

# THE SUM OF TWO CRUMPLED CUBES

Joseph Martin

A *crumpled cube* is a space that is homeomorphic to the closure of the interior of a 2-sphere in  $E^3$ . There exist many examples of crumpled cubes that are not 3-cells, the best known probably being the examples described by Alexander [1] and by Fox and Artin [7].

Suppose that  $C$  and  $D$  are crumpled cubes and  $h$  is a homeomorphism of  $Bd C$  onto  $Bd D$ . Let  $C \cup_h D$  denote the space obtained by identification of  $C$  and  $D$  along their boundaries by the homeomorphism  $h$ .

Hosay [10] and Lininger [11] have independently shown that if  $C$  is a 3-cell, then  $C \cup_h D$  is  $S^3$ . Bing has shown [4] that if each of  $C$  and  $D$  is the example of Alexander and  $h$  is the identity, then  $C \cup_h D$  is  $S^3$ . It is known that if each of  $C$  and  $D$  is the example of Fox and Artin and  $h$  is the identity, then  $C \cup_h D$  is not  $S^3$ .

The goal of this paper is to study certain conditions that are necessary in order that  $C \cup_h D$  be  $S^3$ .

Suppose that  $K$  is a crumpled cube and  $p$  is a point of  $Bd K$ . The statement that  $p$  is a *piercing point* of  $K$  means that there exists an embedding  $f: K \rightarrow S^3$  such that  $f(Bd K)$  can be pierced by a tame arc at  $f(p)$ . If  $K$  is a 3-cell or the example of Alexander, then each point of  $Bd K$  is a piercing point of  $K$ . If  $K$  is the example of Fox and Artin, then  $K$  has exactly one nonpiercing point. Stallings [15] has given an example of a crumpled cube with uncountably many nonpiercing points.

The main result of this paper is the following theorem.

**THEOREM.** *Suppose that each of  $C$  and  $D$  is a crumpled cube,  $h$  is a homeomorphism of  $Bd C$  onto  $Bd D$ , and  $C \cup_h D$  is  $S^3$ . Then, if  $p$  is a nonpiercing point of  $C$ ,  $h(p)$  is a piercing point of  $D$ .*

We shall establish the theorem by using the theorem of Lininger and Hosay to view  $C \cup_h D$  as a decomposition of  $S^3$  into points and arcs. Lemma 6 will show that each arc in this decomposition is cellular, Lemma 4 will show that each of the arcs is locally tame except perhaps at one of its endpoints, and an application of Lemma 3 will establish the theorem.

**LEMMA 1.** *Suppose that  $K$  is a crumpled cube and  $p$  is a piercing point of  $K$ . Then, if  $f: K \rightarrow S^3$  is an embedding such that  $Cl(S^3 - f(K))$  is a 3-cell,  $f(Bd K)$  can be pierced by a tame arc at  $f(p)$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $f: K \rightarrow S^3$  be an embedding such that  $Cl(S^3 - f(K))$  is a 3-cell, and let  $g: K \rightarrow S^3$  be an embedding such that  $g(Bd K)$  can be pierced by a tame arc at  $g(p)$ . It follows from a theorem of Gillman [8] that some tame arc  $\alpha$  on  $g(Bd K)$  contains  $g(p)$ .

The proof of Theorem 2 of [11] shows that there exists a homeomorphism  $h: g(K) \rightarrow S^3$  such that (i)  $Cl(S^3 - hg(K))$  is a 3-cell and (ii) the restriction of  $h$  to  $\alpha$  is the identity. Now, since each of  $Cl(S^3 - f(K))$  and  $Cl(S^3 - hg(K))$  is a 3-cell, the homeomorphism  $hgf^{-1}$  can be extended to a homeomorphism of  $S^3$  onto itself

---

Received September 30, 1965.

This research was partially supported by NSF Grant 1445737.

that takes  $f(K)$  onto  $hg(K)$ . Then  $fg^{-1}(\alpha)$  is a tame arc on  $f(\text{Bd } K)$  that contains  $f(p)$ , and it follows from [8] that  $f(\text{Bd } K)$  can be pierced by a tame arc at  $f(p)$ . This establishes Lemma 1.

Let  $B$  denote the unit 3-cell in  $E^3$ . If  $x \in \text{Bd } B$ , let  $\alpha_x$  denote the straight-line interval from the origin to  $x$ .

**LEMMA 2.** *Let  $h: B \rightarrow E^3$  be an embedding. Then  $h(\text{Bd } B)$  can be pierced by a tame arc at  $h(p)$  if and only if  $h(\alpha_p)$  is tame.*

*Proof.* Let  $p$  be a point of  $\text{Bd } B$ . Suppose first that  $h(\alpha_p)$  is tame. Let  $\beta$  be an arc on  $h(\text{Bd } B)$  that has  $h(p)$  as an endpoint and is locally tame except perhaps at  $h(p)$ . Let  $C$  denote the cone from the origin over  $h^{-1}(\beta)$ , and let  $D$  denote  $h(C)$ . Then  $D$  is a 2-cell and is locally tame except perhaps at  $h(p)$ . Now the arc  $h(\alpha_p)$  is tame, contains  $h(p)$ , and lies on  $D$ . It follows from a theorem of Doyle and Hocking [6] that  $D$  is tame. Hence  $\beta$  is tame, and it follows from [8] that  $h(\text{Bd } B)$  can be pierced by a tame arc at  $h(p)$ .

Now suppose that  $h(\text{Bd } B)$  can be pierced by a tame arc at  $h(p)$ . By [8], some tame arc  $\beta$  on  $h(\text{Bd } B)$  contains  $h(p)$ . Let  $C$  be the cone from the origin over  $h^{-1}(\beta)$ , and let  $D$  be  $h(C)$ . Then  $D$  is locally tame except perhaps at  $h(p)$ , and  $h(p)$  lies on the tame arc  $\beta$ . As before,  $D$  is tame, and it follows that  $h(\alpha_p)$  is tame. This establishes Lemma 2.

Lemmas 1 and 2 combine to yield Lemma 3.

**LEMMA 3.** *Let  $h: B \rightarrow S^3$  be an embedding. Then  $h(p)$  is a piercing point of  $C1(S^3 - h(B))$  if and only if  $h(\alpha_p)$  is tame.*

Suppose that  $X$  is a subset of  $S^3$ . The statement that  $X$  is *cellular* means that there exists a sequence  $C_1, C_2, \dots$  of 3-cells such that (i)  $C_{i+1} \subset \text{Int } C_i$  and (ii)  $X = \bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} C_i$ .

If  $G$  is an upper-semicontinuous decomposition of  $S^3$ , we denote by  $S^3/G$  the resulting decomposition space, and by  $P$  the natural projection map of  $S^3$  onto  $S^3/G$ . If  $X$  is a cellular arc of a cellular 3-cell in  $S^3$ , we denote by  $S^3/X$  the decomposition space obtained from the decomposition whose only nondegenerate element is  $X$ .

The following lemma is the result of joint work by David Gillman and the author. The author thanks the referee for simplifying the original proof.

**LEMMA 4.** *Suppose that  $\alpha$  is a cellular arc in  $S^3$ . Then  $\alpha$  cannot fail to be locally tame at exactly its two endpoints.*

*Proof.* Suppose that  $\alpha$  is a cellular arc in  $S^3$  with endpoints  $a$  and  $b$ . Suppose further that  $\alpha$  is locally tame at each point of  $\alpha - \{a, b\}$  and that  $\alpha$  fails to be locally tame at each of  $a$  and  $b$ .

Let  $q$  be a point of  $\alpha - \{a, b\}$ , and suppose that  $D$  is a tame disk that intersects  $\alpha$  in exactly the point  $q$ , and that this disk is pierced by  $\alpha$  at  $q$ . Now  $S^3/\alpha$  is  $S^3$ , and it follows from [5] that there exist a subdisk  $D'$  of  $P(D)$  and a tame 2-sphere  $S'$  such that  $P(q) \in \text{Int } D'$  and  $D' \subset S'$ . Let  $S$  denote the 2-sphere  $P^{-1}(S')$ . Then  $S$  is tame, intersects  $\alpha$  in exactly the point  $q$ , and is pierced by  $\alpha$  at  $q$ .

Now there is a 3-cell  $C$  such that  $\alpha$  lies on the boundary of  $C$ ,  $S \cap C$  is a spanning disk of  $\text{Bd } C$ , and  $C$  is locally tame except at the points  $a$  and  $b$ . Let  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  denote the closures of the components of  $C - S$  containing  $a$  and  $b$ , respectively. Since  $S$  is tame, there exist 3-cells  $K_1$  and  $K_2$  such that (i)  $K_1 \cap K_2 = S$ , and (ii)  $C_1 \subset K_1$  and  $C_2 \subset K_2$ .

Because each of  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  is wild, neither  $Cl(K_1 - C_1)$  nor  $Cl(K_2 - C_2)$  is a 3-cell. Since  $\alpha$  is cellular,  $C$  is cellular, and hence  $S^3/C$  is  $S^3$ . The 2-sphere  $P(S)$  is locally tame except at one point, and it follows from [9] that the closure of one of the complementary domains of  $P(S)$  is a 3-cell. Then one of  $K_1 - C_1$  and  $K_2 - C_2$  is topologically  $E^2 \times [0, 1)$ , and it follows that one of  $Cl(K_1 - C_1)$  and  $Cl(K_2 - C_2)$  is a 3-cell. This contradiction establishes Lemma 4.

LEMMA 5. *Suppose that  $G$  is an upper-semicontinuous decomposition of  $S^3$ , each nondegenerate element of  $G$  is a compact absolute retract, and  $U$  is a simply connected open set in  $S^3/G$ . Then  $P^{-1}(U)$  is simply connected.*

Lemma 5 is a consequence of Smale's Vietoris mapping theorem for homotopy [14]. Nevertheless, we include a proof, for completeness.

*Proof.* Let  $g \in G$ . Then, since  $g$  is a compact absolute retract, there exists a sequence  $V_1, V_2, \dots$  of open sets such that  $\bigcap_{i=1}^{\infty} V_i = g$  and such that, for each  $i$ ,  $V_{i+1} \subset V_i$  and  $V_{i+1}$  is homotopic to 0 in  $V_i$ . Furthermore, since  $G$  is upper-semicontinuous, we may assume that for each  $i$ ,  $V_i$  is the union of elements of  $G$ .

Now suppose that  $U$  is a simply connected open set in  $S^3/G$ . For each element  $g$  of  $G$  such that  $g \subset P^{-1}(U)$ , let  $W_g$  and  $Y_g$  be open sets such that  $g \subset W_g$ ,  $W_g \subset Y_g$ ,  $W_g$  is homotopic to 0 in  $Y_g$ ,  $Y_g \subset P^{-1}(U)$ , and each of  $W_g$  and  $Y_g$  is the union of elements of  $G$ .

Let  $\sigma$  be a 2-simplex, and let  $f$  be a map of  $Bd \sigma$  into  $P^{-1}(U)$ . Let  $g$  be the map of  $Bd \sigma$  into  $U$  defined by  $g = Pf$ . Now, since  $U$  is simply connected, some extension  $g^*$  of  $g$  maps  $\sigma$  into  $U$ . Let  $C$  be a finite subcollection of

$$\{W_g: g \subset P^{-1}(U)\}$$

such that  $C$  covers  $P^{-1}(g^*(\sigma))$ . The existence of  $C$  follows from the fact that for each  $g$ ,  $P(W_g)$  is an open set.

Now let  $T$  be a triangulation of  $\sigma$  whose mesh is so small that if  $\tau$  is a 2-simplex of  $T$ , then there exists an element  $W$  of  $C$  such that  $P^{-1}(g^*(\tau)) \subset W$ . For each 2-simplex  $\tau$  of  $T$ , let  $W_\tau$  be an element of  $C$  such that  $P^{-1}(g^*(\tau)) \subset W_\tau$ .

We are now ready to extend the map  $f$ . This will be done by first extending  $f$  to the 0-skeleton of  $T$ , then to the 1-skeleton, and finally to the 2-skeleton.

Suppose that  $v$  is a vertex of  $T$ , not in  $Bd \sigma$ . Then let  $P_v$  be a point of  $P^{-1}(g^*(v))$ , and set  $f^*(v) = P_v$ .

Suppose that  $\langle v_1 v_2 \rangle$  is a 1-simplex in  $T$  that does not lie in  $Bd \sigma$ . Now  $P^{-1}(g^*(\langle v_1 v_2 \rangle))$  is a compact connected set, and it follows that if  $\tau$  and  $\tau'$  are 2-simplexes in  $T$  and each has  $\langle v_1 v_2 \rangle$  as a face, then  $P_{v_1}$  and  $P_{v_2}$  belong to the same component of  $W_\tau \cap W_{\tau'}$ . Let  $\alpha$  be an arc in  $W_\tau \cap W_{\tau'}$  from  $P_{v_1}$  to  $P_{v_2}$ , and let  $h$  be a homeomorphism of  $\langle v_1 v_2 \rangle$  onto  $\alpha$  such that  $h(v_1) = P_{v_1}$ . Then if  $x \in \langle v_1 v_2 \rangle$ , let  $f^*(x)$  be  $h(x)$ .

Now suppose that  $\tau$  is a 2-simplex in  $T$ . Then  $f^*$  is defined on  $Bd \tau$ , and  $f^*(Bd \tau) \subset W_\tau$ . Since  $W_\tau$  is homotopic to 0 in  $Y_\tau$ ,  $f^*$  may be extended to  $\tau$ . This establishes Lemma 5.

LEMMA 6. *Suppose that  $G$  is an upper-semicontinuous decomposition of  $S^3$  such that each element of  $G$  is a compact absolute retract, and such that  $S^3/G$  is a 3-manifold. Then each element of  $G$  is cellular.*

*Proof.* Let  $g$  be an element of  $G$ , and let  $V$  be an open set containing  $g$ . Let  $V'$  be an open set such that  $V' \subset V$ ,  $g \in V'$ , and  $V'$  is the union of elements of  $G$ . Then  $P(V')$  is open, and  $P(g) \in P(V')$ . Let  $B$  be an open 3-cell such that  $P(g) \in B$  and  $B \subset P(V')$ . Then  $B - \{p(g)\}$  is simply connected; it follows from Lemma 5 that  $P^{-1}(B) - g$  is simply connected, and from McMillan's cellularity criterion [13] that  $g$  is cellular.

*Proof of the Theorem.* Suppose that each of  $C$  and  $D$  is a crumpled cube,  $h$  is a homeomorphism of  $\text{Bd } C$  onto  $\text{Bd } D$ , and  $C \cup_h D$  is  $S^3$ . It follows from [11] that there exists an embedding  $f$  of  $S^2 \times I$  in  $S^3$  such that  $\text{Cl}(S^3 - f(S^2 \times I))$  is  $C \cup D$ , and if  $y$  is a point of  $S^2$ , then the arc  $f(\{y\} \times I)$  has endpoints  $x$  and  $h(x)$  on  $C$  and  $D$ , respectively. Now the space  $C \cup_h D$  may be obtained by taking the decomposition of  $S^3$  whose only nondegenerate elements are the sets  $f(\{y\} \times I)$ . Lemma 6, together with the hypothesis that  $C \cup_h D$  is  $S^3$ , implies that each of the arcs  $f(\{y\} \times I)$  is cellular. It follows from Lemma 4 that one of the arcs  $f(\{y\} \times [0, 1/2])$  and  $f(\{y\} \times [1/2, 1])$  is tame, and from Lemma 3 that if  $f(\{y\} \times I)$  has endpoints  $x$  and  $h(x)$ , then either  $x$  is a piercing point of  $C$  or  $h(x)$  is a piercing point of  $D$ . This establishes the theorem.

We point out that the conditions stated in our theorem, while necessary for  $C \cup_h D$  to be  $S^3$ , are not sufficient. Ball [3] has described a crumpled cube  $C$  each of whose boundary points is a piercing point, and a homeomorphism  $h: \text{Bd } C \rightarrow \text{Bd } C$  such that  $C \cup_h C$  is not  $S^3$ .

We can use Lemma 6 and a theorem of Armentrout to obtain a proof of a theorem announced by Lininger [12].

**THEOREM (Lininger).** *If  $C$  and  $D$  are crumpled cubes,  $h: \text{Bd } C \rightarrow \text{Bd } D$  is a homeomorphism, and  $C \cup_h D$  is a 3-manifold, then  $C \cup_h D$  is  $S^3$ .*

*Proof.* As in the proof of the theorem above, we represent  $C \cup_h D$  as a decomposition of  $S^3$  whose only nondegenerate elements are the fibering arcs of an annulus. It follows from Lemma 6 that each of the fibering arcs is cellular. Since some open set in  $S^3$  misses the sum of the nondegenerate elements, it follows from [2] that the decomposition space is  $S^3$ .

#### REFERENCES

1. J. W. Alexander, *An example of a simply connected surface bounding a region which is not simply connected*, Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 10 (1924), 8-10.
2. S. Armentrout, *Concerning cellular decompositions of 3-manifolds that yield 3-manifolds*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. (to appear).
3. B. J. Ball, *The sum of two solid horned spheres*, Ann. of Math. (2) 69 (1959), 253-257.
4. R. H. Bing, *A homeomorphism between the 3-sphere and the sum of two solid horned spheres*, Ann. of Math. (2) 56 (1952), 354-362.
5. ———, *A surface is tame if its complement is 1-ULC*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 101 (1961), 294-305.
6. P. H. Doyle and J. G. Hocking, *Some results on tame disks and spheres in  $E^3$* , Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 11 (1960), 832-836.
7. R. H. Fox and E. Artin, *Some wild cells and spheres in three-dimensional space*, Ann. of Math. (2) 49 (1948), 979-990.

8. D. S. Gillman, *Side approximation, missing an arc*, Amer. J. Math. 85 (1963), 459-476.
9. O. G. Harrold and E. E. Moise, *Almost locally polyhedral spheres*, Ann. of Math. (2) 57 (1953), 575-578.
10. N. Hosay, *The sum of a real cube and a crumpled cube is  $S^3$* , Abstract 607-17, Notices Amer. Math. Soc. 10 (1963), 666; see also *errata* in 11 (1964), 152.
11. L. L. Lininger, *Some results on crumpled cubes*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 118 (1965), 534-549.
12. ———, *The sum of two crumpled cubes is  $S^3$  if it is a 3-manifold*, (to appear).
13. D. R. McMillan, Jr., *A criterion for cellularity in a manifold*, Ann. of Math. (2) 79 (1964), 327-337.
14. S. Smale, *A Vietoris mapping theorem for homotopy*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 8 (1957), 604-610.
15. J. R. Stallings, *Uncountably many wild disks*, Ann. of Math. (2) 71 (1960), 185-186.

University of Wisconsin  
Madison, Wisconsin

