Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic
Volume XVI, Number 4, October 1975
NDJFAM

IN DEFENSE OF COPI

YUDIT ROSENBERG

In a recent note in this journal ("A correction in Copi's account of Boolean normal forms," vol. XIV (1973), p. 288), Alex Blum maintains that in Copi's account of Boolean normal forms (I. M. Copi, *Symbolic Logic*, 3rd edition, Macmillan, New York and London (1967), pp. 329-331):

(a) 'p .- p' and 'p v- p' are both in conjunctive and disjunctive normal form,

and hence

(b) 'p .- p' and 'p v- p' are thus both contradictory and both tautologous.

However 'p .- p'/'p v- p' is not in disjunctive/conjunctive Boolean normal form, for it is not true that "every disjunct/conjunct contains exactly one occurrence of every variable (either the variable or its negation), . . ." (*Ibid.*, pp. 329-330). Furthermore (b) is false, for according to Copi

(iii) A statement form containing n variables is contradictory/is a tautology, if and only if it contains 2^n conjuncts/disjuncts. (*Ibid.*, p. 331).

and 'p .- p'/'p v- p' does not contain 2^n disjuncts/conjuncts.

Bar-Ilan University
Ramat-Gan, Israel

Received June 28, 1973