

BIHARMONIC AND QUASIHARMONIC DEGENERACY

BY LUNG OCK CHUNG, LEO SARIO AND CECILIA WANG

Among the vast complex of problems on inclusion relations between biharmonic and quasiharmonic null classes of Riemannian manifolds, we consider in the present paper perhaps the most intriguing case: Are there inclusion relations between $O_{H^2C}^N$ and $O_{QL^p}^N$? Here H^2, C, Q, L^p are the classes of functions which are nonharmonic biharmonic, bounded Dirichlet finite, quasiharmonic, or of finite L^p norm, respectively; a function u is biharmonic or quasiharmonic according as $\Delta^2 u = 0$ or $\Delta u = 1$, with Δ the Laplace-Beltrami operator $d\bar{\delta} + \delta d$; for any two classes X, Y of functions, XY stands for $X \cap Y$, and O_{XY}^N for the class of Riemannian N -manifolds on which $XY = \phi$. The classes H^2, Q , and L^p are not meaningful on Riemann surfaces, but are of great interest on Riemannian manifolds.

It is known that both $O_{H^2C}^N$ and $O_{QL^p}^N$ are strictly contained in O_{QC}^N , but whether or not there is an inclusion relation between $O_{H^2C}^N$ and $O_{QL^p}^N$ has been an open question. The purpose of the present paper is to show that the answer is in the negative. In particular, for any $N \geq 2$ and any $p \geq 1$, there exist Riemannian N -manifolds which carry QL^p functions but nevertheless fail to carry H^2C functions.

For any null class O^N of Riemannian N -manifolds, denote by \tilde{O}^N the complementary class. In Nos. 1 and 2, it is readily verified that the classes $\tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^N$, $O_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N$, and $\tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N$ are all nonvoid. The interesting relation is $O_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^N \neq \phi$, for which we use two approaches, one in Nos. 3-6, the other in Nos. 7-10.

1. Decomposition. We state our goal:

THEOREM. *For any $N \geq 2$ and any $1 \leq p < \infty$, the totality of Riemannian N -manifolds decomposes into the disjoint, nonvoid classes*

Received August 29, 1976.

This work was sponsored by the Engineering Foundation of North Carolina State University at Raleigh; the U.S. Army Research Office, Grant DA-ARO-31-1240-73-G39, University of California, Los Angeles; and the Faculty Grant-in-Aid Program, Arizona State University.

MOS Classification: 31B30.

$$O_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N, \quad O_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^N, \quad \tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N, \quad \tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^N.$$

The proof will be given in Nos. 1-10.

In view of the Euclidean N -ball, we have trivially

$$\tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^N \neq \phi.$$

Regarding $O_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N$, it is known that the Euclidean N -space E^N belongs to $O_{QL^p}^N$. Suppose there exists a u in the class H^2B of bounded functions in H^2 on E^N . Then

$$u = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=1}^{m_n} (a_{nm}r^n + b_{nm}r^{n+2})S_{nm},$$

with the S_{nm} spherical harmonics. Let $\rho \in C_0^\infty[0, \infty)$, $\rho \geq 0$, $\text{supp } \rho \subset (0, 1)$, and set $\rho_t(r) = \rho(r-t)$ for $t > 0$. If some $b_{nm} \neq 0$, then for $\varphi_t = \rho_t S_{nm}$,

$$(u, \varphi_t) = c \int_t^{t+1} (a_{nm}r^n + b_{nm}r^{n+2})\rho_t r^{N-1} dr \sim ct^{n+N+1}$$

as $t \rightarrow \infty$, whereas

$$(1, |\varphi_t|) = c \int_t^{t+1} \rho_t r^{N-1} dr \sim ct^{N-1}.$$

We have a violation of $|(u, \varphi_t)| \leq c(1, |\varphi_t|)$ for $n+N+1 > N-1$, that is, all $n \geq 0$. Therefore, all $b_{nm} = 0$, and $u \in HB$, contrary to $u \in H^2B$. Hence $E^N \in O_{H^2B}^N \subset O_{H^2C}^N$, and we have verified that

$$O_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N \neq \phi.$$

In No. 2, we shall show that $\tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N \neq \phi$, and in Nos. 3-10, that $O_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^N \neq \phi$.

2. H^2C functions but no QL^p for $1 \leq p < \infty$. Consider the exterior R of the unit ball in N -space,

$$R = \{(r, \theta^1, \dots, \theta^{N-1}) \mid 1 < r < \infty\},$$

with the metric

$$ds^2 = r^{-2} dr^2 + r^2 (d\theta^1)^2 + \sum_{i=2}^{N-1} d\theta^{i2}.$$

LEMMA. For $N \geq 2$, $1 \leq p < \infty$,

$$R \in \tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N \cap O_{QL^p}^N.$$

Proof. The function $h = ar^{-1} + b$ satisfies the harmonic equation $\Delta h(r) = -(r^2 h')' = 0$, and the function $u = \int_r^\infty r^{-2} \log r \, dr$ is biharmonic with $\Delta u = r^{-1}$. Since $u \in B$ and

$$D(u) = c \int_1^\infty r^2 u'^2 \, dr < \infty,$$

we have $R \in \tilde{O}_{H^2C}^N$.

To show that $R \in O_{\tilde{Q}L^p}^N$, note that $-\log r \in Q$, and every $q_0(r) \in Q$ can be written $q_0(r) = -\log r + ar^{-1} + b$. Clearly, $q_0(r) \in L^p$. An arbitrary $q(r, \theta) \in Q$, $\theta = (\theta^1, \dots, \theta^{N-1})$, is of the form

$$q(r, \theta) = q_0(r) + \sum_{i \neq 0} f_n(r) S_n(\theta),$$

with the $f_n S_n$ harmonic. Since $q_0 \in L^p$, there exists a $\varphi(r) \in L^{p'}$ with $1/p + 1/p' = 1$ such that $(q_0, \varphi) = \int_R q_0 * \varphi = \infty$. By virtue of $(f_n S_n, \varphi) = 0$, we have $(q, \varphi) = (q_0, \varphi) = \infty$, hence $q \notin L^p$. The Lemma follows.

3. QL^p functions, $1 \leq p < 2$, but no H^2C . The relation $O_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{\tilde{Q}L^p}^N \neq \phi$ is the most interesting part of our Theorem. We shall use two different approaches. The first one only applies to the case $1 \leq p < 2$, but offers methodological interest. It is based on theorems of Haupt [2], Hille [3], and Bellman [1] on the asymptotic behavior of solutions of ordinary differential equations, and will be presented in Nos. 3-6. The second approach applies to all $1 \leq p < \infty$. For $N=2$, it will be given in No. 7; for $N > 2$, in Nos. 8-10.

Consider the product of the 2-space and the $(N-2)$ -torus,

$$R = R^2 \times T^{N-2} = \{(r, \theta^1, \dots, \theta^{N-1}) \mid 0 \leq r < \infty, 0 \leq \theta^i \leq 2\pi, i=1, \dots, N-1\}$$

with the metric

$$ds^2 = \varphi(r) dr^2 + \sum_{i=1}^{N-1} \psi_i(r) d\theta^{i2},$$

where φ and the ψ_i are $C^\infty[0, \infty)$. On $\{r < 1/2\}$, the metric is to be Euclidean, and on $\{r > 1\}$, for a given $0 < \delta < 1$,

$$\begin{aligned} \varphi(r) &= \psi_1(r) = r^{-2-\delta}, \\ \psi_i(r) &= 1, \quad i > 1. \end{aligned}$$

LEMMA. For $1 \leq p < 1 + \delta$ and $N \geq 2$,

$$R \in O_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{\tilde{Q}L^p}^N.$$

The proof will be given in Nos. 3-6.

The relation

$$R \in \tilde{O}_{\tilde{Q}L^p}^N$$

is immediate. In fact, the quasiharmonic equation $\Delta q(r) = -g^{-1/2}(g^{1/2}\varphi^{-1}q)' = 1$ is satisfied by

$$q(r) = -\int_0^r g(t)^{-1/2} \varphi(t) \int_0^t g^{1/2}(s) ds dt.$$

For $r > 1$, $g^{1/2} = \varphi = r^{-2-\delta}$, and therefore,

$$q(r) \approx - \int_0^r \int_0^t s^{-2-\delta} ds dt \sim cr$$

as $r \rightarrow \infty$. The integrand in $\|q\|_p^p$ is asymptotically $r^{2-2-\delta}$, and we have $q \in QL^p$ for $1 \leq p < 1 + \delta$.

4. Rate of growth of harmonic functions. For the proof of $R \in O_{H^2C}^N$, we first consider nonconstant harmonic functions $f(r)G(\theta)$, where $\theta = (\theta^1, \dots, \theta^{N-1})$, and $G(\theta)$ is a product of functions $G_i(\theta^i)$ of the form $\cos n_i \theta^i$ or $\sin n_i \theta^i$. We denote by R^1 the class of constant functions and show :

If $f(r)G_1(\theta^1) \in H - R^1$, then for $r > 1$,

$$f(r) = ae^{n_1 r} + be^{-n_1 r},$$

with $a \neq 0$.

If $f(r) \prod_{i=2}^{N-1} G_i(\theta^i) \in H - R^1$, then as $r \rightarrow \infty$,

$$f(r) \sim ar,$$

with $a \neq 0$.

If $f(r) \prod_{i=1}^{N-1} G_i(\theta^i) \in H$ with $G_i(\theta^i) \neq \text{const}$ for $i=1$ and some $i > 1$, then as $r \rightarrow \infty$,

$$f(r) \sim ae^{n_1 r},$$

with $a \neq 0$.

In the first case, we have for $r > 1$,

$$\Delta(fG_1) = -r^{2+\delta}(f''G_1 + fG_1'') = 0,$$

which gives $f'' - n_1^2 f = 0$, as claimed. By the maximum principle, $a \neq 0$.

In the second case, we similarly obtain

$$f'' = \sum_{i=2}^{N-1} n_i^2 r^{-2-\delta} f.$$

We now make use of the following theorem of Haupt [2] and Hille [3]: A sufficient condition for the differential equation

$$f''(x) = p(x)f(x)$$

on $(0, \infty)$ to have solutions

$$f_1(x) = x(1 + o(1)),$$

$$f_2(x) = 1 + o(1)$$

as $x \rightarrow \infty$ is that

$$xp(x) \in L^1(0, \infty).$$

In the present case, this condition reads

$$r^{-1-\delta} \in L^1.$$

Since it is satisfied, we have the asserted asymptotic behavior of $f(r)$. The maximum principle gives $a \neq 0$.

In the third case, we have for $r > 1$,

$$f'' = (n_1^2 + \sum_{i=2}^{N-1} n_i^2 r^{-2-\delta})f.$$

By a preliminary transformation $r \rightarrow cr$, this can be written $f'' = (1+p(r))f$. We now make use of the following theorem of Bellman [1]: If $p(x) \rightarrow 0$ as $x \rightarrow \infty$ and $\int_0^\infty p^2 dx < \infty$, then the equation $f'' = (1+p(x))f$ on $(0, \infty)$ has solutions

$$f_1(x) = \exp \left[+x - \frac{1}{2} \int_{x_0}^x p(x) dx + o(1) \right],$$

$$f_2(x) = \exp \left[- \left(x + \frac{1}{2} \int_{x_0}^x p(x) dx + o(1) \right) \right].$$

In the present case, Bellman's conditions take the form $r^{-2-\delta} \rightarrow 0$ as $r \rightarrow \infty$, and $r^{-2-\delta} \in L^2(c, \infty)$. Both are satisfied, and the statement follows.

5. Rate of growth of biharmonic functions. We continue the proof of $R \in O_{H^2C}^N$ and use the above results to estimate biharmonic functions.

If $g(r) \prod_{i=1}^{N-1} G_i(\theta^i) \in H^2$, with $G_1 \neq \text{const}$, then $gG \in B$.
 If $g(r) \prod_{i=1}^{N-1} G_i(\theta^i) \in H^2$, then $gG \in C$.

In the first case, we know from No. 3 that a quasiharmonic $q(r) \sim cr$, hence, $q(r) \in B$. It therefore suffices to consider the case $\Delta(gG) = fG \in H - R^1$. We have $f \sim ae^{n_1 r}$ and, for $r > 1$,

$$\Delta(gG) = -r^{2+\delta}(g'' - n_1^2 g - \sum_{i=2}^{N-1} n_i^2 r^{-2-\delta} g)G = fG,$$

hence

$$g'' = (n_1^2 + \sum_{i=2}^{N-1} n_i^2 r^{-2-\delta})g - r^{-2-\delta} f.$$

If $g \in B$, then $g'' \sim cr^{-2-\delta} e^{n_1 r}$ and therefore $g \in B$, a contradiction.

In the second case, $f \sim ar$, and for $r > 1$,

$$g'' = \left(\sum_{i=2}^{N-1} n_i^2 g - f \right) r^{-2-\delta}.$$

Suppose $gG \in C$, hence $g \in B$. For $\eta^2 = \sum_{i=2}^{N-1} n_i^2$,

$$g'(r) = \int_r^\infty (f(s) - \eta^2 g(s)) s^{-2-\delta} ds + c.$$

Here $c=0$. In fact,

$$D(gG) = \int_R \left(-\frac{\partial}{\partial r} (gG) \right)^2 g^{rr} * 1 + \int_R \sum_{i=2}^{N-1} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta^i} (gG) \right)^2 g^{\theta^i \theta^i} * 1 > c_1 \int_1^\infty g'^2 dr.$$

If $c \neq 0$, then $D(gG) = \infty$, a contradiction.

By $f \sim ar$ and $g \in B$, the integrand in the expression of g' is $\sim s^{-1-\delta}$, hence $g' \sim c_2 r^{-\delta}$ and $g \sim c_3 r^{1-\delta}$. In view of $\delta < 1$, we have $g \in B$, a contradiction.

6. No H^2C functions. We are ready to draw the conclusion:

$$R \in O_{H^2C}^N.$$

For the proof, suppose there exists a $u \in H^2C$. Expand it: $u = \sum_n g_n(r)G_n(\theta)$, $g_n G_n \in H^2$, $g_0 G_0 = cg$. The only radial biharmonic functions are constants and constant multiples of radial quasiharmonic functions $q(r)$. By No. 3, $q(r) \sim cr \in B$. Thus $g_0 G_0 \in C$ or else $g_0 G_0 = \text{const}$, and we already know that $g_n G_n \in C$ for $n \neq 0$.

To deduce a contradiction from $u \in C$, we first observe that

$$(T_n u)(r) = \int_{\theta} u G_n d\theta \in B$$

for every n . Suppose first that $g_n G_n \in B$ for some n . Then

$$\int_{\theta} u G_n d\theta = c g_n \in B,$$

a contradiction. If $g_n G_n \in B$ for all n , then by No. 5, $G_n(\theta)$ depends on $\theta^2, \dots, \theta^{N-1}$ only, and therefore $g_n G_n \in D$. In view of the Dirichlet orthogonality of the G_n , $\sum_n g_n G_n \in D$ as well. This contradiction proves that $R \in O_{H^2C}^N$, and we have established the Lemma in No. 3, hence also our Theorem for $1 \leq p < 2$.

7. QL^p functions, any p , but no H^2C , for $N=2$. We proceed to our second approach in the proof of our Theorem, valid for all $1 \leq p < \infty$. In No. 7, we discuss the case $N=2$; in Nos. 8-10, $N > 2$.

Consider the 2-space R with the metric

$$ds^2 = \varphi(r) dr^2 + \psi(r) d\theta^2$$

with $\varphi, \psi \in C^\infty$ such that, for $r < 1/2$, the metric is Euclidean, and for $r > 1$,

$$\varphi(r) = \psi(r) = e^{-r/2}.$$

LEMMA. For $1 \leq p < \infty$,

$$R \in O_{H^2C}^2 \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^2.$$

Proof. The relation

$$R \in \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^2$$

is immediate. In fact, $\Delta q(r) = 1$ is satisfied by

$$q(r) = - \int_0^r \varphi(t) g(t)^{-1/2} \int_0^t g(s)^{1/2} ds dt,$$

and $q(r) \sim cr$ as $r \rightarrow \infty$. Thus the integrand in $\|q\|_p^p$ is $\sim cr^2 e^{-r/2}$, and $q \in L^p$ for

all p .

To show that

$$R \in O_{H^2C}^2,$$

let $G(\theta)$ be either $\sin n\theta$ or $\cos n\theta$ for some integer $n \geq 0$.

If $f(r)G(\theta) \in H$, with $G(\theta) \neq \text{const}$, then $f(r) \sim ae^{nr}$, $a \neq 0$.

If $g(r)G(\theta) \in H^2$, then $gG \in B$.

Indeed, the harmonic equation $\Delta(fG) = 0$ gives

$$(g^{1/2}\varphi^{-1}f')' = n^2g^{1/2}\varphi^{-1}f,$$

which for $r > 1$ reads $f'' = n^2f$, and $f = ae^{nr} + be^{-nr}$. By the maximum principle, $a \neq 0$.

The equation $\Delta(gG) = fG$ takes, for $r > 1$, the form

$$g'' = n^2g - e^{-r/2}f.$$

If $g \in B$ and $G \neq \text{const}$, then $g'' \sim -ae^{(n-1/2)r}$, and $g \sim ae^{(n-1/2)r}$ contradicts $g \in B$ if $G \neq \text{const}$.

If $G = \text{const}$, then $gG = cg$ is radial quasiharmonic, hence by $g'' = -e^{r/2}f$, we again have $g \in B$.

Now suppose there exists a $u \in H^2B$. Since in the expansion $u = \sum_n g_n(r)G_n(\theta)$, $g_n \neq 0$ for some n , the corresponding transform

$$(T_n u)(\theta) = \int_{\theta} u G_n(\theta) d\theta = c g_n \in B,$$

a contradiction. We have shown that $R \in O_{H^2B}^2 \subset O_{H^2C}^2$.

8. QL^p functions, any p , but no H^2C , for $N > 2$. We now come to the main part of our Theorem: the relation $O_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QL^p}^N \neq \emptyset$ for all $1 \leq p < \infty$ and $N > 2$.

For the base manifold we take the same product of R^2 and the $(N-2)$ -torus as in No. 3,

$$R = \{(r, \theta) \mid 0 \leq r < \infty, 0 \leq \theta^i \leq 2\pi, i = 1, \dots, N-1\},$$

but endowed with the metric

$$ds^2 = \varphi(r)dr^2 + \sum_{i=1}^{N-1} \psi_i(r)d\theta^{i2}$$

where $\varphi, \psi_i \in C^\infty[0, \infty)$ for $i = 1, \dots, N-1$, the metric is Euclidean on $\{r < 1/2\}$, and

$$\varphi(r) = e^{-(N-1)r} \quad \text{on } \{r > 1\}.$$

The choice of ψ_i will depend on a partition $\{I_i\}$ of the interval $(1, \infty)$ and on an auxiliary function $\psi(r)$ to be presently specified.

The partition $\{I_{i,j}\}$ with $i, j=1, \dots, N-1$, and $i \neq j$ consists in dividing each semiopen unit interval $I^n=(n, n+1]$, $n=1, 2, \dots$, into $(N-1)(N-2)$ equal semiopen intervals I_{ij}^n , and by setting $I_{i,j}=\cup_n I_{ij}^n$.

The function ϕ is defined on each I_{ij}^n as follows. Subdivide I_{ij}^n into five equal semiopen subintervals, I_1, I_2, I_3, I_4, I_5 , in this order, and let $\phi \in C^\infty$ with

$$\phi(r) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{for } r \in I_1 \cup I_5, \\ e^{(N-2)r} e^{e^r} & \text{for } r \in I_3, \\ \geq 1 & \text{for } r \in I_2 \cup I_4. \end{cases}$$

Thus ϕ is well defined on $(1, \infty)$, and we set

$$\phi_i(r) = \begin{cases} e^{-r} \phi(r) & \text{for } r \in I_{i,j}, \\ e^{-r} \phi(r)^{-1} & \text{for } r \in I_{j,i}, \\ e^{-r} & \text{for } r \notin I_{i,j} \cup I_{j,i}. \end{cases}$$

The Riemannian N -manifold R is thus well defined.

Note that the determinant of the metric tensor is $g(r) = \varphi \prod \phi_i$. For $r > 1$, $g(r)^{1/2} = e^{-(N-1)r}$.

We claim :

LEMMA. For $1 \leq p < \infty$ and $N > 2$,

$$R \in O_{H^2C}^N \cap \tilde{O}_{QLP}^N.$$

The proof will be given in Nos. 8-10.

The relation

$$R \in \tilde{O}_{QLP}^N$$

is immediate. Indeed, the quasiharmonic equation $\Delta q(r) = 1$ has a solution

$$q(r) = - \int_1^r g^{-1/2} \varphi(s) \int_1^s g^{1/2} dt ds.$$

For $r > 1$, $g^{1/2} = e^{-(N-1)r}$, and $g^{-1/2} \varphi(r) = 1$. Thus $q(r) \sim ar$ as $r \rightarrow \infty$, and

$$\|q\|_p^p = \int_R |q|^p * 1 \sim c_1 + c_2 \int_1^\infty r^p e^{-(N-1)r} dr < \infty.$$

9. Rate of growth. To prove that

$$R \in O_{H^2C}^N,$$

we first observe that if $u(r) \in H^2$, then $u \in B$. In fact, $u(r) = aq(r) + b \sim a_1 r + b \in B$.

Next consider harmonic functions $f(r)G(\theta)$, with the notation as in No. 7.

If $f(r)G(\theta) \in H$, $fG \neq const$, then

$$|f(r)| > ce^{2r} e^{e^r}$$

for all sufficiently large r .

For the proof, note that by the maximum principle, $|f|$ is strictly increasing and f is of constant sign. The sign of G suitably chosen, we have $f > 0$. In the relation $\Delta(fG) = \Delta f \cdot G + f \Delta G = 0$, we obtain for $r > 1$,

$$\Delta f = -e^{(N-1)r} f'' , \quad \Delta G = \sum_{i=1}^{N-1} n_i^2 \phi_i^{-1} G ,$$

so that

$$e^{(N-1)r} f'' = \sum_{i=1}^{N-1} n_i^2 \phi_i^{-1} f \geq c \phi_{i_0}^{-1} > 0 ,$$

where $c \phi_{i_0}^{-1}$ comes from a nonvanishing term with $n_{i_0} > 0$. Integrating $f'' \geq c e^{-(N-1)r} \phi_{i_0}^{-1}$ twice we obtain

$$f(r) \geq c \int_1^r \int_1^t e^{-(N-1)s} \phi_{i_0}^{-1}(s) ds dt + f'(1)(r-1) + f(1) .$$

In view of $f(1) > 0$ and $f'(1) > 0$, we have

$$f(r) > c \int_1^r \int_1^t e^{-(N-1)s} \phi_{i_0}^{-1}(s) ds dt > 0 .$$

We estimate the growth of $\int_1^t e^{-(N-1)s} \phi_{i_0}^{-1}(s) ds$ as $t \rightarrow \infty$. Let $n = [t] - 1$, and denote by $n + \delta$ the left end point of $I_{j_{i_0}^n}^n$. The right end point of $I_{j_{i_0}^n}^n$ is $n + \delta + [5(N-1)(N-2)]^{-1}$, and, for $t > r_0$, say,

$$\begin{aligned} \int_1^t e^{-(N-1)s} \phi_{i_0}^{-1}(s) ds &> \int_{r_{j_{i_0}^n}^n} e^{-(N-1)s} \phi_{i_0}^{-1}(s) ds = \int_{r_{j_{i_0}^n}^n} e^{e^s} ds \\ &= e^{-s} e^{e^s} \Big|_{n+\delta}^{n+\delta+1/[5(N-1)(N-2)]} + \int_{r_{j_{i_0}^n}^n} e^{-s} e^{e^s} ds \\ &\geq e^{-s} e^{e^s} \Big|_{n+\delta}^{n+\delta+1/[5(N-1)(N-2)]} \\ &\geq e^{-n-\delta-1/[5(N-1)(N-2)]} e^{e^{n+\delta+1/[5(N-1)(N-2)]}} e^{-n-\delta} e^{e^{n+\delta}} \\ &= e^{-(n+\delta)} e^{e^{n+\delta}} [(e^{e^{n+\delta}}) e^{1/[5(N-1)(N-2)]-1} e^{-1/[5(N-1)(N-2)]-1}] \\ &\geq e^{-(n+\delta)} e^{e^{n+\delta}} [(e^{e^{n+\delta}}) e^{-1} e^{-1/[5(N-1)(N-2)]-1}] . \end{aligned}$$

For r_0 sufficiently large, this dominates

$$e^{-(n+\delta)} e^{e^{n+\delta}} \geq c e^{-t} e^{e^{t-1}} ,$$

with c an appropriate constant. Integration by parts gives

$$f(r) > c \int_{r_0}^r e^{-t} e^{e^{t-1}} dt \geq c e^{-2r} e^{e^{r-1}} .$$

It follows that

$$e^{(N-1)r} f'' = \sum_{i=1}^{N-1} n_i^2 \phi_i^{-1} f \geq c \phi_{i_0}^{-1} e^{-2r} e^{er-1},$$

hence

$$f'' \geq c e^{-(N+1)r} \phi_{i_0}^{-1} e^{er-1},$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} f'(r) - f'(1) &\geq c \int_1^r e^{-(N+1)t} \phi_{i_0}^{-1} e^{et-1} dt \\ &\geq c \int_{I_{j i_0^3}} e^{-2r} e^{er} e^{er-1} dr. \end{aligned}$$

A fortiori,

$$f'(r) \geq c e^{3r} e^{er}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} f(r) - f(1) &\geq c \int_1^r e^{3t} e^{et} dt \\ &\geq c_2 e^{2r} e^{er} \end{aligned}$$

for sufficiently large r .

10. No H^2 C functions. To continue the proof of $R \in O_{H^2C}^N$, we consider nonharmonic biharmonic functions $g(r)G(\theta)$, with the notation as in No. 7.

If $g(r)G(\theta) \in H^2$, then $gG \in B$.

For the proof, suppose gG is bounded. For sufficiently large r ,

$$\Delta(gG) = (-e^{(N-1)r} g'' + \sum_i n_i^2 \phi_i^{-1} g)G = fG,$$

hence

$$g'' = \sum_i n_i^2 \phi_i^{-1} e^{-(N-1)r} g - e^{-(N-1)r} f.$$

Since $f(r) > c e^{2r} e^{er}$ for all sufficiently large r , and $\phi_i^{-1} e^{-(N-1)r} g$ does not grow faster than $c e^{er}$, the right-hand side is unbounded as $r \rightarrow \infty$, and of constant sign for large r . Integrating twice, we see that $g \notin B$, hence $gG \notin B$.

We are ready to draw the conclusion:

$$R \in O_{H^2B}^N \subset O_{H^2C}^N.$$

To see this, let $u(r, \theta) \in H^2$. Write $u(r, \theta) = \sum_n g_n(r) G_n(\theta)$, with $G_0(\theta)$ standing for a constant. Here some $g_n G_n \in H^2$, say $g_1 G_1$. If $u \in B$, then

$$(T_1 u)(r) = \int_{\theta} u G_1 d\theta \in B,$$

in violation of $\int_{\theta} u G_1 d\theta = c g_1 \notin B$.

The proof of the Lemma in No. 8 and of the Theorem is herewith complete.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- [1] BELLMAN, R., On the asymptotic behavior of solutions of $u'' + (1+f(t))u=0$,
Ann. Mat. Pura Appl. 31 (1950), 83-91.
- [2] HAUPT, O., Über das asymptotische Verhalten der Lösungen gewisser linearer
gewöhnlicher Differentialgleichungen, Math. Z. 48 (1913), 289-292.
- [3] HILLE, E., Behavior of solutions of linear second order differential equations,
Ark. Mat. 2 (1952), 25-41.

NORTH CAROLINA STATE UNIVERSITY
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, LOS ANGELES
ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY