

## The subsequentiality of product spaces

By Tsugunori NOGURA

(Received Dec. 10, 1977)

(Revised May 12, 1978)

### §1. Introduction.

A space is said to be a *subsequential space* if it can be embedded as a subspace of a sequential space. The closed image of a metric space is shortly said to be a *Lašnev space* (cf. [4], [5]).

Professor K. Nagami posed the following two problems.

1. Can each Lašnev space be embedded in a countably compact sequential regular space?

2. Is finite (or countable) product of Lašnev spaces subsequential?

This paper gives a negative answer to the first problem and a partial answer to the second as follows:

1. Any Lašnev space, which is not metrizable, cannot be embedded in any countably compact regular space with countable tightness.

2. Assuming the continuum hypothesis (CH), there exist regular Fréchet spaces  $X$  and  $Y$  such that  $X \times Y$  is not subsequential.

Each Fréchet space is subsequential. Therefore the second result shows that even a finite product of subsequential spaces is not subsequential (cf. [8, p. 179]).

In this paper spaces are assumed to be  $T_1$  and maps to be continuous onto.

The author thanks to Professor K. Nagami for his valuable suggestions.

### §2. Theorems.

DEFINITION 1 ([1, p. 954]). A space  $X$  has countable tightness if it has the following property: If  $A \subset X$  and  $x \in Cl_x A$ , then  $x \in Cl_x B$  for some countable  $B \subset A$ .

Let  $R = \{0\} \cup \{1/n; n \in \omega_0\}$  be a convergent sequence. Let  $S$  be the disjoint union of a sequence  $\{R(n); n \in \omega_0\}$  of copies of  $R$ , let  $A = \{0(n) \in R(n); 0(n) = 0, n \in \omega_0\}$ , and let  $T = S/A$ , the quotient space obtained from  $S$  by identifying  $A$  to a point  $q$ .

THEOREM 1. *T cannot be embedded in any countably compact regular space with countable tightness.*

PROOF. Suppose there exists a countably compact regular space  $X$  with countable tightness such that  $X = Cl_X T$ . Let  $U$  be an arbitrary open neighborhood of  $q$  in  $X$ . Let  $V$  be an open set in  $X$  such that

$$q \in V \subset Cl_X V \subset U.$$

Pick  $s(n) \in V \cap (R(n) - 0(n))$  for each  $n$ . Then, since  $X$  is countably compact,

$$Cl_X \{s(n); n \in \omega_0\} - \{s(n); n \in \omega_0\} \neq \emptyset,$$

$$Cl_X \{s(n); n \in \omega_0\} - \{s(n); n \in \omega_0\} \subset Cl_X V \cap (X - T) \subset U.$$

This shows  $q \in Cl_X (X - T)$ . Since  $X$  has countable tightness, there exists a sequence  $\{x(n); n \in \omega_0\} \subset X - T$  such that

$$q \in Cl_X \{x(n); n \in \omega_0\}.$$

Let  $\{U(n); n \in \omega_0\}$  be a sequence of open neighborhoods of  $q$  in  $X$  such that

$$Cl_X U(n+1) \subset U(n),$$

$$x(n) \in Cl_X U(n).$$

Put

$$A(n) = U(n) \cap (R(n) - \{0(n)\}).$$

Then  $\cup \{A(n); n \in \omega_0\} \cup \{q\}$  is an open neighborhood of  $q$  in  $T$ . Let  $W$  be an open neighborhood of  $q$  in  $X$  such that

$$W \cap T = \cup \{A(n); n \in \omega_0\} \cup \{q\}.$$

We will show that  $\{x(n); n \in \omega_0\} \cap W = \emptyset$ , which will contradict the fact that  $q \in Cl_X \{x(n); n \in \omega_0\}$ . By construction of  $W$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} W \cap T &= \cup \{A(n); n \in \omega_0\} \cup \{q\} \\ &= \bigcup_{i=1}^{n-1} \{A(i) - U(n)\} \cup (U(n) \cap T). \end{aligned}$$

Here  $A(i) \cup \{q\}$  is a convergent sequence and  $q \in U(n)$ . Therefore  $A(i) - U(n)$  is a finite set for each  $i \leq n-1$ . Since  $x(n) \in Cl_X U(n)$ ,  $x(n) \in Cl_X (W \cap T)$ . This shows  $\{x(n); n \in \omega_0\} \cap W = \emptyset$  since  $T$  is dense in  $X$ . Now our proof is completed.

THEOREM 2. *Let  $X$  be a proper Lašnev space, i.e. a Lašnev space which is not metrizable. Then  $X$  contains a closed set which is a copy of  $T$ .*

PROOF. Let  $f: M \rightarrow X$  be a closed map where  $M$  is a metric space. By Morita-Hanai-Stone's theorem [7] there exists a point  $p \in X$  such that  $\partial f^{-1}(p)$

is not compact. Let  $\{q(n); n \in \omega_0\}$  be a discrete set of points in  $\partial f^{-1}(p)$  and  $\{U(n); n \in \omega_0\}$  a discrete open collection of  $M$  with  $q(n) \in U(n)$  for each  $n \in \omega_0$ . Let  $Q(n) = \{q(n, m); m \in \omega_0\}$  be a convergent sequence of points in  $U(n) - f^{-1}(p)$  whose limit point is  $q(n)$ . The sequence  $\{f(Q(n)); n \in \omega_0\}$  has the following property: For each  $k \in \omega_0$  there exists  $n (> k)$  such that

$$f(Q(n)) - \bigcup_{i=1}^k f(Q(i)) \text{ is infinite.}$$

Assume contrary, i.e. there exists some  $k \in \omega_0$  such that

$$f(Q(n)) - \bigcup_{i=1}^k f(Q(i)) \text{ is finite for each } n > k.$$

Then

$$f^{-1}\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^k f(Q(i))\right) \cap Q(n) \text{ is infinite for each } n > k.$$

Therefore there exists  $q(n, m(n)) \in f^{-1}\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^k f(Q(i))\right) \cap Q(n)$  such that  $f(q(n, m(n))) \neq f(q(j, m(j)))$  for  $n \neq j$ . The set  $\{q(n, m(n)); n \in \omega_0\}$  is closed in  $M$  but  $p \in Cl_X \{f(q(n, m(n))); n \in \omega_0\}$ , which is a contradiction.

Put

$$L(n) = f(Q(n)) - \bigcup_{i=1}^{n-1} f(Q(i)).$$

Put

$$n_1 = \min \{n > 1; f(Q(n)) - f(Q(1)) \text{ is infinite}\}.$$

Then

$$L(n_1) = \{f(Q(n_1)) - f(Q(1))\} - \bigcup_{k=2}^{n_1-1} \{f(Q(k)) - f(Q(1))\}.$$

Since  $\bigcup_{k=2}^{n_1-1} \{f(Q(k)) - f(Q(1))\}$  is finite,  $L(n_1)$  is infinite. Put

$$n_2 = \min \{n > n_1; f(Q(n)) - \bigcup_{i=1}^{n_1} f(Q(i)) \text{ is infinite}\}.$$

Continuing in this manner, we obtain a sequence  $\{L(n_k); k \in \omega_0\}$  such that  $L(n_k)$  is an infinite set for each  $k \in \omega_0$  and such that

$$L(n_k) \cap L(n_j) = \emptyset \text{ for } k \neq j.$$

Put

$$L = \bigcup \{L(n_k); k \in \omega_0\} \cup \{p\}.$$

Note that every point of  $L(n_k)$  is isolated in  $L$  for each  $k \in \omega_0$ . Now it is easy to show that the set  $L$  is closed and homeomorphic to  $T$ . The proof is completed.

**COROLLARY 1.** *Let  $X$  be a proper Lašnev space. Then  $X$  cannot be embedded in a countably compact regular spaces with countable tightness.*

PROOF. Suppose  $X$  can be embedded in a countably compact regular space  $Y$  with countable tightness. Let  $L$  be a copy of  $T$  contained in  $X$ . Then  $Cl_Y L$  is a countably compact regular space with countable tightness which contradicts Theorem 1. The proof is completed.

Let  $N$  denote the natural numbers. A countable space with one non-isolated point will be denoted by  $N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\}$ . Here  $\{\mathfrak{G}\}$  is the non-isolated point, and its filter of neighborhoods restricted to  $N$  is the elements of  $\mathfrak{G}$ . We denote by  $\beta N$  the Stone-Čech compactification of  $N$ . For a filter  $\mathfrak{G} = \{G_\alpha; \alpha \in A\}$ , we denote  $G = \bigcap \{Cl_{\beta N} G_\alpha; \alpha \in A\}$  and say  $G$  is the realization of  $\mathfrak{G}$ . For each  $M \subset N$ , we denote  $M^* = Cl_{\beta N} M - M$ .

We recall some information on  $\beta N$ .

LEMMA 1 ([9, p. 414]). *A set  $U$  is open-closed in  $N^*$  if and only if there exists  $M \subset N$  for which  $U = M^*$ .*

LEMMA 2 ([9, p. 414]).  *$G^* \subset H^*$  if and only if  $G - H$  is a finite set, where  $G$  and  $H$  are subsets of  $N$ .*

DEFINITION 2. Let  $X$  be a space. A point  $x \in X$  is said to be a  $P$ -point of  $X$ , if the intersection of each sequence of neighborhoods of  $x$  contains a neighborhood of  $x$ .

LEMMA 3 ([9, p. 415], CH). *There exist  $P$ -points in  $N^*$ .*

DEFINITION 3 ([2, p. 376]). A space  $X$  is said to be an  $F$ -space if each disjoint two cozero sets of  $X$  are completely separated in  $X$ .

LEMMA 4 ([2, p. 376]).  *$N^*$  is an  $F$ -space.*

Lemmas 5, 6 and 7 below are well-known and easy to prove, so we omit the proofs.

LEMMA 5. *Let  $G$  be a closed subset of  $N^*$ . Then there exists a filter  $\mathfrak{G}$  on  $N$  whose realization is  $G$ .*

LEMMA 6. *Let  $\mathfrak{G} = \{G_\alpha; \alpha \in A\}$  be a free filter whose realization is  $G$ . Then  $\{G_\alpha^*; \alpha \in A\}$  is a neighborhood base of  $G$  in  $N^*$ .*

Let  $\mathfrak{G}$  be a filter. Then we say that  $\mathfrak{G}$  determines an ultrafilter if the realization of  $\mathfrak{G}$  is a singleton in  $N^*$ .

LEMMA 7. *Let  $\mathfrak{G}$  be a filter on  $N$ . Then the following are equivalent:*

- i)  $\mathfrak{G}$  determines an ultrafilter.
- ii) *There exists an ultrafilter  $\mathfrak{H}$  such that for each  $H \in \mathfrak{H}$  there exists  $G \in \mathfrak{G}$  such that  $G - H$  is finite.*

DEFINITION 4 ([3]). A space  $X$  is said to be Fréchet if, whenever  $x \in Cl_X A$  for some  $A \subset X$ , there exists a sequence  $\{x(n); n \in \omega_0\} \subset A$  such that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x(n) = x$ .

LEMMA 8 ([6, Theorem 1]). *Let  $\mathfrak{G}$  be a free filter on  $N$  and let  $G$  be the realization of  $\mathfrak{G}$ . Then  $N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\}$  is a Fréchet space if and only if  $G = Cl_{\beta N}(\text{Int}_{N^*} G)$ .*

LEMMA 9 (CH). *Let  $p$  be a  $P$ -point of  $N^*$ . Then there exists a filter  $\{V_\alpha; \alpha \in \omega_1\}$  on  $N$  such that*

- i)  $V_\alpha^* \sqsubseteq V_\beta^*$  for  $\alpha \geq \beta$ ,
- ii)  $\{V_\alpha^*; \alpha \in \omega_1\}$  is a neighborhood base of  $p$  in  $N^*$ .

PROOF. Let  $\mathfrak{U} = \{U_\alpha; \alpha \in \omega_1\}$  be the filter on  $N$  such that the realization of  $\mathfrak{U}$  is  $p$ .

Put

$$V_0 = U_0.$$

Assume  $\{V_\beta; \beta < \alpha\}$  is already constructed as follows:

$$V_\gamma^* \sqsubseteq V_\delta^* \text{ for any } \delta < \gamma < \alpha,$$

$$V_\gamma^* \subset U_\gamma^* \text{ for any } \gamma < \alpha.$$

Since  $p$  is a  $P$ -point,

$$p \in \text{Int}_{N^*}(\bigcap \{V_\beta^*; \beta < \alpha\}) \cap U_\alpha^*.$$

Take  $V_\alpha \subset N$  such that

$$p \in V_\alpha^* \sqsubseteq U_\alpha^* \cap \text{Int}_{N^*}(\bigcap \{V_\beta; \beta < \alpha\}).$$

It is easy to show that  $\{V_\alpha; \alpha \in \omega_1\}$  satisfies the conditions i) and ii). The proof is completed.

LEMMA 10 (CH). *There exist two filters  $\mathfrak{F}$  and  $\mathfrak{G}$  such that*

- i)  $N \cup \{\mathfrak{F}\}$  and  $N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\}$  are Fréchet spaces.
- ii)  $\mathfrak{H} = \{F \cap G; F \in \mathfrak{F}, G \in \mathfrak{G}\}$  determines the ultrafilter.

PROOF. Let  $p$  be a  $P$ -point of  $N^*$  and let  $\{V_\alpha; \alpha \in \omega_1\}$  be the filter in Lemma 9.

For any  $\alpha \in \omega_1$ , we choose  $W_{\alpha_1}$  and  $W_{\alpha_2}$ , subsets of  $N$ , such that

$$W_{\alpha_1}^* \neq \emptyset, W_{\alpha_2}^* \neq \emptyset,$$

$$W_{\alpha_1}^* \cap W_{\alpha_2}^* = \emptyset,$$

$$W_{\alpha_1}^* \cup W_{\alpha_2}^* \subset V_\alpha^* - V_{\alpha+1}^*.$$

$\{W_{\alpha_1}^*; \alpha \in \omega_1\}$  and  $\{W_{\alpha_2}^*; \alpha \in \omega_1\}$  have the following properties:

- (1)  $Cl_{\beta N}(\bigcup \{W_{\beta_1}^*; \beta < \alpha\}) \cap V_\alpha^* = \emptyset, \alpha \in \omega_1,$
- (2)  $Cl_{\beta N}(\bigcup \{W_{\beta_2}^*; \beta < \alpha\}) \cap V_\alpha^* = \emptyset, \alpha \in \omega_1,$
- (3)  $p \in Cl_{\beta N}(\bigcup \{W_{\alpha_1}^*; \alpha \in \omega_1\}) \cap Cl_{\beta N}(\bigcup \{W_{\alpha_2}^*; \alpha \in \omega_1\}).$

Put

$$(4) \quad F = Cl_{\beta N}(\bigcup \{W_{\alpha_1}^*; \alpha \in \omega_1\}),$$

$$(5) \quad G = Cl_{\beta N}(\bigcup \{W_{\alpha_2}^*; \alpha \in \omega_1\}).$$

Let  $\mathfrak{F} = \{F_\xi; \xi \in A\}$  and  $\mathfrak{G} = \{G_\eta; \eta \in B\}$  be two filters whose realizations are  $F$

and  $G$ , respectively. Then  $N \cup \{\mathfrak{F}\}$  and  $N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\}$  are both Fréchet by Lemma 8. We will show that  $\mathfrak{D} = \{F_\xi \cap G_\eta; \xi \in A, \eta \in B\}$  determines an ultrafilter. Let  $D \in \mathfrak{p}$  be any element of the ultrafilter  $\mathfrak{p}$ . Then we will show that there exist  $F_\xi \in \mathfrak{F}$  and  $G_\eta \in \mathfrak{G}$  such that

$$\begin{aligned} F_\xi \cap G_\eta - D & \text{ is finite,} \\ \mathfrak{p} & \in F_\xi^* \cap G_\eta^*. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $D^*$  is open in  $N^*$  containing  $\mathfrak{p}$ , then there exists  $V_\gamma \subset N$  such that

$$(6) \quad \mathfrak{p} \in V_\gamma^* \subset D^*.$$

$\cup \{W_{\beta_1}^*; \beta < \gamma\}$  and  $\cup \{W_{\beta_2}^*; \beta < \gamma\}$  are cozero sets in  $N^*$ . Therefore, by Lemma 4,

$$Cl_{\beta N}(\cup \{W_{\beta_1}^*; \beta < \gamma\}) \cap Cl_{\beta N}(\cup \{W_{\beta_2}^*; \beta < \gamma\}) = \emptyset.$$

By Lemmas 1 and 6, there exist  $K$  and  $L$  such that

$$(7) \quad Cl_{\beta N}(\cup \{W_{\beta_1}^*; \beta < \gamma\}) \subset K^* \subset N^* - V_\gamma^*,$$

$$(8) \quad Cl_{\beta N}(\cup \{W_{\beta_2}^*; \beta < \gamma\}) \subset L^* \subset N^* - V_\gamma^*,$$

$$(9) \quad K^* \cap L^* = \emptyset.$$

By (1), (4) and (7),

$$F = Cl_{\beta N}(\cup \{W_{\beta_1}^*; \beta < \gamma\}) \cup Cl_{\beta N}(\cup \{W_{\beta_1}^*; \beta \geq \gamma\}) \subset K^* \cup V_\gamma^*.$$

Similarly

$$G \subset L^* \cup V_\gamma^*.$$

By Lemma 6, there exist  $F_\xi \in \mathfrak{F}$  and  $G_\eta \in \mathfrak{G}$  such that

$$F \subset F_\xi^* \subset K^* \cup V_\gamma^*,$$

$$G \subset G_\eta^* \subset L^* \cup V_\gamma^*.$$

Then, by (9),

$$\mathfrak{p} \in F \cap G \subset F_\xi^* \cap G_\eta^* \subset V_\gamma^* \subset D^*.$$

Therefore  $F_\xi \cap G_\eta - D$  is finite by Lemma 2. The proof is completed.

DEFINITION 5 ([3, p. 109]). Let  $X$  be a space. A subset  $U$  of  $X$  is said to be *sequentially open* if each sequence in  $X$  converging to a point in  $U$  is eventually in  $U$ .  $X$  is said to be a *sequential space* if each sequentially open subset of  $X$  is open.

LEMMA 11. Let  $\mathfrak{G}$  be an ultrafilter on  $N$ . Then  $N \cup \mathfrak{G}$  is not subsequential.

PROOF. Let  $X$  be a sequential space such that

$$N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\} \subset X, N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\} \text{ is dense in } X.$$

$\{\mathfrak{G}\} \in Cl_X(X - (N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\}))$  implies that there exists a sequence  $\{x(n); n \in \omega_0\}$  such that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x(n) = \{\mathfrak{G}\}$ . Let  $\{U(n); n \in \omega_0\}$  be a sequence of open sets in  $X$  such that

$$U(n) \cap U(m) = \emptyset \text{ for } n \neq m, x(n) \in U(n) \text{ for each } n \in \omega_0.$$

Put

$$A = \cup \{U(2n) \cap N; n = 1, 2, \dots\},$$

$$B = \cup \{U(2n+1) \cap N; n = 0, 1, \dots\}.$$

Then  $A \in \mathfrak{G}$  and  $B \in \mathfrak{G}$ , which is impossible since  $A \cap B = \emptyset$ . The proof is completed.

**THEOREM 3 (CH).** *There exist Fréchet spaces  $X$  and  $Y$  such that  $X \times Y$  is not subsequential.*

**PROOF.** Let  $p$  be a  $P$ -point of  $N^*$ . Let  $X = N \cup \{\mathfrak{F}\}$  and  $Y = N \cup \{\mathfrak{G}\}$  be Fréchet spaces in Lemma 10. We define  $f: N \cup \{p\} \rightarrow X \times Y$  such that

$$f(n) = (n, n),$$

$$f(p) = \{\mathfrak{F}\} \times \{\mathfrak{G}\}.$$

Then  $f$  is an embedding since

$$f^{-1}((F_\xi \times G_\eta) \cap \Delta) = F_\xi \cap G_\eta,$$

where  $\Delta = \{(n, n); n \in N\}$ .

Each subspace of subsequential space is subsequential. Therefore Lemma 11 implies that  $X \times Y$  is not subsequential. The proof is completed.

### References

- [ 1 ] A. V. Arhangel'skii, On the cardinality of bicompecta satisfying the first axiom of countability, Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR, 187 (1964), 967-970 (Russian). English Transl.: Soviet Math. Dokl., 12 (1969), 951-955.
- [ 2 ] J. Fine and L. Gillman, Extension of continuous functions in  $N^*$ , Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., 66 (1960), 376-381.
- [ 3 ] S. P. Franklin, Spaces in which sequences suffice, Fund. Math., 57 (1965), 107-115.
- [ 4 ] N. Lašnev, Continuous decompositions and closed mappings of metric spaces, Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR, 165 (1965), 756-758 (Russian). English Transl.: Soviet Math. Dokl., 6 (1965), 1504-1506.
- [ 5 ] N. Lašnev, Closed image of metric spaces, Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR, 170 (1966), 505-507 (Russian). English Transl.: Soviet Math. Dokl., 7 (1966), 1219-1221.
- [ 6 ] V. I. Malyhin, On countable space having no bicompectifications of countable tightness, Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR, 206 (1972), 1293-1296 (Russian). English Transl.: Soviet Math. Dokl., 13 (1972), 1407-1411.
- [ 7 ] K. Morita and S. Hanai, Closed mappings and metric spaces, Proc. Japan Acad., 32 (1956), 10-14.
- [ 8 ] N. Noble, Products with closed projection II, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., 160 (1971), 169-183.

- [ 9 ] W. Rudin, Homogeneity problem in the theory of Čech compactifications, Duke Math. J., 23 (1956), 409-419.

Tsugunori NOGURA  
Department of Mathematics  
Ehime University  
Bunkyo-cho, Matsuyama  
Japan