

Ewa Lazarow, Institute of Mathematics, 90-238 Łódź,  
Stefan Banach 22, Poland.

Selective differentiation of typical continuous functions

The notion of selective derivative was introduced by R.J. O'Malley [5] who presented some interesting theorems and problems on selective derivatives.

R.J. O'Malley has proved that for every continuous function there exists a selection  $S$  and a point  $x_0$  such that  $f$  has a selective derivative at  $x_0$ . His question was: If  $f$  is a continuous function, for how large a set  $A$  does there have to exist a selection  $S$  with respect to which  $f$  has a selective derivative at every point of  $A$ .

In this paper we shall show that the set  $A$  has Lebesgue measure zero and is of the first category.

To simplify the later computation we shall use  $[a,b]$  to denote the closed interval having endpoints  $a$  and  $b$  regardless of whether  $a > b$  or  $a < b$ . By a selection we mean an interval function  $s([a,b])$  for which  $a < s([a,b]) < b$  holds for every  $0 \leq a < b \leq 1$ . We define the lower selective derivative  ${}_s f'(x)$  of the function  $f(x)$  by

$${}_s f'(x) = \liminf_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(s([x, x+h])) - f(x)}{s([x, x+h]) - x} .$$

It should be clear from the above definition how we would define the upper selective derivative,  ${}^s f'(x)$ , selective derivative  $sf'(x)$  and one-sided selective derivatives.

Let  $C[0,1]$  denote the class of continuous functions on  $[0,1]$  furnished with the "sup" norm  $\|f\| = \max_{0 \leq t \leq 1} |f(t)|$ .

By "typical" continuous functions we mean those which form a residual subset in the complete metric space  $C[0,1]$ . Now we shall give several basic theorems and refer the reader to [5] and [4] as important sources.

Theorem A: (See [5], Lemma 1.)

Let  $f: [0,1] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and  $S$  be a fixed selection.

Let  $P_n = \{x: \frac{f(s([x, x+h])) - f(x)}{s([x, x+h]) - x} > 0 \text{ for all } h \text{ with } |h| < \frac{1}{n}\}$ .

If  $x < y$  and both belong to  $P_n$  and if  $y - x < \frac{1}{n}$ , then  $f(x) < f(y)$ . Hence  $f$  is of bounded variation on  $P_n$ .

Theorem B: (See [5], Lemma 2.)

Let  $f: [0,1] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and let  $S$  be a fixed selection. Let  $P_n$  be defined as above and let  $Cl P_n$  be its closure. Let  $x < y$  be any two points such that

- (i) the distance between  $x$  and  $y$  is less than  $\frac{1}{n}$
- (ii) there is a decreasing sequence  $\{x_k\}$  of points of  $P_n$  converging to  $x$
- (iii) there is an increasing sequence  $\{y_i\}$  of points of  $P_n$  converging to  $y$
- (iv)  $\text{Min } [{}_S f'(x), {}_S f'(y)] > -\infty$ .

Then  $f(x) < f(y)$ .

Theorem C: (See [4].)

If  $f : [0,1] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  has a selective derivative  $sf'(x)$  for a given selection  $S$ , then the set of points of continuity of  $sf'(x)$  is everywhere dense in  $[0,1]$ .

Theorem D: (See [2].)

Let  $f$  be defined on a perfect set  $P$ . Suppose  $f$  satisfies condition (i) or condition (ii) below.

- (i)  $f$  has the property of Baire on  $P$ .
- (ii)  $f$  is measurable with respect to some non-atomic measure for which Lusin's theorem holds and such that  $\mu(P) > 0$ .

Then there exists a non-empty perfect set  $Q \subset P$  such that  $f|_Q$  is differentiable at all  $x \in Q$  (infinite derivatives allowed).

Theorem E: (See [1], page 60.)

Let  $f$  be a continuous function defined on  $\mathbb{R}$  and let  $-\infty < \alpha < \infty$ . If the set  $\{x : D^+f(x) \geq \alpha\}$  is dense in  $\mathbb{R}$  and if there exists an  $x_0 \in \mathbb{R}$  such that  $D^+f(x_0) < \alpha$ , then the set  $\{x : D^+f(x) = \alpha\}$  has cardinality  $c$ , the cardinality of  $\mathbb{R}$ .

Theorem 1.

Let  $f : [0,1] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a Lebesgue measurable function. Then there is a selection  $S$  and a set  $P$  of cardinality  $c$  such that  $f$  has a selective derivative (possibly infinite) at all  $x \in P$ .

Proof.

By Theorem D we have that there is a perfect set  $Q \subset [0,1]$  such that  $f|_Q$  is differentiable at all  $x \in Q$ . Let  $[a,b] \subset [0,1]$ .

If  $(a,b) \cap Q \neq \emptyset$ , then let  $s([a,b])$  be any point  $x_0 \in Q \cap (a,b)$ . If  $(a,b) \cap Q = \emptyset$ , then let  $s([a,b]) = \frac{a+b}{2}$ . We denote the set of bilateral limit points of  $Q$  by  $P$ . Then  $Q = P \cup C$  where  $C$  is at most countable. Let  $x_0 \in P$  and  $h_n \rightarrow 0^+$ . Then  $(x, x+h_n) \cap Q \neq \emptyset$  for every  $n$  and  $x_{h_n} = s([x, x+h_n]) \in (x, x+h_n) \cap Q \subset Q$  and  $x_{h_n} \rightarrow x_0^+$ .

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(s([x_0, x_0+h_n])) - f(x_0)}{s([x_0, x_0+h_n]) - x_0} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x_{h_n}) - f(x_0)}{x_{h_n} - x_0} = \\ &= f|'_Q(x_0). \end{aligned}$$

Analogously, if  $h_n \rightarrow 0^-$ , then

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(s([x_0-h_n, x_0])) - f(x_0)}{s([x_0-h_n, x_0]) - x_0} = f|'_Q(x_0).$$

Since the sequences  $\{h_n\}$  were arbitrary,

$$sf^-(x_0) = sf'(x_0) = f|'_Q(x_0).$$

This completes the proof of Theorem 1.

The next example shows that the set  $P$  of cardinality  $c$  cannot be arbitrary even if we assume that  $f$  is an absolutely continuous function.

Example 1.

Let  $A$  be a subset of  $[0,1]$  such that for each interval  $[a,b] \subset [0,1]$   $\mu([a,b] \cap A) > 0$  and  $\mu([a,b] \cap ([0,1] \setminus A)) > 0$ .

$$\text{Let } f(x) = \int_0^x \chi_A(t) dt.$$

Then  $f'(x) = \chi_A(x)$  almost everywhere.

Let  $B = \{x \in [0,1] \mid f'(x) = \chi_A(x)\}$  and  $P = [0,1] \setminus B$ .

Then  $\mu(P) = 0$ . Let  $\alpha \in (0,1)$ . Then  $\{x : D^+f(x) \geq \alpha\} \supset$

$\{x : f'(x) = 1\}$  is dense on  $[0,1]$  and there exists an

$x_0 \in [0,1]$  such that  $D^+f(x_0) = f'(x_0) = 0 < \alpha$ . Hence

$\{x : D^+f(x) = \alpha\}$  has cardinality  $c$ . Then  $P \supset \{x : D^+f(x) = \alpha\}$

has cardinality  $c$ . We suppose that there exists a selection  $S$

such that  $f$  has a selective derivative at all points  $x \in P$ .

Then the function  $f$  has a selective derivative at all points

$x \in [0,1]$  and  $sf'(x) = \chi_A(x)$  almost everywhere. Let

$[a,b] \subset [0,1]$ . Then  $\text{osc}_{[a,b]} sf'(x) = 1$  and consequently  $sf'$

is an everywhere discontinuous function which contradicts

Theorem C.

Theorem 2.

There exists a continuous function  $f : [0,1] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  such that for every selection  $S$  the set of points at which the selective derivative (possibly infinite) of the function  $f$  exists with respect to  $S$  is of measure zero and of first category. In fact the set of such functions is a residual subset of  $C[0,1]$ .

Proof.

Let  $f$  be a continuous, nowhere approximately differentiable

function on  $[0,1]$  (See [3].) Let  $S$  be a fixed selection.

Let  $P$  be the set of those points in which a selective derivative exists (possibly infinite) with respect to  $S$ . Let

$$P_1 = \{x \in [0,1] : {}_S f'(x) > -\infty\} \text{ and } P_2 = \{x \in [0,1] : {}_S f'(x) < \infty\}.$$

Then  $P \subset P_1 \cup P_2$ . Let  $P_1^n = \{x \in [0,1] : \frac{f(S([x,x+h])) - f(x)}{S([x,x+h]) - x} >$

$-n$  for all  $h$  with  $|h| < \frac{1}{n}\}$ . Then  $P_1 \subset \bigcup_n P_1^n \subset \bigcup_n Cl P_1^n$  where

$Cl P_1^n$  denotes closure of  $P_1^n$ . Suppose that there is  $n_0$  such

that  $\mu(Cl P_1^{n_0}) > 0$ . Let  $g(x) = f(x) + n_0 x$ . Then the set

$Cl P_1^{n_0}$  will be precisely the set  $Cl P_n$  of Theorem A for the

function  $g(x)$ . Let  $Q$  denote the set of bilateral limit points

of  $Cl P_1^{n_0}$  and  $Q_i = Q \cap [\frac{i-1}{2n}, \frac{i}{2n}]$  for  $i = 1, 2, \dots, 2n$ . Then

by Theorem A and Theorem B  $g$  is increasing on  $Q_i$  for each

$i$  and therefore  $g$  is measurable and of generalized bounded

variation on  $Cl P_1^{n_0}$ . Hence the function  $g$  is approximately

derivable at almost all points of  $Cl P_1^{n_0}$  which contradicts

the assumption of the function  $f(x) = g(x) - n_0 x$ . Therefore

for every  $n$   $\mu(Cl P_1^n) = 0$  and  $Cl P_1^n$  is nowhere dense set.

Hence the set  $P_1$  is of measure zero and of first category.

Let  $h(x) = -f(x)$ . Then  ${}_S h(x) = -{}_S f(x)$  and

$$P_2 = \{x \in [0,1] : {}_S f'(x) < \infty\} = \{x \in [0,1] : {}_S h'(x) > -\infty\}.$$

Hence  $\mu(P_2) = 0$  and  $P_2$  is a set of first category and

also  $P \subset P_1 \cup P_2$ .

Because the set of nowhere approximately differentiable functions is a residual subset of  $C[0,1]$  ([3]), the theorem is proved.

Theorem 3.

Let  $f : [0,1] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and  $K \subset [0,1]$  satisfy the following conditions:

- (i) if  $x \in K$  and  $f'(x)$  exists, then  $|f'(x)| < \infty$
- (ii) for every  $x \in K$   $D_L f(x) \cap D_R f(x) \neq \emptyset$  where  $D_L f(x)$  ( $D_R f(x)$ ) denotes the set of left-sided (right-sided) derived numbers at  $x$ .
- (iii) There exists a number  $n_0$  such that  $K \cap K^{(n_0)} = \emptyset$  where  $K^{(n_0)}$  denotes the set of limit points of  $K^{(n_0-1)}$  and  $K^0 = K$ .

Let  $g : K \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a function such that for every  $x \in K$   $g(x) \in D_L f(x) \cap D_R f(x)$  and  $|g(x)| < \infty$ . Then there is a selection  $S$  such that at all  $x \in K$   $Sf'(x) = g(x)$ .

The assumptions (i), (ii), (iii) are necessary -

- (i) For every set  $K$  such that  $\mu(K) = 0$  there exists the continuous function  $f$  such that  $f'(x) = \infty$  at all  $x \in K$ . (See [1], page 229.)
- (ii) By [5],  $sD_L f(x) \subset D_L f(x)$  and  $sD_R f(x) \subset D_R f(x)$  where  $sD_L f(x)$  ( $sD_R f(x)$ ) denotes the set of left-sided (right-sided) selective derived numbers of  $x$ . If  $D_L f(x) \cap D_R f(x) = \emptyset$ , then  $sD_L f(x) \cap sD_R f(x) = \emptyset$ .
- (iii) Let  $P$  denote the set of bilateral limit points of the Cantor set  $C$ . The set  $C$  is of measure zero and of the first category. We define

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} x & \text{if } x \in [0,1] \setminus P \\ 0 & \text{if } x \in P \end{cases} .$$

For every natural  $n$   $C \cap C^{(n)} = C$ . If  $x \in [0,1] \setminus C$ , then  $f'(x) = 1$ . If  $x \in C \setminus P$ , then  $D_L f(x) \cap D_R f(x) = \{1\}$  and if  $x \in P$ , then  $D_L f(x) \cap D_R f(x) = \{0\}$ . If there exists the selection  $S$  such that the function  $f$  is selectively differentiable with respect to  $S$  at all  $x \in C$ , then  $sf'(x) = 1$  at  $x \in C \setminus P$  and  $sf'(x) = 0$  at  $x \in P$ . Of course  $sf'(x) = 1$  at  $x \in [0,1] \setminus C$  and the selective derivative exists and it is finite at all points of  $[0,1]$ . This is impossible because  $f$  is not a Darboux function nor is it Baire 1. (See [5], Theorem 11.)

Proof of Theorem 3.

Let  $x_0 \in K$ . Then  $g(x_0) \in D_L f(x_0) \cap D_R f(x_0)$  and there are two sequences  $\{x_n\}, \{y_n\}$  such that  $x_n \rightarrow x_0$  and for every  $n$   $x_n > x_0$  and  $y_n \rightarrow x_0, y_n > y_0$  and

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x_n) - f(x_0)}{x_n - x_0} = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(y_n) - f(x_0)}{y_n - x_0} = g(x_0).$$

Since for every  $k \geq 2$   $K^{(k)} \subset K^{(k-1)}$ ,  $K \supset K \cap K' \supset K'' \cap K \supset \dots$   
 $\dots \supset K \cap K^{(n_0-1)} \supset K \cap K^{(n_0)} = \emptyset$ . Let  $[a,b] \subset [0,1]$ .

$$s([a,b]) \in \{a_n > a : a_n \rightarrow a \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(a_n) - f(a)}{a_n - a} = g(a)\} \cap (a,b)$$

if and only if

1)  $a \in K$  and  $b \notin K$

or

2)  $a \in K \cap K'$  and  $b \notin K \cap K'$

or

3) there is a natural number  $p$  such that  $a \in K \cap K^{(p)}$

$a \notin K \cap K^{(p+1)}$  and there is a natural number  $s < p$  such that  $b \in K \cap K^{(s)}$  and  $b \notin K \cap K^{(s+1)}$ .

$$s([a, b]) \in \{b_n < b : b_n \rightarrow b \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(b_n) - f(b)}{b_n - b} = g(b)\} \cap (a, b)$$

if and only if

4)  $b \in K$  and  $a \notin K$

or

5)  $b \in K \cap K'$  and  $a \notin K \cap K'$

or

6) there is a natural number  $p$  such that  $b \in K \cap K^{(p)}$ ,  $b \notin K \cap K^{(p+1)}$  and there is a natural number  $s < p$  such that  $a \in K \cap K^{(s)}$  and  $a \notin K \cap K^{(s+1)}$ .

If (1) - (6) aren't satisfied, then let  $s([a, b]) = \frac{a+b}{2}$ . Let  $x_0 \in K$  and  $K = K^0$ . Then there is a number  $p \in \{0, 1, 2, \dots, n_0 - 1\}$  such that  $x_0 \in K \cap K^{(p)}$  and  $x_0 \notin K \cap K^{(p+1)}$ . Therefore, there is a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $(x_0 - \delta, x_0 + \delta) \cap K \cap K^{(p)} = \{x_0\}$ .

Let  $|h| < \delta$ . If  $0 < h < \delta$ , then  $[x_0, x_0 + h] \subset [x_0, x_0 + \delta]$  and  $x_0 + h \in K \cap K^{(s)}$  where  $s < p$  or  $x_0 + h \notin K$  if  $p = 0$ , and  $x_0 + h \notin K \cap K^{(p)}$ . Therefore,  $s([x_0, x_0 + h]) \in$

$\{x_n^0 > x_0 : x_n^0 \rightarrow x_0 \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x_n^0) - f(x_0)}{x_n^0 - x_0} = g(x_0)\}$ . If  $-\delta < h < 0$ ,

then  $[x_0 - h, x_0] \subset (x_0 - \delta, x_0]$ ,  $x_0 - h \in K \cap K^{(l)}$  where

$l < p$  or  $x_0 - h \notin K$  if  $l = 0$ , and  $x_0 - h \notin K \cap K^{(p)}$ .

Therefore

$$s([x_0 - h, x_0]) \in \{x_n^0 < x_0 : x_n^0 \rightarrow x_0, \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{f(x_n^0) - f(x_0)}{x_n^0 - x_0} = g(x_0)\}.$$

Hence

$$sf'(x) = \lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(s([x_0, x_0 + h])) - f(x_0)}{s([x_0, x_0 + h]) - x_0} = g(x_0)$$

and the theorem is proved.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] A.M. Bruckner - Differentiation of real function. Lecture Notes in Mathematics, 659, Springer-Verlag, New York 1978.
- [2] A.M. Bruckner, J.Ceder and M.Weiss - On the differentiability structure of real function. Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 142 (1969), 1-13.
- [3] V. Jarnik - Sur la dérivabilité des fonctions continues. Spisy Privadov. Fak. Univ. Korlovy 129 (1934), 3-9.
- [4] M. Laczkovich - On the Baire class of selective derivatives. Acta.Math. Sci. Hung. 29 (1977), 99-105.
- [5] R.J. O'Malley - Selective derivatives. Acta. Math. Sci. Hung. 29 (1977), 77-97.

*Received April 15, 1984.*