

# A Fibered Polynomial Hull without an Analytic Selection

J. WILLIAM HELTON & ORLANDO MERINO

This note shows that certain polynomial hulls in  $\mathbf{C}^3$  have no analytic selection, thus settling a standing question about such hulls.

Recall that the *polynomial hull*  $\mathcal{P}(S)$  of a set  $S$  in  $\mathbf{C}^M$  is the set

$$\mathcal{P}(S) = \{w \in \mathbf{C}^M : |p(w)| \leq \max_{v \in S} |p(v)| \text{ for all polynomials } p \text{ on } \mathbf{C}^M\}.$$

We shall be considering sets  $S$  in  $\mathbf{C}^{1+N}$  that are fibered over the unit circle  $\partial\mathbf{D}$  in  $\mathbf{C}$  the complex plane. Thus  $S$  has the form

$$\{(e^{i\theta}, S_\theta) : 0 \leq \theta \leq 2\pi\},$$

where each  $S_\theta$  is a subset of  $\mathbf{C}^N$ . Let  $\mathbf{D}$  denote the unit disk in the complex plane and let  $H_N^\infty$  denote the  $\mathbf{C}^N$ -valued functions bounded and analytic on  $\mathbf{D}$ . Clearly (from the maximum principle) if  $f$  is any  $H_N^\infty$  function satisfying

$$f(e^{i\theta}) \in S_\theta \text{ for almost all } \theta,$$

then the graph  $\{z, f(z) : z \in \mathbf{D}\}$  of  $f$  lies in  $\mathcal{P}(S)$ . Such a function  $f$  is called an *analytic selection* of  $\mathcal{P}(S)$ . A significant question about polynomial hulls is which hulls have analytic selections.

An obvious necessary condition is that  $\mathcal{P}(S)$  in  $\mathbf{C}^{1+N}$  be a set whose projection onto the first coordinate is a set containing  $\mathbf{D}$ . We shall refer to such  $\mathcal{P}(S)$  as having *nontrivial fiber over the unit disk*. Also, if the  $S_\theta$  are not connected then it is easy to make up examples where  $\mathcal{P}(S)$  has no analytic selection.

QUESTION (Q). Are these conditions sufficient for  $\mathcal{P}(S)$  to have an analytic selection?

By giving a highly pathological example (for  $N=1$ ), Wermer [Wr] showed that in general the answer is No. However, when the  $S_\theta$  are nicely behaved the story is different. For  $N=1$  Slodkowski [Sl] and independently Wegert [Wg] and Helton–Marshall [HM] showed that the answer is Yes. This article gives a simple very well-behaved  $S$  in  $\mathbf{C}^3$  for which the answer to (Q) is No.

Now we write down the  $S$  that provides our example. Write  $\mathbf{C}^2$  as  $\{z = (x_1, y_1, x_2, y_2) = (z_1, z_2)\}$ . Let  $\mathcal{C}$  denote the semicircle

$$\mathcal{C} = \{(z_1, z_2) : |z_1| = 1, \operatorname{Im} z_1 \geq 0, z_2 = 0\}$$

embedded in the first complex coordinate of  $\mathbf{C}^2$ . Our example is based on rotating  $\mathcal{C}$  inside of real 3-dimensional space in a way that varies with  $\theta$ . Here  $\mathbf{R}^3$  is embedded in  $\mathbf{C}^2$  in the usual way ( $y_2 = 0$ ). Let  $R_\theta^1$  denote the map which acts on  $\mathbf{C}^2$  by the rotation of  $z$  in the  $z_1$  plane by  $\theta$  ( $z_2$  is kept fixed), that is,

$$R_\theta^1(z_1, z_2) = (e^{i\theta} z_1, z_2).$$

Also, let  $R_\theta^2$  denote rotation in the  $(y_1, x_2)$  plane by  $\theta$ .

**THEOREM 1.** *The polynomial hull  $\mathcal{P}(\mathcal{S})$  of  $\mathcal{S}$  with fibers*

$$\mathcal{S}_\theta = R_{\theta/2}^1(R_{\theta/2}^2(\mathcal{C}))$$

*has nontrivial fibers over the disk, since  $\mathcal{P}(\mathcal{S})$  contains the graph*

$$\{(z, \pm z^{1/2}, 0) : z \in \mathbf{D}\}$$

*of  $z^{1/2}$ . Moreover, each  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$  is connected, and the sets  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$  vary continuously with  $\theta$ . However,  $\mathcal{P}(\mathcal{S})$  contains no analytic selection.*

First we need a lemma. For  $k = 1, 2$ , let  $\operatorname{Proj}_k$  be the map on  $\mathbf{C}^3$  given by  $\operatorname{Proj}_k(\zeta, z_1, z_2) = z_k$ .

**LEMMA.**  $\mathcal{P}(\mathcal{S}) \subset \mathbf{D} \times \mathcal{P}(\operatorname{Proj}_1(\mathcal{S})) \times \mathcal{P}(\operatorname{Proj}_2(\mathcal{S}))$ .

*Proof.*  $\mathcal{S} \subset \partial\mathbf{D} \times \operatorname{Proj}_1(\mathcal{S}) \times \operatorname{Proj}_2(\mathcal{S})$ . Thus

$$\mathcal{P}(\mathcal{S}) \subset \mathcal{P}(\partial\mathbf{D} \times \operatorname{Proj}_1(\mathcal{S}) \times \operatorname{Proj}_2(\mathcal{S})) \subset \mathbf{D} \times \mathcal{P}(\operatorname{Proj}_1(\mathcal{S})) \times \mathcal{P}(\operatorname{Proj}_2(\mathcal{S})). \quad \square$$

*Proof of Theorem 1.* Suppose that  $f = (f^1, f^2)$  in  $H_2^\infty$  has its graph contained in  $\mathcal{P}(\mathcal{S})$ . By the lemma, the function  $f^2$  is in  $\mathcal{P}(\operatorname{Proj}_2(\mathcal{S})) \subset [-1, 1]$  in  $\mathbf{R}$ . In particular  $\operatorname{Im} f^2$  is 0; therefore  $f^2$  is constant, but  $f^2(1) = 0$  since  $f(1) \in \mathcal{C}$ . We conclude that  $f^2$  is 0.

The value of  $f = (f^1, 0)$  at  $\theta$  is in  $\mathcal{S}_\theta \cap \{(z_1, 0)\} = \{(\pm e^{i\theta/2}, 0)\}$  except possibly for  $\theta = 0$  or  $2\pi$ . That is,  $f^1 = \pm e^{i\theta/2}$  almost everywhere. No such function exists in  $H_1^\infty$ , so we have a contradiction.

Now we check that the  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$  are smoothly varying. If  $0 < \theta < 2\pi$ , then the maps  $R_\theta^1$  and  $R_\theta^2$  on  $\mathbf{C}^2$  are jointly  $C^\infty$  in  $\theta$  and  $(z_1, z_2)$ . The only potential difficulty is at  $\theta = 0$  or  $\theta = 2\pi$ . One can easily visualize  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$  since it lies in  $\mathbf{R}^3 \subset \mathbf{C}^2$ . The key is the set of points  $\pm z_\theta = (\pm e^{i\theta/2}, 0)$  which are the image of  $\pm i$  under the map  $R_{\theta/2}^1 R_{\theta/2}^2$  (and which consequently lie in  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$ ). Observe that  $\pm i = \pm z_0 = \mp z_{2\pi}$ , implying that as  $\theta$  moves from 0 to  $2\pi$  the points  $(+1, 0)$  and  $(-1, 0)$  rotate into each other. Thus  $\mathcal{S}_{2\pi}$  is a rotation of  $\mathcal{C}$  in the  $(z_1, 0)$  plane which has the same endpoints as  $\mathcal{C}$ ; we have  $\mathcal{S}_{2\pi} = \mathcal{C}$  or  $\mathcal{S}_{2\pi} = -\mathcal{C}$ . However,

$$R_{2\pi/2}^1(R_{2\pi/2}^2(1, 0)) = R_\pi^1((-1, 0)) = (1, 0).$$

We have established that the  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$  vary continuously in  $\theta$ . □

Lest one complain that our example hinges on degeneracy of  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$ , we now give an example where  $\mathcal{S}$  is the closure of an open set in  $\mathbf{C}^3$  in addition to maintaining other nice properties.

**THEOREM 2.** *For  $n \in \mathbf{N}$ , let  $\mathcal{S}^n$  be the set in  $\mathbf{C}^3$  with fibers  $\mathcal{S}_\theta + (1/n)B$ , where  $B$  is the unit ball of  $\mathbf{C}^2$ . Then there exists  $n_0 \in \mathbf{N}$  such that the polynomial hull of  $\mathcal{S}^{n_0}$  has no analytic selection.*

*Proof.* Suppose not. Then for each  $n$  there exists  $f_n$  in  $H_2^\infty$  whose graph lies in  $\mathcal{S}^n$ . Let  $f_0$  be a normal families limit of  $\{f_n\}$ . By polynomial convexity of each  $\mathcal{S}_\theta$  and by Corollary 2 in [HM], the function  $f_0$  has graph lying in  $\mathcal{O}(\mathcal{S})$ . Thus  $\mathcal{O}(\mathcal{S})$  has a selection, contrary to Theorem 1.  $\square$

### References

- [HM] J. W. Helton and D. E. Marshall, *Frequency domain design and analytic selections*, Indiana Univ. Math. J. 39 (1990), 157–184.
- [Sl] Z. Slodowski, *Polynomial hulls for  $\mathbf{C}^2$  and quasicircles*, preprint.
- [Wg] E. Wegert, preprint.
- [Wr] J. Wermer, *Polynomially convex hulls and analyticity*, Ark. Mat. 20 (1982), 129–135.

J. W. Helton  
 Department of Mathematics  
 University of California – San Diego  
 La Jolla, CA 92093-0112

O. Merino  
 Department of Mathematics  
 University of Rhode Island  
 Kingston, RI 02881

