

Józef Myjak, Dipartimento di Matematica Pura ed Applicata, Università di L'Aquila, Via Vetoio, 67100 L'Aquila, Italy. e-mail: myjak@univaq.it  
Ryszard Rudnicki\*, Institute of Mathematics, Polish Academy of Sciences and Institute of Mathematics, Silesian University, Bankowa 14, 40-007 Katowice, Poland. e-mail: rudnicki@us.edu.pl

## TYPICAL PROPERTIES OF CORRELATION DIMENSION

### Abstract

Let  $(X, \rho)$  be a complete separable metric space and  $\mathcal{M}$  be the set of all probability Borel measures on  $X$ . We show that if the space  $\mathcal{M}$  is equipped with the weak topology, the set of measures having the upper (resp. lower) correlation dimension zero is residual. Moreover, the upper correlation dimension of a typical (in the sense of Baire category) measure is estimated by means of the local lower entropy and local upper entropy dimensions of  $X$ .

### 1 Introduction

The correlation dimension introduced by Procaccia, Grassberger and Hentschel [9] is frequently used in the theory of dynamical systems. A rigorous mathematical treatment of this dimension was given by Pesin [5]. For further results see [1, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 10, 11].

In this note we investigate some typical properties of the correlation dimension. Recall that a set in a metric space is called nowhere dense if its closure has empty interior. A countable union of nowhere dense sets is said to be of the first Baire category. A subset  $A$  of a complete metric space  $X$  is said to be residual in  $X$  if its complement is of the first Baire category. If the set of all elements of  $X$  satisfying some property  $P$  is residual in  $X$ , then the property  $P$  is called typical or generic. We also say that a typical element of  $X$  has property  $P$ .

---

Key Words: measure, dimension, residual subset

Mathematical Reviews subject classification: Primary: 28A80; Secondary: 54E52

Received by the editors March 15, 2001

\*This research was supported by the State Committee for Scientific Research (Poland) Grant No. 2 P03A 010 16 (RR).

Let  $\mathcal{M}$  be the space of all probability Borel measures on a complete separable metric space  $X$ . We show that a typical measure in the space  $\mathcal{M}$  endowed with the strong topology has upper correlation dimension zero. If the space  $\mathcal{M}$  is endowed with the weak topology, then a typical measure has lower correlation dimension zero and upper correlation dimension no smaller than the smallest local lower entropy dimension of  $X$  and no greater than the smallest local upper entropy dimension of  $X$ .

These results are in the spirit of that by Gruber [2], who studied typical properties of entropy dimension of compact subsets of  $X$ . Namely, he considered the space  $\mathcal{C}$  of all compact subsets of  $X$  equipped with the Hausdorff metric. He proved that a typical compact subset of  $X$  has lower entropy dimension zero. He also proved that if the compact subsets of  $X$  having lower entropy dimension at least  $\delta$  are dense in  $\mathcal{C}$ , then a typical compact subset of  $X$  has upper dimension at least  $\delta$ .

The paper is divided into three sections. In Section 2 we formulate the main results. Section 3 contains the proofs. In Section 4 we present two examples which show that the estimation of the upper correlation dimension given in Section 2 cannot be improved.

## 2 Main Result

Let  $(X, \rho)$  be a complete separable metric space and let  $B(x, r)$  denote the open ball in  $X$  with center at  $x$  and radius  $r > 0$ . By  $\mathcal{B}$  we denote the  $\sigma$ -algebra of Borel subsets of  $X$  and by  $\mathcal{M}$  we denote the set of all probability Borel measures on  $X$ .

For  $\mu_1, \mu_2 \in \mathcal{M}$  we consider the distance  $d_1$  given by the *supremum norm*; i.e.,

$$d_1(\mu_1, \mu_2) = \sup_{A \in \mathcal{B}} |\mu_1(A) - \mu_2(A)|$$

and the *Fortet-Mourier distance*  $d_2$  given by the formula

$$d_2(\mu_1, \mu_2) = \sup \left\{ \left| \int_X f(x) d\mu_1(x) - \int_X f(x) d\mu_2(x) \right| : f \in \mathcal{L} \right\},$$

where  $\mathcal{L}$  is the subset of  $C(X)$  which contains all the functions  $f$  such that  $|f(x)| \leq 1$  and  $|f(x) - f(y)| \leq \rho(x, y)$  for  $x, y \in X$ . It can be proved that the sequence  $(\mu_n)$ ,  $\mu_n \in \mathcal{M}$ , is weakly convergent to a measure  $\mu \in \mathcal{M}$  if and only if  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} d_2(\mu_n, \mu) = 0$ . It is well known that the spaces  $(\mathcal{M}, d_1)$  and  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$  are complete.

Let  $\mu \in \mathcal{M}$ . The quantities

$$\overline{\dim}_c \mu = \overline{\lim}_{r \rightarrow 0} \frac{1}{\log r} \log \int_X \mu(B(x, r)) d\mu(x)$$

and

$$\underline{\dim}_c \mu = \liminf_{r \rightarrow 0} \frac{1}{\log r} \log \int_X \mu(B(x, r)) d\mu(x)$$

are called the *upper* and *lower correlation dimension* of  $\mu$ , respectively. From the definition of the upper correlation dimension it follows immediately that if  $\mu(\{x\}) > 0$  for some  $x \in X$ , then  $\underline{\dim}_c \mu = 0$ .

Finally we recall that the *upper* and *lower entropy dimensions* of a set  $K \subset X$  are defined, respectively, by the formulae

$$\overline{\dim} K = \limsup_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \frac{\log N(K, r)}{\log(1/r)} \text{ and } \underline{\dim} K = \liminf_{r \rightarrow 0^+} \frac{\log N(K, r)}{\log(1/r)},$$

where  $N(K, r)$  is the least number of balls of radius  $r$  which cover the set  $K$ . Note that if the set  $K$  is closed and non-compact, then  $\overline{\dim} K = \underline{\dim} K = \infty$ .

**Remark 1.** In the definitions of entropy dimensions we can replace the number  $N(K, r)$  by

$$M(K, r) = \sup\{\text{card } F : F \subset K \text{ and } \rho(x, y) \geq r \text{ for every } x, y \in F, x \neq y\}.$$

Now we are ready to formulate our main result.

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $\alpha = \inf\{\underline{\dim} B(x, a) : x \in X, a > 0\}$  and  $\beta = \inf\{\overline{\dim} B(x, a) : x \in X, a > 0\}$ . Then*

- (a) *the set  $\mathcal{M}^0 = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu = 0\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_1)$ ,*
- (b) *the set  $\mathcal{M}_0 = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \underline{\dim}_c \mu = 0\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ ,*
- (c) *The set  $\mathcal{M}_\alpha^\beta = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \alpha \leq \overline{\dim}_c \mu \leq \beta\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ .*

The proof of Theorem 1 is given in the next section. In the last section we give an example of a space  $(X, \rho)$  such that the set  $\{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu = \beta\}$  is residual in  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$  and an example of a space  $(X, \rho)$  for which  $\alpha < \beta$  and the set  $\{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu > \alpha\}$  is nowhere dense in  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ . These examples show that the estimation  $\alpha \leq \overline{\dim}_c \mu \leq \beta$  in Theorem 1 cannot be improved.

### 3 Proofs

We split the proof of Theorem 1 into a sequence of lemmas.

Let  $(\varepsilon_n)$  and  $(\delta_n)$  be sequences of positive numbers convergent to zero. Let

$$\mathcal{N}_n = \{\nu \in \mathcal{M} : \nu(\{x_0\}) \geq \varepsilon_n \text{ for some } x_0 \in X\},$$

$$\mathcal{G}_n^i = \bigcup_{\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n} \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : d_i(\mu, \nu) < \delta_n\}, \text{ and } \mathcal{H}_i = \bigcap_{m=1}^\infty \bigcup_{n=m}^\infty \mathcal{G}_n^i.$$

for  $i = 1, 2$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

**Lemma 1.** *The set  $\mathcal{H}_i$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_i)$  for  $i = 1, 2$ .*

PROOF. Since for each  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  the set  $\bigcup_{n=m}^{\infty} \mathcal{N}_n$  is dense in  $\mathcal{M}$ , the set  $\bigcup_{n=m}^{\infty} \mathcal{G}_n^i$  is dense and open in  $\mathcal{M}$ . This implies that the set  $\mathcal{H}_i$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_i)$  for  $i = 1, 2$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 2.** *The set  $\mathcal{M}^0 = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu = 0\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_1)$ .*

PROOF. Let  $\varepsilon_n = \frac{1}{n}$  and  $\delta_n = \frac{1}{2n}$  for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . According to Lemma 1 it is sufficient to check that if  $\mu \in \mathcal{H}_1$ , then  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu = 0$ . Let  $\mu \in \mathcal{H}_1$ . For every  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  there are  $n \geq m$  and  $\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n$  such that  $d_1(\mu, \nu) < \delta_n$ . Since  $\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n$  there is a point  $x_0$  such that  $\nu(\{x_0\}) \geq \varepsilon_n$ . Consequently,

$$\mu(\{x_0\}) > \nu(\{x_0\}) - \delta_n \geq \varepsilon_n - \delta_n = \delta_n$$

and  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu = 0$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 3.** *The set  $\mathcal{M}_0 = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \underline{\dim}_c \mu = 0\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ .*

PROOF. Let  $\varepsilon_n = \frac{1}{n}$ ,  $r_n = (\varepsilon_n)^n$  and  $\delta_n = \frac{1}{9}\varepsilon_n r_n$  for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . According to Lemma 1 it is sufficient to check that if  $\mu \in \mathcal{H}_2$  then  $\underline{\dim}_c \mu = 0$ . Let  $\mu \in \mathcal{H}_2$ . For every  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  there is  $n \geq m$  and  $\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n$  such that  $d_2(\mu, \nu) < \delta_n$ . Since  $\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n$ , there is a point  $x_0$  such that  $\nu(\{x_0\}) \geq \varepsilon_n$ . Fix  $r \in (0, 1]$  and consider the function  $f : X \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  given by

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} r & \text{if } \rho(x, x_0) \leq r \\ r - t & \text{if } \rho(x, x_0) = r + t, 0 < t < r \\ 0 & \text{if } \rho(x, x_0) \geq 2r. \end{cases} \quad (1)$$

Clearly  $f \in \mathcal{L}$ . From the definition of the function  $f$  and inequality  $d_2(\mu, \nu) < \delta_n$  it follows that for every  $y \in B(x_0, r)$  we have

$$r\mu(B(y, 3r)) \geq \int_X f(x) d\mu(x) \geq -\delta_n + \int_X f(x) d\nu(x).$$

Since  $f(x_0) = r$  and  $\nu(\{x_0\}) \geq \varepsilon_n$ , the last inequality implies

$$\mu(B(y, 3r)) \geq -\frac{\delta_n}{r} + \varepsilon_n.$$

By a similar calculation, using a function  $f$  given by (1) with  $r/2$  in the place of  $r$ , we can show that  $\mu(B(x_0, r)) \geq \frac{-2\delta_n}{r} + \varepsilon_n$ . Substituting  $r = r_n/3$  we obtain

$$\mu(B(y, r_n)) \geq -\frac{3\delta_n}{r_n} + \varepsilon_n = \frac{2\varepsilon_n}{3} \text{ for every } y \in B(x_0, r_n/3) \tag{2}$$

and

$$\mu(B(x_0, r_n/3)) \geq \frac{\varepsilon_n}{3}. \tag{3}$$

Using (2) and (3) we have

$$\int_X \mu(B(y, r_n)) d\mu(y) \geq \int_{B(x_0, r_n/3)} \mu(B(y, r_n)) d\mu(y) \geq \frac{2\varepsilon_n^2}{9}.$$

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \underline{\dim}_c \mu &\leq \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\log r_n} \log \int_X \mu(B(y, r_n)) d\mu(y) \\ &\leq \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log(2\varepsilon_n^2/9)}{\log r_n} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{2 \log n - \log(2/9)}{n \log n} = 0, \quad \square \end{aligned}$$

Recall that for given  $\mu \in \mathcal{M}$  we define the support of  $\mu$  by the formula

$$\text{supp } \mu = \{x \in X : \mu(B(x, r)) > 0 \text{ for every } r > 0\}.$$

**Lemma 4.** *Assume that  $\underline{\dim}(B(x_0, a)) > d$  for some point  $x_0 \in X$  and some constants  $a, d > 0$ . Then there exists  $C > 0$  such that for every  $r > 0$  there exists a measure  $\mu_r$  with  $\text{supp } \mu_r \subset B(x_0, a)$  such that*

$$\mu_r(B(x, r)) \leq Cr^d \text{ for every } x \in X. \tag{4}$$

PROOF. Since  $\underline{\dim} B(x_0, a) > d$ , by virtue of Remark 1, there is  $0 < r_0 < 1$  such that  $M(B(x_0, a), r) > r^{-d}$  for every  $0 < r \leq r_0$ . Put  $C = 2^d/r_0^d$ . If  $r \geq r_0/2$  then  $Cr^d \geq 1$  and (4) is obviously true for every measure  $\mu \in \mathcal{M}$ .

Suppose now that  $0 < r < r_0/2$ . Let  $m$  be an integer such that

$$M(B(x_0, a), 2r) \geq m > (2r)^{-d}.$$

By the definition of  $M(B(x_0, a), 2r)$  we can find in the ball  $B(x_0, a)$  the points  $x_1, \dots, x_m$  such that  $\rho(x_i, x_j) \geq 2r$  for  $i, j \in \{1, \dots, m\}$ ,  $i \neq j$ . Set  $\mu_r = \frac{1}{m} \sum_{i=1}^m \delta_{x_i}$ , where  $\delta_{x_i}$  denotes the delta Dirac measure supported at point  $x_i$ . Since for arbitrary  $x \in X$  the ball  $B(x, r)$  contains at most one point from the set  $\{x_1, \dots, x_m\}$ , we have  $\mu_r(B(x, r)) \leq \frac{1}{m} < (2r)^d \leq Cr^d$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 5.** *Assume that there is a constant  $d > 0$  such that  $\underline{\dim} B(x, a) > d$  for every  $x \in X$  and every  $a > 0$ . Then the set  $\mathcal{M}_d = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu \geq d\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ .*

PROOF. Let  $\{x_1, x_2, \dots\}$  be a dense subset of  $X$ . Fix  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and define

$$a_n = \min \left\{ \frac{1}{3} \rho(x_i, x_j) : \text{for } 1 \leq i < j \leq n \right\}.$$

According to Lemma 4, for every  $i \in \{1, \dots, n\}$  there exists a constant  $C_i$  such that for every  $r > 0$  there exists a measure  $\mu_{r,i}$  with  $\text{supp } \mu_{r,i} \subset B(x_i, a_n)$  such that  $\mu_{r,i}(B(x, r)) \leq C_i r^d$  for every  $x \in X$ . Set

$$\bar{C}_n = \max\{n, C_1, \dots, C_n\}, r_n = 2^{-\bar{C}_n} \text{ and } \delta_n = r_n^{d+1}.$$

Now fix  $r = 2r_n$  and denote by  $\mathcal{N}_n$  the set of all measures of the form

$$\nu = p_1 \mu_{r,1} + \dots + p_n \mu_{r,n},$$

where  $(p_1, \dots, p_n)$  is any sequence of non-negative numbers such that  $p_1 + \dots + p_n = 1$ . Clearly  $\nu(B(x, 2r_n)) \leq 2^d \bar{C}_n r_n^d$  for every  $\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n$  and  $x \in X$ . Let

$$\mathcal{G}_n = \bigcup_{\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n} \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : d_2(\mu, \nu) < \delta_n\}.$$

Suppose that the sets  $\mathcal{G}_n$  are constructed for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and define  $\mathcal{H} = \bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{n=m}^{\infty} \mathcal{G}_n$ . Clearly  $\mathcal{H}$  is a residual subset of  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ . Let  $\mu \in \mathcal{H}$ . For every  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  there are  $n \geq m$  and  $\nu \in \mathcal{N}_n$  such that  $d_2(\mu, \nu) < \delta_n$ . Fix a point  $y \in X$  and let  $f$  be the function given by (1) with  $y$  in the place of  $x_0$ . Since  $d_2(\mu, \nu) < \delta_n$  we have

$$r\mu(B(y, r)) \leq \int_X f(x) d\mu(x) \leq \delta_n + \int_X f(x) d\nu(x) \leq \delta_n + r\nu(B(y, 2r)). \tag{5}$$

Substituting  $r = r_n$  in (5) we obtain

$$\mu(B(y, r_n)) \leq \frac{\delta_n}{r_n} + \nu(B(y, 2r_n)) \leq r_n^d + 2^d \bar{C}_n r_n^d < 2^{d+1} \bar{C}_n r_n^d = 2^{d+1} \bar{C}_n 2^{-\bar{C}_n d}.$$

This implies that

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\log r_n} \log \int_X \mu(B(x, r_n)) d\mu(x) \geq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{d + 1 + \log_2 \bar{C}_n - \bar{C}_n d}{-\bar{C}_n} = d,$$

which completes the proof. □

**Remark 2.** Assume there exist sequences  $(a_n)$  and  $(r_n)$  of positive numbers convergent to zero such that for each  $x \in X$  we have  $M(B(x, a_n), r_n) \geq r_n^{-d}$  for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . An argument similar to that of the proofs of Lemmas 4 and 5 shows that the set  $\mathcal{M}_d = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu \geq d\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ .

**Lemma 6.** Let  $K$  be a subset of  $X$  and let  $\mu$  be a probability Borel measure on  $X$  such that  $\mu(K) > 0$ . Then  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu \leq \overline{\dim} K$ .

PROOF. Suppose  $K$  is relatively compact. (Otherwise there is nothing to prove.) First assume that  $\text{supp } \mu \subset K$ . Given an  $r > 0$  we denote by  $N = N(K, r)$  the least number of balls of radius  $r$  which cover the set  $K$ . Now, denote by  $x_1, \dots, x_N$  the centers of the balls of such a covering. Let  $A_1, \dots, A_N$  be a pairwise disjoint measurable covering of  $K$  such that  $A_i \subset B(x_i, r)$  for  $i = 1, \dots, N$ . If  $x \in A_i$ , then  $A_i \subset B(x, 2r)$ . Consequently

$$\int_X \mu(B(x, 2r)) d\mu(x) = \sum_{i=1}^N \int_{A_i} \mu(B(x, 2r)) d\mu(x) \geq \sum_{i=1}^N \mu(A_i)^2.$$

Using the Buniakowski-Schwarz inequality

$$\left( \sum_{i=1}^N \mu(A_i)^2 \right) \left( \sum_{i=1}^N 1^2 \right) \geq \left( \sum_{i=1}^N \mu(A_i) \right)^2$$

we obtain

$$\int_X \mu(B(x, 2r)) d\mu(x) \geq \frac{1}{N}. \tag{6}$$

Let  $(r_n)$  be a sequence of positive numbers convergent to zero. Then from (6) it follows that

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\log 2r_n} \log \int_X \mu(B(x, 2r_n)) d\mu(x) \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log N(K, r_n)}{\log(1/r_n)} \leq \overline{\dim} K.$$

Thus  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu \leq \overline{\dim} K$  for every  $\mu$  such that  $\text{supp } \mu \subset K$ .

Now take an arbitrary  $\mu$  in  $\mathcal{M}$  such that  $\mu(K) > 0$ . Set  $\nu(A) = \frac{\mu(A \cap K)}{\mu(K)}$ ,  $A \in \mathcal{B}$ . Since  $\mu(A) \geq \mu(K)\nu(A)$ , we have

$$\int_X \mu(B(x, r)) d\mu(x) \geq \mu^2(K) \int_X \nu(B(x, r)) d\nu(x). \tag{7}$$

By (7) and the fact that  $\text{supp } \nu \subset K$  we have

$$\overline{\dim}_c \mu \leq \limsup_{r \rightarrow 0} \frac{\log \mu^2(K)}{\log r} + \overline{\dim}_c \nu = \overline{\dim}_c \nu \leq \overline{\dim} K. \quad \square$$

**Lemma 7.** *Assume that  $\overline{\dim} B(x_0, a) < d$  for some point  $x_0 \in X$  and some constants  $a, d > 0$ . Then the set  $\mathcal{M}^d = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu \geq d\}$  is nowhere dense in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ .*

PROOF. Let  $\mathcal{D}$  be the set of all probability measures  $\nu$  such that  $\nu(B(x_0, \frac{a}{2})) > 0$ . Clearly the set  $\mathcal{D}$  is dense in  $\mathcal{M}$ . If  $\nu \in \mathcal{D}$ , then let  $\delta(\nu) = \frac{1}{4}a\nu(B(x_0, \frac{a}{2}))$ . The set

$$\mathcal{G} = \bigcup_{\nu \in \mathcal{D}} \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : d_2(\mu, \nu) < \delta(\nu)\}$$

is open and dense in  $\mathcal{M}$ . We claim that  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu < d$  for every  $\mu \in \mathcal{G}$ . Indeed, let  $\mu \in \mathcal{G}$  and  $\nu \in \mathcal{D}$  be such that  $d_2(\mu, \nu) < \delta(\nu)$ . Taking a function  $f$ , defined by (1) with  $r = a/2$ , we have

$$\frac{a}{2}\mu(B(x_0, a)) \geq \int_X f d\mu \geq \int_X f d\nu - \delta(\nu) \geq \frac{a}{2}\nu(B(x_0, \frac{a}{2})) - \delta(\nu) > 0.$$

According to Lemma 6 we have  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu < d$ . This implies that the set  $\mathcal{M}^d$  is nowhere dense in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ . □

PROOF OF THEOREM 1. The statement (a) of Theorem 1 follows from Lemma 2. The statement (b) follows from Lemma 3. According to Lemma 5 and Lemma 7, for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  the sets

$$\mathcal{M}_{\alpha - \frac{1}{n}} = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu \geq \alpha - \frac{1}{n}\} \text{ and } \mathcal{M}^{\beta + \frac{1}{n}} = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu < \beta + \frac{1}{n}\}$$

are residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ . From this and the equality

$$\mathcal{M}_\alpha^\beta = \bigcap_{n=1}^\infty \left( \mathcal{M}_{\alpha - \frac{1}{n}} \cap \mathcal{M}^{\beta + \frac{1}{n}} \right)$$

the statement (c) follows. The proof of Theorem 1 is completed. □

### 4 Examples

**Example 1.** We construct a Cantor-like set  $C$  such that  $\underline{\dim} C = 0$  and  $\overline{\dim} C = 1$  and such that the set  $\mathcal{M}^1 = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu = 1\}$  is residual in the space  $(\mathcal{M}, d_2)$ . Let  $(k_n)$  be a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers such that  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{k_n}{n} = 1$  and  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{k_n}{n} = \infty$ . Let  $h_0 = 1$  and  $h_n = 2^{-k_n}$  for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . We define a sequence of sets  $(C_n)$  by induction. Let  $C_0 = [0, 1]$  and if  $C_n = \bigcup_{i=1}^{2^n} [\alpha_i^n, \beta_i^n]$ , where  $\beta_i^n = \alpha_i^n + h_n \leq \alpha_{i+1}^n$ ,

then  $C_{n+1} = \bigcup_{i=1}^{2^{n+1}} [\alpha_i^{n+1}, \beta_i^{n+1}]$ , where  $\alpha_{2i-1}^{n+1} = \alpha_i^n$ ,  $\beta_{2i-1}^{n+1} = \alpha_i^n + h_{n+1}$ ,  $\alpha_{2i}^{n+1} = \beta_i^n - h_{n+1}$  and  $\beta_{2i}^{n+1} = \beta_i^n$ . Let  $C = \bigcap_{n=0}^{\infty} C_n$ . From the definitions of entropy dimensions it follows easily that  $\underline{\dim} C = 0$  and  $\overline{\dim} C = 1$ . Fix  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  be such that  $k_m \leq \frac{m-1-n}{1-\varepsilon}$ . Set  $a_n = h_n$  and  $r_n = h_m$ . Then, for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , we have

$$M(B(x, a_n), r_n) \geq 2^{m-1-n} \geq 2^{(1-\varepsilon)k_m} = r_n^{\varepsilon-1}.$$

According to Remark 2 the set  $\mathcal{M}^{1-\varepsilon} = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \overline{\dim}_c \mu \geq 1 - \varepsilon\}$  is residual. Since  $\varepsilon > 0$  is arbitrary and  $\mathcal{M}^1 = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathcal{M}^{1-1/n}$ , it follows that the set  $\mathcal{M}^1$  is residual.

**Example 2.** Now we construct a set  $X \subset \mathbb{R}$  such that  $\overline{\dim} B(x, r) = 1$  for all  $x \in X$  and  $r > 0$  but  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu = 0$  for  $\mu$  from some open and dense subset  $\mathcal{G}$  of  $\mathcal{M}$ . Let  $(k_n)$  and  $(k'_n)$  be two strictly increasing sequences of positive integers such that

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{k_n}{n} = 1, \quad \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{k'_n}{n} = 1, \tag{8}$$

and

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\max(k_n, k'_n)}{n} = \infty. \tag{9}$$

As in Example 1 we construct Cantor-like sets  $C$  and  $C'$  corresponding to the sequences  $(k_n)$  and  $(k'_n)$ , respectively. Let  $X = C \cup (C' + 2)$ , where  $C' + 2 = \{x + 2 : x \in C'\}$ . From (8) it follows that  $\overline{\dim} B(x, r) = 1$  for all  $x \in X$  and  $r > 0$ . Set

$$\mathcal{G} = \{\mu \in \mathcal{M} : \mu(C) > 0 \text{ and } \mu(C' + 2) > 0\}.$$

Then obviously the set  $\mathcal{G}$  is open and dense in  $\mathcal{M}$ . Let  $\mu \in \mathcal{G}$ . From (6) applied to the measures  $\mu_1(A) = \frac{\mu(A \cap C)}{\mu(C)}$  and  $\mu_2(A) = \frac{\mu(A \cap (C' + 2))}{\mu(C' + 2)}$  it follows that

$$\int_X \mu(B(x, 2r)) d\mu(x) \geq \frac{\mu^2(C)}{N(C, r)} + \frac{\mu^2(C' + 2)}{N(C' + 2, r)}.$$

This implies that

$$\frac{1}{\log 2r} \log \int_X \mu(B(x, 2r)) d\mu(x) \leq \min \left\{ \frac{\log \mu^2(C) - \log N(C, r)}{\log 2r}, \frac{\log \mu^2(C' + 2) - \log N(C' + 2, r)}{\log 2r} \right\}$$

and consequently

$$\overline{\dim}_c \mu \leq \limsup_{r \rightarrow 0} \min \left\{ \frac{\log N(C, r)}{\log(1/r)}, \frac{\log N(C', r)}{\log(1/r)} \right\}. \quad (10)$$

Now, for given  $r \in (0, 1)$  we set  $n(r) = \min\{n : 2^{-kn} \leq r\}$  and  $n'(r) = \min\{n : 2^{-k'n} \leq r\}$ . Then  $N(C, r) \leq 2^{n(r)}$  and  $N(C', r) \leq 2^{n'(r)}$ . Thus, for  $\mu \in \mathcal{G}$ , we have

$$\overline{\dim}_c \mu \leq \limsup_{r \rightarrow 0} \frac{\min\{n(r), n'(r)\}}{\log(1/r)}. \quad (11)$$

By the definitions of  $n(r)$  and  $n'(r)$  we have

$$\log(1/r) \geq \max\{k_{n(r)-1}, k'_{n'(r)-1}\}. \quad (12)$$

From (11), (12) and (9) it follows that  $\overline{\dim}_c \mu = 0$ .

## References

- [1] W. Chin, B. Hunt and J. A. Yorke, *Correlation dimension for iterated function systems*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., **349** (1997), 1783–1796.
- [2] P. M. Gruber, *Dimension and structure of typical compact sets, continua and curves*, Mh. Math., **108** (1989), 149–164.
- [3] C. A. Guerin and M. Holschneider, *On equivalent definitions of the correlation dimension for a probability measure*, J. Statist. Phys., **86** (1997), 707–720.
- [4] A. Manning and K. Simon, *A short existence proof for correlation dimension*, J. Statist. Phys., **90** (1998), 1047–1049.
- [5] Ya. B. Pesin, *On rigorous mathematical definitions of correlation dimension and generalized spectrum for dimensions*, J. Stat. Phys., **71** (1993), 529–547.
- [6] Ya. B. Pesin and A. Tempelman, *Correlation dimension of measures invariant under group actions*, Random Comput. Dynam., **3** (1995), 137–156.
- [7] Ya. B. Pesin and H. Weiss, *The multifractal analysis of Gibbs measures: motivation, mathematical foundation, and examples*, Chaos, **7** (1997), 89–106.

- [8] Ya. B. Pesin, *Dimension Theory in Dynamical Systems*, Chicago Lecture in Math. Series, Chicago, 1997.
- [9] I. Procaccia, P. Grassberger and H.G.E. Hentschel, *On the characterization of chaotic motions*, Dynamical systems and chaos (Sitges/Barcelona, 1982), Lecture Notes in Phys., **179**, Springer, Berlin (1983), 212–222.
- [10] T. D. Sauer and J. A. Yorke, *Are the dimensions of a set and its image equal under typical smooth functions*, Ergodic Theory Dynam. Systems, **17** (1997), 941–956.
- [11] K. Simon and B. Solomyak, *Correlation dimension for self-similar Cantor sets with overlaps*, Fund. Math., **155** (1998), 293–300.