- [3] DUNFORD, N. and SCHWARTZ, J. T. (1958). Linear Operators, part I, Interscience, New York.
- [4] YOSIDA, K. and HEWITT, E. (1952). Finitely additive measures, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 72 46-66.

## A TEST FOR EQUALITY OF MEANS WHEN COVARIANCE MATRICES ARE UNEQUAL<sup>1</sup>

By T. W. Anderson

Columbia University

Let  $x_{\alpha}^{(g)}$  be an observation from the *p*-variate normal distribution  $N(\mu^{(g)}, \Sigma_g)$ ,  $\alpha = 1, \dots, N_g$ ,  $g = 1, \dots, q$ . Consider testing the null hypothesis<sup>2</sup>

(1) 
$$H: \mu^{(1)} = \cdots = \mu^{(q)}.$$

When the covariance matrices  $\Sigma_q$  are equal, the hypothesis is a form of the socalled general linear hypothesis, and a number of tests are available. (See Chapter 8 of Anderson (1958), for example.) When q=2, Bennett (1951) has extended the procedure of Scheffé (1943) to give an exact test based on Hotelling's generalized  $T^2$ . (See Section 5.6 of Anderson (1958).) In this note we extend previous procedures to q>2.

As an example, let q = 3 and  $N_1 = N_2 = N_3 = N$ , say. Let

(2) 
$$y_{\alpha} = a_1 x_{\alpha}^{(1)} + a_2 x_{\alpha}^{(2)} + a_3 x_{\alpha}^{(3)},$$
$$z_{\alpha} = b_1 x_{\alpha}^{(1)} + b_2 x_{\alpha}^{(2)} + b_3 x_{\alpha}^{(3)},$$

where  $\sum_{g=1}^{3} a_g = 0$ ,  $\sum_{g=1}^{3} b_g = 0$  and  $(a_1, a_2, a_3)$  and  $(b_1, b_2, b_3)$  are linearly independent. (In practice the indexing of the observations in each sample would be done randomly.) Then the hypothesis (1) is equivalent to the hypothesis

(3) 
$$\xi y_{\alpha} = \sum_{g=1}^{3} a_{g} \mu^{(g)} = 0, \qquad \xi z_{\alpha} = \sum_{g=1}^{3} b_{g} \mu^{(g)} = 0.$$

The covariance matrix of  $(y'_{\alpha} \quad z'_{\alpha})$  is

(4) 
$$\begin{pmatrix} a_1^2 \Sigma_1 + a_2^2 \Sigma_2 + a_3^2 \Sigma_3 & a_1 b_1 \Sigma_1 + a_2 b_2 \Sigma_2 + a_3 b_3 \Sigma_3 \\ a_1 b_1 \Sigma_1 + a_2 b_2 \Sigma_2 + a_3 b_3 \Sigma_3 & b_1^2 \Sigma_1 + b_2^2 \Sigma_2 + b_3^2 \Sigma_3 \end{pmatrix}.$$

The hypothesis (3) can be tested by a  $T^2$ -statistic

(5) 
$$T^{2} = N(\bar{y}'\,\bar{z}')S^{-1}\begin{pmatrix} \bar{y}\\ \bar{z} \end{pmatrix},$$

Received December 4, 1962.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Sponsored in part by the Office of Naval Research under Contract Number Nonr-266 (33), Project Number NR 042-034. Reproduction in whole or in part is permitted for any purpose of the United States Government.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Dr. Charles V. Riche called this problem to my attention.

where

(6) 
$$S = \frac{1}{N-1} \sum_{\alpha=1}^{N} \begin{pmatrix} y_{\alpha} - \bar{y} \\ z_{\alpha} - \bar{z} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} y_{\alpha} - \bar{y} \\ z_{\alpha} - \bar{z} \end{pmatrix}'$$

and  $\bar{y}$  and  $\bar{z}$  are the sample mean vectors. When the null hypothesis is true,  $(N-2p)T^2/(N-1)2p$  has the F-distribution with 2p and N-2p degrees of freedom.

It does not matter what linear combinations (2) are used for the test because the  $T^2$ -statistic is invariant with regard to linear transformations; indeed, the linear combinations may be chosen as some contrasts of special interest. The fact that the test is based on a sample covariance matrix S with only N-1 degrees of freedom is a characteristic also of the case q=2, for which Scheffé (1943) showed that this was the maximum number of degrees of freedom for a t-test when p=1. Here N must be greater than 2p. This extension to q=3 neglects the fact that the off-diagonal submatrices in (4) are symmetric; if such symmetry is imposed on the estimate of (4), the resulting test criterion will not be  $T^2$  and may not have a distribution simply related to the F-distribution.

For any q > 3 with equal  $N_q(2)$  may be replaced by any q - 1 linearly independent linear combinations, the coefficients of each summing to 0,

(7) 
$$y_{\alpha}^{(i)} = \sum_{g=1}^{q} a_{g}^{(i)} x_{\alpha}^{(g)}, \qquad i = 1, \dots, q-1, \quad \alpha = 1, \dots, N.$$

A  $T^2$ -statistic may be constructed from the resulting N vectors of (q-1)p components. If not all  $N_g$  are equal, suppose  $N_1$  to be the smallest; define

$$y_{\alpha}^{(i)} = a_{1}^{(i)} x_{\alpha}^{(1)} + \sum_{g=2}^{q} a_{g}^{(i)} (N_{1}/N_{g})^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$(8) \cdot \left[ x_{\alpha}^{(g)} - (1/N_{1}) \sum_{\beta=1}^{N_{1}} x_{\beta}^{(g)} + (N_{1}N_{g})^{-\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{\beta=1}^{N_{g}} x_{\beta}^{(g)} \right], \quad \alpha = 1, \dots, N_{1}.$$

Then

(9) 
$$\bar{y}^{(i)} = \sum_{g=1}^{N} a_g^{(i)} \bar{x}^{(g)},$$

and the sample covariance matrix is computed from  $y_{\alpha}^{(i)}$ . (See Section 5.6 of Anderson (1958) for details.)

## REFERENCES

Anderson, T. W. (1958). An Introduction to Multivariate Statistical Analysis. Wiley, New York.

Bennett, B. M. (1951). Note on a solution of the generalized Behrens-Fisher problem.

Ann. Inst. Statist. Math. Tokyo 2 87-90.

Scheffé, Henry (1943). On solutions of the Behrens-Fisher problem based on the t-distribution. Ann. Math. Statist. 14 35-44.