattice sum can be expressed as a Stieltjes integral when B is a Borel set. Yarnold [6] gave a reduction for the Stieltjes integral when B is an "extended convex set". It is convenient to summarize here Yarnold's result, since we will use it in the subsequent sections. A set B is called an extended convex set if B has the following representation for every $l \in \{1, \dots, r\}$:

$$\begin{aligned} B &= \{\mathbf{x} = (x_1, \dots, x_r) : \lambda_l(\mathbf{x}^*) < x_l < \theta_l(\mathbf{x}^*) \text{ and} \\ &\quad \mathbf{x}^* = (x_1, \dots, x_{l-1}, x_{l+1}, \dots, x_r) \in B_l\} \end{aligned}$$

where $B_l \subset R^{r-1}$ and λ_l, θ_l are continuous functions on R^{r-1} . If B is an extended convex set, then

$$(3.1) \quad \Pr(\mathbf{X} \in B) = J_1 + J_2 + J_3 + O(n^{-3/2})$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} J_1 &= \int \cdots \int_B \phi(\mathbf{x}) \left\{1 + \frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} h_1(\mathbf{x}) + \frac{1}{n} h_2(\mathbf{x})\right\} d\mathbf{x}, \\ J_2 &= -\frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} \sum_{l=1}^r n^{-(r-l)/2} \sum_{x_{l+1} \in L_{l+1}} \cdots \sum_{x_r \in L_r} \\ &\quad \cdot [S_1(\sqrt{n} x_l + n p_l) \phi(\mathbf{x})]_{\lambda_l(\mathbf{x}^*)}^{\theta_l(\mathbf{x}^*)} dx_1 \cdots dx_{l-1}, \\ J_3 &= \frac{1}{n} \sum_{l=1}^r n^{-(r-l)/2} \sum_{x_{l+1} \in L_{l+1}} \cdots \sum_{x_r \in L_r} \int \cdots \int_{B_l} \end{aligned}$$

$$\cdot \left[-S_1(\sqrt{n}x_l + np_l)h_1(\mathbf{x})\phi(\mathbf{x}) + S_2(\sqrt{n}x_l + np_l)\frac{\partial}{\partial x_l}\phi(\mathbf{x}) \right]_{\lambda_l(\mathbf{x}^*)}^{\theta_l(\mathbf{x}^*)} dx_1 \cdots dx_{l-1},$$

$$L_j = \{x_j : x_j = (1/\sqrt{n})(n_j - np_j) \text{ and } n_j \text{ is integer}\},$$

$$S_1(x) = x - [x] - \frac{1}{2},$$

$S_2(x)$ is the real-valued periodic function of period one such that $S_2(x) = \frac{1}{2}\left(x^2 - x + \frac{1}{6}\right)$ on $0 \leq x < 1$,

$$[h(\mathbf{x})]_{\lambda_l(\mathbf{x}^*)}^{\theta_l(\mathbf{x}^*)} = h(x_1, \dots, x_{l-1}, \theta_l(\mathbf{x}^*), x_{l+1}, \dots, x_r) - h(x_1, \dots, x_{l-1}, \lambda_l(\mathbf{x}^*), x_{l+1}, \dots, x_r).$$

The J_1 term can be regarded as the Edgeworth expansion for a continuous distribution, while the J_2 term is a term to account for the discontinuity in \mathbf{X} . It is known that $J_2 = O(n^{-1/2})$ and $J_3 = O(n^{-1})$. Since Pearson's chi-square statistic T_1 is expressed as $T_1 = \mathbf{X}'\Omega^{-1}\mathbf{X}$, it holds that

$$\Pr(T_1 < c) = \Pr(\mathbf{X} \in B_1)$$

where $B_1 = \{\mathbf{x} = (x_1, \dots, x_r) : \mathbf{x}'\Omega^{-1}\mathbf{x} < c\}$. Hoel [4] evaluated the J_1 term for the case of $B = B_1$. Yarnold [6] evaluated the J_2 term for the case of $B = B_1$ and showed that $J_1 + J_2$ provides very accurate approximation to $\Pr(T_1 < c)$.

§4. Log-likelihood ratio statistic

We can express the null distribution of T_2 as

$$(4.1) \quad \Pr(T_2 < c) = \Pr(\mathbf{X} \in B_2)$$

where $B_2 = \{\mathbf{x} = (x_1, \dots, x_r) : T_2(\mathbf{x}) < c\}$ and

$$(4.2) \quad T_2(\mathbf{x}) = 2 \sum_{j=1}^k (np_j + \sqrt{nx_j}) \log \{1 + x_j / (\sqrt{np_j})\}.$$

Observing that the set B_2 is an extended convex set, we can write (4.1) as the formula (3.1) with $B = B_2$. In the following we shall evaluate the J_1 and J_2 terms.

Making the transformation (2.2), we can write J_1 as

$$(4.3) \quad J_1 = \int \cdots \int_{B_2} f(\mathbf{z}) d\mathbf{z}$$

where $f(\mathbf{z})$ is given by (2.4) and $\tilde{B}_2 = \{\mathbf{z} = (z_1, \dots, z_r) : T_2(H^{-1}\mathbf{z}) < c\}$. We may regard J_1 as the distribution function of $T_2(H^{-1}\mathbf{Z})$ when \mathbf{Z} has a continuous

density function $f(\mathbf{z})$. Then the characteristic of $T_2(H^{-1}\mathbf{Z})$ is defined by

$$(4.4) \quad C(t) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \exp \{itT_2(H^{-1}\mathbf{z})\} f(\mathbf{z}) d\mathbf{z}.$$

We can expand $T_2(H^{-1}\mathbf{z})$ as

$$(4.5) \quad T_2(H^{-1}\mathbf{z}) = \mathbf{z}'\mathbf{z} - \frac{1}{3\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j\mathbf{z})^3 \\ + \frac{1}{6n} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j\mathbf{z})^4 + O(n^{-3/2})$$

in the set Θ_n of \mathbf{z} for which $|\mathbf{a}'_j\mathbf{z}/\sqrt{np_j}| < 1$, $j=1, \dots, r$. Substituting (4.5) into (4.4), we obtain

$$(4.6) \quad C(t) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \cdots \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \exp(it\mathbf{z}'\mathbf{z}) \left[1 - \frac{it}{3\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j\mathbf{z})^3 \right. \\ \left. + \frac{it}{6n} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j\mathbf{z})^4 + \frac{(it)^2}{18n} \left\{ \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j\mathbf{z})^3 \right\}^2 \right] f(\mathbf{z}) d\mathbf{z} + O(n^{-3/2}).$$

The validity of this reduction is obtained by controlling the errors of approximations. For example, if we define the set A_n of \mathbf{z} by $|z_j| < 2\sqrt{2 \log n}$, $j=1, \dots, r$, then it can be checked that for sufficiently large n ,

- (i) $A_n \subset \Theta_n$,
- (ii) $\int_{A_n^c} |f(\mathbf{z})| d\mathbf{z} = o(n^{-2})$.

The formula (4.6) follows by dividing the region of the integral in (4.4) into A_n and A_n^c and using the properties (i) and (ii). Carrying out the integral (4.6) with the aid of the moment formulae for a multivariate normal variate, we obtain

$$(4.7) \quad C(t) = (1-2it)^{-r/2} \left[1 + \frac{1}{12n} \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} \right) \{1 - (1-2it)^{-1}\} \right] \\ + O(n^{-3/2}).$$

Inverting (4.7) we obtain

$$(4.8) \quad J_1 = \Pr(\chi_r^2 < c) + \frac{1}{12n} \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} \right) \\ \times \{ \Pr(\chi_r^2 < c) - \Pr(\chi_{r+2}^2 < c) \} + O(n^{-3/2}).$$

Next we consider the J_2 term in (3.1) with $B=B_2$. Approximating $[S_1(\sqrt{nx_i+np_i})\phi(\mathbf{x})]_{\lambda_i}^{\theta_i}(\frac{\mathbf{z}^*}{\sigma^*})$ by its asymptotic approximation

$$(2\pi)^{-r/2} |\Omega|^{-1/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}c\right) [S_1(\sqrt{nx_i+np_i})]_{\lambda_i}^{\theta_i}(\frac{\mathbf{z}^*}{\sigma^*}),$$

and using the same argument as in Yarnold [6], we obtain an asymptotic approximation to J_2 ,

$$(4.9) \quad \hat{J}_2 = (N_2 - n^{r/2}V_2) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}c\right) / \{(2\pi n)^r \prod_{j=1}^k p_j\}^{1/2}$$

where N_2 is the number of lattice points in B_2 , i.e.,

$$(4.1) \quad N_2 = \#\{\mathbf{x}; \mathbf{x} \in L \text{ and } T_2(\mathbf{x}) < c\}$$

and V_2 is the volume of B_2 . We shall give an expansion for

$$(4.11) \quad \begin{aligned} V_2 &= \int \cdots \int_{B_2} d\mathbf{x} \\ &= |\Omega|^{1/2} \int \cdots \int_{B_2} d\mathbf{z} \end{aligned}$$

where $\mathbf{z} = H\mathbf{x}$ is defined by (2.2) and $\tilde{B}_2 = \{\mathbf{z} : \mathbf{z} = H\mathbf{x} \text{ and } \mathbf{x} \in B_2\}$. Consider the transformation $\mathbf{z} \rightarrow \mathbf{u}$ such that $T_2(H^{-1}\mathbf{z}) = \mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u}$. Using (4.5) we can express \mathbf{z} in terms of \mathbf{u} as

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{z} &= \mathbf{u} + \frac{1}{6\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u})^2 \mathbf{a}_j \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{72n} \left\{ 5(\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u})\mathbf{u} + \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u})^3 \mathbf{a}_j \right\} + O(n^{-3/2}) \end{aligned}$$

for sufficiently large n . It is seen that the Jacobian of the transformation is

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \frac{\partial \mathbf{z}}{\partial \mathbf{u}} \right| &= \left| I_r + \frac{1}{3\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{a}_j) (\mathbf{a}_j \mathbf{u}') \right. \\ &\quad \left. - \frac{1}{72n} \left\{ 10\mathbf{u}\mathbf{u}' + 5(\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u})I_r + 3 \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}_j \mathbf{u}')^2 \mathbf{a}_j \mathbf{a}'_j \right\} + O(n^{-3/2}) \right| \\ &= 1 + \frac{1}{3\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} \mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u} + \frac{1}{72n} \left\{ (1-5r)\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u} \right. \\ &\quad \left. - 7 \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u})^2 + 4 \left(\sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} \mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u} \right)^2 \right\} + O(n^{-3/2}). \end{aligned}$$

From (4.11) we obtain

$$(4.12) \quad \begin{aligned} V_2 &= |\Omega|^{1/2} \int \cdots \int_{\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u} < c} \left| \frac{\partial \mathbf{z}}{\partial \mathbf{u}} \right| d\mathbf{u} \\ &= V_1 \left[1 + \frac{c}{n} \{72(k+1)\}^{-1} \left\{ -9k^2 + 15k - 6 \right. \right. \\ &\quad \left. \left. - 3 \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} \right\} + O(n^{-3/2}) \right] \end{aligned}$$

where V_1 is the volume of B_1 , i.e.,

$$(4.13) \quad \begin{aligned} V_1 &= |\Omega|^{1/2} \int \cdots \int_{\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u} < c} d\mathbf{u} \\ &= \{(\pi c)^r \prod_{j=1}^k p_j\}^{1/2} / \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{2}r + 1\right). \end{aligned}$$

The J_3 term is very complicated. However, from the general result in Section 3 it follows that $J_3 = O(n^{-1})$. Neglecting the J_3 term, it is suggested to use

$$(4.14) \quad J_1 + \hat{J}_2$$

as an approximation to $\Pr(T_2 < c)$, where J_1 and \hat{J}_2 are defined by (4.8) and (4.9), respectively.

§5. Freeman-Tukey statistic

The null distribution of the Freeman-Tukey statistic T_3 can be expressed as

$$(5.1) \quad \Pr(T_3 < c) = \Pr(\mathbf{X} \in B_3)$$

where $B_3 = \{\mathbf{x} = (x_1, \dots, x_r)': T_3(\mathbf{x}) < c\}$ and

$$(5.2) \quad T_3(\mathbf{x}) = 4 \sum_{j=1}^k \{(np_j + \sqrt{nx_j})^{1/2} - \sqrt{np_j}\}^2.$$

It is easily seen that B_3 is an extended convex set. Therefore we can write (5.1) as the formula (3.1) with $B = B_3$. In the following we shall evaluate the J_1 and J_2 terms in (3.1) with $B = B_3$. When $|x_j/(\sqrt{np_j})| = |(\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z})/\sqrt{np_j}| < 1$ and $|1/(np_j)| < 1$, we can expand $T_3(\mathbf{x})$ as

$$(5.3) \quad \begin{aligned} T_3(\mathbf{x}) &= T_3(H^{-1}\mathbf{z}) \\ &= \mathbf{z}'\mathbf{z} - \frac{1}{2\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z})^3 \\ &\quad + \frac{5}{16n} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{z})^4 + O(n^{-3/2}). \end{aligned}$$

The J_1 term can be obtained by using the formula (5.3) and the same method as in the case of T_2 . The final result is given by

$$(5.4) \quad J_1 = \Pr(\chi_r^2 < c) + \frac{1}{n} \sum_{j=0}^3 g_j \Pr(\chi_{r+2j}^2 < c) + O(n^{-3/2})$$

where

$$g_0 = \frac{1}{12} \left(1 - \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j}\right), \quad g_1 = \frac{1}{32} (-k^2 + 4k - 3),$$

$$g_2 = \frac{1}{32} \left(2k^2 - 2k - 1 + \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} \right),$$

$$g_3 = \frac{1}{96} \left(-3k^2 - 6k + 4 + 5 \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} \right).$$

Applying an argument similar to that in the case of T_2 , we can obtain an asymptotic approximation for the J_2 term given by

$$(5.5) \quad \hat{J}_2 = (N_3 - n^{r/2} V_3) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2} c\right) / \{(2n)^r \prod_{j=1}^k p_j\}^{1/2}$$

where N_3 is the number of lattice points in B_3 , i.e.,

$$(5.6) \quad N_3 = \#\{\mathbf{x}: \mathbf{x} \in L \text{ and } T_3(\mathbf{x}) < c\}$$

and

$$(5.7) \quad V_3 = \int \dots \int_{B_3} d\mathbf{x}.$$

Similarly we can derive an asymptotic expansion for V_3 . For this, we consider the transformation $\mathbf{z} \rightarrow \mathbf{u}$ such that $T_3(H^{-1}\mathbf{z}) = \mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u}$. From (5.3) we can write the transformation as

$$\mathbf{z} = \mathbf{u} + \frac{1}{4\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u})^2 \mathbf{a}_j - \frac{5}{32n} (\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u})\mathbf{u} + O(n^{-3/2}).$$

Therefore we have

$$(5.8) \quad V_3 = |\Omega|^{1/2} \int \dots \int_{\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u} < c} \left| \frac{\partial \mathbf{z}}{\partial \mathbf{u}} \right| d\mathbf{u}$$

$$= |\Omega|^{1/2} \int \dots \int_{\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u} < c} \left[1 + \frac{1}{2\sqrt{n}} \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} \mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u} \right.$$

$$+ \frac{1}{32n} \left\{ - (2+5r)\mathbf{u}'\mathbf{u} + 4 \left(\sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{\sqrt{p_j}} \mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u} \right)^2 \right.$$

$$\left. \left. - 4 \sum_{j=1}^k \frac{1}{p_j} (\mathbf{a}'_j \mathbf{u})^2 \right\} + O(n^{-3/2}) \right] d\mathbf{u}$$

$$= V_1 \left\{ 1 - \frac{3c}{32n} (k-1)(3k-1)(k+1)^{-1} + O(n^{-3/2}) \right\}$$

where V_1 is given by (4.13).

The formulas (5.4) and (5.5) will be useful in getting closer approximations to $\Pr(T_3 < c)$.

References

- [1] R. N. Bhattacharya and R. Ranga Rao, Normal Approximation and Asymptotic Expansions, Wiley, New York (1975).
- [2] Y. M. M. Bishop, S. E. Fienberg and P. W. Holland, Discrete Multivariate Analysis: Theory and Practice, The MIT Press, Cambridge (1975).
- [3] C. G. Esseen, Fourier analysis of distribution functions: A mathematical study of the Laplace-Gaussian law, Acta Math., 77 (1945), 1–125.
- [4] P. G. Hoel, On the chi-square distribution for small samples, Ann. Math. Statist., 9 (1938), 158–165.
- [5] R. Ranga Rao, On the central limit theorem in R_k , Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., 67 (1961), 359–361.
- [6] J. K. Yarnold, Asymptotic approximations for the probability that a sum of lattice random vectors lies in a convex set, Ann. Math. Statist., 43 (1972), 1566–1580.

*Department of Information and Behavioral Sciences,
Faculty of Integrated Arts and Sciences,
Hiroshima University*

and

*Department of Mathematics,
Faculty of Science,
Hiroshima University*