

SOURCE OF EVALUATIONS REFORMULATED AND ANALYZED

I. RICHARD SAVAGE

CENTER FOR ADVANCED STUDY IN THE BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES
and

MURRAY WEBSTER, JR.

THE JOHNS HOPKINS UNIVERSITY

1. Introduction

Webster [8] has published a theory of the source of evaluations and expectations for performance (which we will henceforth refer to as the *source theory*), along with results of experiments intended to test derivations from the theory. The empirical results were interpreted as being in accord with the derivations, and thus, as supportive of the theory. Study of the theory and the *derivations* indicates there are logical problems with the assumptions, and that as a result, the derivations are *not* logical consequences of the assumptions. Therefore, the results of the experiments are indeterminate with respect to the theory Webster presented.

We begin the analysis with a description of the substantive ideas of the source theory, along with the original statement of the theory. Next, we present a simple formalization of the theory, using ideas from probability theory to restate the propositions.

The source theory is strengthened, qualitative inequalities on probabilities of being influenced are replaced by expressions with estimatable parameters.

2. The source theory

The source theory was an attempt to state explicitly some ideas deriving from two theoretical traditions. The first, which might be called the *looking glass self*, derives from the Cooley [5] and Mead [6] ideas regarding the individual's sources of selfconcept. According to this tradition, the individual's ideas regarding himself, including particularly his selfevaluation, come from the opinions of others. Moreover, these others are not all expected to be equally important in

The research of I. R. Savage was done while a Senior Post Doctoral Fellow of the National Science Foundation and with the assistance of the Army, Navy and Air Force under Office of Naval Research Contract number N00014-67-A-0235-0006. Current address is Florida State University, Department of Statistics, Tallahassee, Florida.

The research of M. Webster was supported by U.S. Office of Education Grant OEG-3-71-0122 to Doris R. Entwisle and Murray Webster, Jr.