

NONUNIFORM ESTIMATES IN THE CONDITIONAL CENTRAL LIMIT THEOREM

BY DIETER LANDERS AND LOTHAR ROGGE

University of Cologne and University of Duisburg

Let X_n , $n \in \mathbb{N}$, be i.i.d. with mean 0, variance 1, and $E(|X_1|^r) < \infty$ for some $r > 3$. Let B be a measurable set such that its distances from the σ fields $\sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)$ are of order $O(n^{-1/2}(\log n)^{-r/2})$. We prove that for such B the conditional probabilities $P(n^{-1/2}\sum_{i=1}^n X_i \leq t|B)$ can be approximated by the standard normal distribution $\Phi(t)$ up to the classical nonuniform bound $(1 + |t|^r)^{-1}n^{-1/2}$. An example shows that this is not true any more if the distances of B from $\sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)$ are only of order $O(n^{-1/2}(\log n)^{-r/2+\epsilon})$ for some $\epsilon > 0$. For the case $r = 3$ one can obtain the corresponding assertion only under a strengthened assumption.

1. Introduction and notation. Let X_n , $n \in \mathbb{N}$, be a sequence of i.i.d. real valued random variables with mean 0 and variance 1. Put $S_n = \sum_{i=1}^n X_i$ and $S_n^* = n^{-1/2}\sum_{i=1}^n X_i$. Let $B \in \sigma(X_n; n \in \mathbb{N})$ with $P(B) > 0$. The conditional probabilities $P(S_n^* \leq t|B)$ play an important role in several fields of application and have been investigated in a lot of papers (see e.g., [7], [2], [3], [4]). The classical conditional central limit theorem of Rényi (1958) states that for each B

$$(1.1) \quad P(S_n^* \leq t|B) - \Phi(t) \xrightarrow[n \in \mathbb{N}]{} 0,$$

where Φ is the standard normal distribution.

The convergence order in (1.1), however, depends critically on the special set B : By suitable B you can make the convergence order in (1.1) as bad as you want (see Example 1 of [1]). In [2] and [4] approximation orders and second order expansions for the conditional probabilities $P(S_n^* \leq t|B)$ are given for special sets B . It turns out that the distances

$$d(B, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) = \inf\{P(B \Delta A) : A \in \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)\}$$

essentially determine the approximation results for the conditional probabilities. If, for instance, $d(B, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) = O(n^{-1/2}(\log n)^{-\beta})$ for some $\beta > \frac{3}{2}$, then

$$(1.2) \quad \sup_{t \in \mathbb{R}} |P(S_n^* \leq t|B) - \Phi(t)| = O(n^{-1/2}),$$

a result which fails if we replace $\beta > \frac{3}{2}$ by $\beta = \frac{3}{2}$ (see Corollary 3 and Example 5 of [2]).

In this paper we give for a large class of sets B a nonuniform estimate for the conditional probabilities of the form

$$(1.3) \quad |P(S_n^* \leq t|B) - \Phi(t)| \leq c(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}.$$

Received April 1985; revised October 1985.

AMS 1980 subject classifications. Primary 60E15; secondary 60F05.

Key words and phrases. Nonuniform bounds, conditional central limit theorem, independent and identically distributed random variables.

Such nonuniform estimates have wider applicability than approximation results of type (1.2), e.g., for obtaining inequalities for $\| \cdot \|_r$ norms and for the theory of moderate deviations. Until now nonuniform bounds of type (1.3) were only known for $B = \Omega$ (see, e.g., Petrov (1975), Theorem 13, page 125).

If $E(|X_1|^r) < \infty$ for some $r \geq 3$, we prove that relation (1.3) holds for all B satisfying

$$(1.4) \quad d(B, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) = O(n^{-1/2}(\log n)^{-\beta(r)}),$$

where $\beta(r) = r/2$ for $r > 3$ and $\beta(3) > \frac{3}{2}$. We show by an example that assumption (1.4) cannot be weakened, even if X_1 is standard normally distributed.

2. The results. For a bounded random variable Y define

$$d_1(Y, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) = \inf\{E(|Y - Z|): Z \text{ is } \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)\text{-measurable}\}.$$

Observe that

$$d_1(1_B, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) \leq d(B, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) \leq 2d_1(1_B, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n))$$

and that $d_1(Y, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) \rightarrow_{n \in \mathbb{N}} 0$ for each $\sigma(X_n: n \in \mathbb{N})$ -measurable and bounded Y .

In the following we write $E(S_n^* \leq t, Y)$ instead of $E(Y \cdot 1_{\{S_n^* \leq t\}})$.

THEOREM. *Let $r \geq 3$ and $X_n, n \in \mathbb{N}$, be i.i.d. random variables with mean 0, variance 1, and $E(|X_1|^r) < \infty$. Let Y be a bounded random variable and assume that*

$$d_1(Y, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) = O(n^{-1/2}(\log n)^{-\beta(r)}),$$

where $\beta(r) = r/2$ for $r > 3$ and $\beta(3) > \frac{3}{2}$. Then there exists a constant c such that for all $t \in \mathbb{R}, n \in \mathbb{N}$

$$|E(S_n^* \leq t, Y) - \Phi(t)E(Y)| \leq c(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}.$$

PROOF. According to Theorem 4 of [3] we may assume that $|t| \geq 1$. It is well known that there exists a $\sigma(X_1, \dots, X_k)$ -measurable random variable Y_k with

$$(2.1) \quad E(|Y - Y_k|) = d_1(Y, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_k)).$$

Put $\mathbb{N}_1 = \{2^k: k \in \mathbb{N}\}$ and $N_n = \{\nu \in \mathbb{N}_1: \nu \leq n/4\}$. Let $Z_2 = Y_2$ and $Z_\nu = Y_\nu - Y_{\nu/2}$ for $4 \leq \nu \in \mathbb{N}_1$. In the following c_i denote constants depending only on Y, r , and the distribution of X_1 . Using (2.1) and our assumption we have

$$(2.2) \quad E(|Z_\nu|) \leq c_1 \nu^{-1/2}(\log \nu)^{-\beta(r)}, \quad \nu \in \mathbb{N}_1.$$

Let $j(n) = \max N_n$. Since $Y = Y - Y_{j(n)} + \sum_{\nu \in N_n} Z_\nu$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} |E(S_n^* \leq t, Y) - \Phi(t)E(Y)| &\leq |E(S_n^* \leq t, Y - Y_{j(n)}) - \Phi(t)E(Y - Y_{j(n)})| \\ &\quad + \sum_{\nu \in N_n} |E(S_n^* \leq t, Z_\nu) - \Phi(t)E(Z_\nu)|. \end{aligned}$$

Hence it suffices to prove

$$(2.3) \quad |E(S_n^* \leq t, Y - Y_{j(n)}) - \Phi(t)E(Y - Y_{j(n)})| \leq c_2(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2},$$

$$(2.4) \quad \sum_{\nu \in N_n} |E(S_n^* \leq t, Z_\nu) - \Phi(t)E(Z_\nu)| \leq c_3(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}.$$

For the property (2.3) let $t < 0$. Then

$$|\Phi(t)E(Y - Y_{j(n)})| \leq c_4(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})E(|Y - Y_{j(n)}|) \stackrel{(2.1)}{\leq} c_5(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}.$$

Hence (2.3) is shown, if we prove

$$(2.5) \quad |E(S_n^* \leq t, Y - Y_{j(n)})| \leq c_6(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}.$$

Let $-(2 \log n)^{1/2} \leq t < 0$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} |E(S_n^* \leq t, Y - Y_{j(n)})| &\leq E(|Y - Y_{j(n)}|) \stackrel{(2.1)}{\leq} c_6(1 \wedge (\log n)^{-\beta(r)})n^{-1/2} \\ &\leq c_7(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}. \end{aligned}$$

Let $t < -(2 \log n)^{1/2}$; then $\Phi(t) \leq c_8(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}$. Hence, by Petrov ((1975), Theorem 13, page 125),

$$\begin{aligned} |E(S_n^* \leq t, Y - Y_{j(n)})| &\leq c_9P(S_n^* \leq t) \leq c_9|P(S_n^* \leq t) - \Phi(t)| + c_9\Phi(t) \\ &\leq c_{10}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2} + c_9\Phi(t) \leq c_{11}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}. \end{aligned}$$

For property (2.4) let F_k be the distribution function of S_k^* , $\mathcal{A}_n := \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)$ and $t_{n,\nu}(\omega) = (tn^{1/2} - S_\nu(\omega))(n - \nu)^{-1/2}$. With $S_{n-\nu}^\# = \sum_{i=\nu+1}^n X_i$ we have $S_{n-\nu}^\# =_d S_{n-\nu}$, $S_{n-\nu}^\#$ is independent of \mathcal{A}_ν , and hence,

$$\begin{aligned} E(S_n^* \leq t, Z_\nu) &= E(E^{\mathcal{A}_\nu} 1_{S_n^* \leq t} Z_\nu) \\ &= E(Z_\nu P^{\mathcal{A}_\nu}(S_n^* \leq t)) = E(Z_\nu P^{\mathcal{A}_\nu}(S_\nu + S_{n-\nu}^\# \leq tn^{1/2})) \\ &= E(Z_\nu P^{\mathcal{A}_\nu}((n - \nu)^{-1/2} S_{n-\nu}^\# \leq (tn^{1/2} - S_\nu)(n - \nu)^{-1/2})) \\ &= E(Z_\nu F_{n-\nu}(t_{n,\nu})). \end{aligned}$$

Thus for $\nu \in N_n$,

$$\begin{aligned} E(S_n^* \leq t, Z_\nu) - \Phi(t)E(Z_\nu) &= E(Z_\nu [F_{n-\nu}(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(t_{n,\nu})]) \\ &\quad + E(Z_\nu [\Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(t)]). \end{aligned}$$

Since furthermore (see Petrov (1975), Theorem 13, page 125)

$$|F_{n-\nu}(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(t_{n,\nu})| \leq c_{12}(1 \wedge |t_{n,\nu}|^{-r})n^{-1/2}, \quad \nu \in N_n,$$

relation (2.4) is shown if we prove

$$(2.4a) \quad \alpha_n(t) = \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E(|Z_\nu| (1 \wedge |t_{n,\nu}|^{-r})) \leq c_{13}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r}),$$

$$(2.4b) \quad \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E(|Z_\nu| |\Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(t)|) \leq c_{14}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}.$$

For property (2.4a) use

$$1 \wedge |t_{n,\nu}|^{-r} \leq c_{15} \left(1 + |S_\nu n^{-1/2}|^r\right) (1 \wedge |t|^{-r});$$

hence, by (2.2),

$$\begin{aligned} a_n(t) &\leq c_{16} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) \sum_{\nu \in N_n} \left[E(|Z_\nu|) + E(|S_\nu n^{-1/2}|^r) \right] \\ &\leq c_{17} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) + c_{18} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-r/2} \sum_{\nu \in N_n} \nu^{r/2} \\ &\leq c_{19} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}). \end{aligned}$$

For property (2.4b) let $t > 0$ and put $\varphi(t) = \Phi'(t)$. As

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{\nu \in N_n} E\left(|Z_\nu| \left| \Phi\left(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}\right) - \Phi(t) \right|\right) \\ &\leq \sum_{\nu \in N_n} t \left(n^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2} - 1\right) \varphi(t) E(|Z_\nu|) \\ &\leq c_{20} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E(|Z_\nu|) \nu/n \\ &\leq c_{21} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1} \sum_{\nu \in N_n} \nu^{1/2} (\log \nu)^{-\beta(r)} \\ &\leq c_{22} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1/2}, \end{aligned}$$

it suffices to prove

$$(2.6) \quad \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E\left(|Z_\nu| \left| \Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi\left(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}\right) \right|\right) \leq c_{23} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1/2}.$$

Let at first $t \geq ((r+2)\log n)^{1/2}$. Then $\varphi(t/2) \leq c_{24} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1/2}$. Hence,

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{\nu \in N_n} E\left(|S_\nu| \leq \frac{1}{2}tn^{1/2}, |Z_\nu| \left| \Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi\left(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}\right) \right|\right) \\ (2.7) \quad &\leq c_{25} \sum_{\nu \in N_n} n^{-1/2} \varphi(t/2) E(|S_\nu|) \\ &\leq c_{26} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1} \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E(|S_\nu|) \\ &\leq c_{27} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1/2}. \end{aligned}$$

Furthermore (use, e.g., Theorem 2 of Michel (1976) for (+))

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{\nu \in N_n} E\left(|S_\nu| > \frac{1}{2}tn^{1/2}, |Z_\nu| \left| \Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi\left(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}\right) \right|\right) \\ &\leq c_{28} \sum_{\nu \in N_n} P\{|S_\nu^*| > tn^{1/2}/(2\nu^{1/2})\} \\ &\stackrel{(+)}{\leq} c_{29} \sum_{\nu \in N_n} \left(t(n/\nu)^{1/2}\right)^{-r} \nu^{-(r-2)/2} \\ &\leq c_{30} (1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-(r-2)/2}. \end{aligned}$$

Together with (2.7) this yields (2.6) for $t \geq ((r + 2)\log n)^{1/2}$. Let finally $1 < t < ((r + 2)\log n)^{1/2}$. Put $a = r^{1/2}[E(|X_1|^3)]^{1/3}$ and $A_\nu = \{|S_\nu| > a(\nu \log \nu)^{1/2}\}$. Then we have (as in the proof of formula 15, page 233 of [2]) that

$$(2.8) \quad \sum_{\nu \in \mathbb{N}_1} E(|S_\nu|1_{A_\nu}) < \infty.$$

Let

$$M_n = M_n(t) = \{\nu \in N_n : a(\nu \log \nu)^{1/2} \leq tn^{1/2}/2\}.$$

Then

$$N_n - M_n(t) \subset \{\nu \in N_n : \nu > nt^2/(4a^2 \log n)\}$$

and hence

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E(|Z_\nu| |\Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2})| 1_{\bar{A}_\nu}) \\ & \leq \sum_{\nu \in M_n} [\Phi(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}) \\ & \quad - \Phi(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2} - a(\nu \log \nu)^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2})] E(|Z_\nu|) \\ & \quad + \sum_{\nu \in N_n - M_n} E(|Z_\nu|) \\ & \leq a\sqrt{2} n^{-1/2} \varphi(t/2) \sum_{\nu \in M_n} (\nu \log \nu)^{1/2} E(|Z_\nu|) \\ & \quad + \sum_{N_1 \ni \nu > nt^2/(4a^2 \log n)^{-1}} \nu^{-1/2} (\log \nu)^{-\beta(r)} \\ & \leq c_{31}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1/2} \sum_{\nu \in \mathbb{N}_1} (\log \nu)^{-\beta(r)+1/2} + c_{32}(\log n/n)^{1/2} t^{-1} (\log n)^{-\beta(r)} \\ & \leq c_{33}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1/2}, \end{aligned}$$

where the last inequality follows from $-\beta(r) + \frac{1}{2} < -1$ and $1 \leq t < ((r + 2)\log n)^{1/2}$. Consequently the proof of (2.6)—and hence the assertion—is shown if we prove

$$(2.9) \quad \begin{aligned} b_n(t) &= \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E(|Z_\nu| 1_{A_\nu} |\Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2})|) \\ &\leq c_{34}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r}) n^{-1/2}. \end{aligned}$$

Let

$$M_n = M_n(t) = \{\nu \in N_n : tn^{1/2} > 2(\nu(r-1)\log \nu)^{1/2}\}.$$

Then

$$N_n - M_n(t) \subset \{\nu \in N_n : \nu \geq t^2 n(4(r-1)\log n)^{-1}\}$$

and we have

$$\begin{aligned}
 b_n(t) &\leq \sum_{\nu \in N_n} E\left(|Z_\nu| 1_{A_\nu} 1_{\{|S_\nu| \leq (1/2)tn^{1/2}\}} \left| \Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}) \right| \right) \\
 &+ \sum_{\nu \in M_n} E\left(|Z_\nu| 1_{\{|S_\nu| > (1/2)tn^{1/2}\}} \left| \Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}) \right| \right) \\
 &+ \sum_{\nu \in N_n - M_n} E\left(|Z_\nu| 1_{A_\nu} \left| \Phi(t_{n,\nu}) - \Phi(tn^{1/2}(n-\nu)^{-1/2}) \right| \right) \\
 &\leq c_{35} \sum_{\nu \in N_n} n^{-1/2} \varphi(t/2) E(|S_\nu| 1_{A_\nu}) + c_{36} \sum_{\nu \in M_n} P\{|S_\nu^*| > (1/2)tn^{1/2}\nu^{-1/2}\} \\
 &+ \sum_{\nu \in N_n - M_n} E(|Z_\nu|).
 \end{aligned}$$

Using (2.8) and Theorem 2 of Michel (1976) we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
 b_n(t) &\leq c_{37}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2} + c_{38} \sum_{\nu \in M_n} \nu^{r/2} t^{-r} n^{-r/2} \nu^{-(r-2)/2} \\
 &+ \sum_{N_n \ni \nu \geq t^2 n(4(r-1)\log n)^{-1}} \nu^{-1/2} (\log \nu)^{-\beta(r)} \\
 &\leq c_{37}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2} + c_{39}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-r/2} \sum_{\nu \in M_n} \nu \\
 &+ c_{40}(\log n)^{1/2} t^{-1} n^{-1/2} (\log n)^{-\beta(r)} \\
 &\leq c_{41}(1 \wedge |t|^{-r})n^{-1/2}.
 \end{aligned}$$

This proves (2.9) and hence the proof is finished. \square

Example 5 of [2] shows that for $r = 3$ we cannot obtain the assertion of the preceding theorem any more if we replace in the assumption $\beta(3) > \frac{3}{2}$ by $\beta(3) = \frac{3}{2}$. The following example shows that for $r > 3$ we cannot weaken the assumption from $\beta(r) = r/2$ to $\beta(r) < r/2$. The examples work with indicator functions $g = 1_B$.

3. Example. Let $X_n, n \in \mathbb{N}$, be i.i.d. standard normally distributed random variables. Let $r > 3$ and $\beta < r/2$. Put $\hat{\mathbb{N}} = \{2^{2^k} : k \in \mathbb{N}\}$. Using Lemma 3 of [2] and the theorem of Liapounov for nonatomic measures it is easy to see that there exist constants $c_1, c_2 > 0$ and disjoint sets $B_\nu, \nu \in \hat{\mathbb{N}}$, with

$$(3.1) \quad B_\nu \in \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_\nu),$$

$$(3.2) \quad B_\nu \subset \{S_\nu^* \leq -c_1(\log \nu)^{1/2}\},$$

$$(3.3) \quad P(B_\nu) = c_2 \nu^{-1/2} (\log \nu)^{-\beta}.$$

Put $B = \sum_{\nu \in \hat{\mathbb{N}}} B_\nu$. By (3.1) and (3.3) we have

$$(3.4) \quad d(B, \sigma(X_1, \dots, X_n)) = O(n^{-1/2} (\log n)^{-\beta}).$$

Furthermore, we have for all $n \in \hat{N}$ and $t_n = -c_1(\log n)^{1/2}$,

$$\begin{aligned} & P(S_n^* \leq t_n, B) - \Phi(t_n)P(B) \\ & \geq \sum_{\hat{N} \ni \nu < n} (P(S_n^* \leq t_n, B_\nu) - \Phi(t_n)P(B_\nu)) \\ & \quad + P(S_n^* \leq t_n, B_n) - \Phi(t_n)P(B_n) - \sum_{\hat{N} \ni \nu > n} P(B_\nu). \end{aligned}$$

Since

$$P(S_n^* \leq t_n, B_\nu) - \Phi(t_n)P(B_\nu) \geq 0 \quad \text{for } \nu < n, \nu \in \hat{N},$$

$$P(S_n^* \leq t_n, B_n) - \Phi(t_n)P(B_n) = (1 - \Phi(t_n))P(B_n) \geq \frac{1}{2}P(B_n), \quad n \in \hat{N},$$

and

$$\sum_{\hat{N} \ni \nu > n} P(B_\nu) = o(P(B_n)), \quad n \in \hat{N},$$

we obtain for all sufficiently large $n \in \hat{N}$,

$$\begin{aligned} P(S_n^* \leq t_n, B) - \Phi(t_n)P(B) & \geq \frac{1}{4}P(B_n) = \frac{1}{4}c_2 n^{-1/2}(\log n)^{-\beta} \\ & \geq c_3(1 \wedge |t_n|^{-r})n^{-1/2}|t_n|^{r-2\beta}. \end{aligned}$$

Since $r - 2\beta > 0$, $|t_n| \rightarrow \infty$, relation (3.4) with $\beta < r/2$ does not imply the assertion of our theorem.

REFERENCES

- [1] LANDERS, D. and ROGGE, L. (1977). Inequalities for conditioned normal approximation. *Ann. Probab.* **5** 595–600.
- [2] LANDERS, D. and ROGGE, L. (1984). Exact approximation orders in the conditional central limit theorem. *Z. Wahrsch. verw. Gebiete* **66** 227–244.
- [3] LANDERS, D. and ROGGE, L. (1985). Uniform normal approximation orders for families of dominated measures. *J. Approx. Theory* **45** 99–121.
- [4] LANDERS, D. and ROGGE, L. (1986). Second-order approximation in the conditional central limit theorem. *Ann. Probab.* **14** 313–325.
- [5] MICHEL, R. (1976). Nonuniform central limit bounds with applications to probabilities of deviations. *Ann. Probab.* **4** 102–106.
- [6] PETROV, V. V. (1975). *Sums of Independent Random Variables*. Springer, Berlin.
- [7] RÉNYI, A. (1958). On mixing sequences of sets. *Acta Math. Acad. Sci. Hungar.* **9** 215–228.

MATHEMATISCHES INSTITUT
DER UNIVERSITÄT KÖLN
WEYERTAL 86-90
D-5000 KÖLN 41
FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF GERMANY

FACHBEREICH MATHEMATIK
DER UNIVERSITÄT GH-DUISBURG
LOTHARSTRASSE 65
D-4100 DUISBURG 1
FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF GERMANY