

K.M. Garg, Department of Mathematics,  
University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada T6G 2G1

On the classification of set-valued functions

Using a refined Baire classification of multifunctions (i.e. closed set-valued functions), we present here some new results on multifunctions which are similar in spirit to some of the well-known theorems on functions due to Baire, Lebesgue, Hausdorff, Hahn and Banach. These results were developed in connection with a new notion of derivative [3] which is set-valued.

1. Introduction. Given any topological space  $(Y, \mathcal{U})$ , let  $P(Y)$  denote the space of all closed subsets of  $Y$ . Define, for each  $U \in \mathcal{U}$ ,

$$U_* = \{F \in P(Y) : F \subset U\} \quad \text{and} \quad U^* = \{F \in P(Y) : F \cap U \neq \emptyset\}.$$

We shall use the Vietoris topology on the space  $P(Y)$  which is generated by the family  $\{U_* : U \in \mathcal{U}\} \cup \{U^* : U \in \mathcal{U}\}$ .

Given any other topological space  $X$ , let  $M(X, Y)$  denote the space of all multifunctions  $\phi : X \rightarrow P(Y)$ . We shall assume throughout that  $X$  is a perfect space, viz. every open set in  $X$  is an  $F_\sigma$ -set. Let  $M^*(X, Y)$  and  $M_k(X, Y)$  denote, further, the spaces of multifunctions in  $M(X, Y)$  whose values are nonempty or compact respectively. When  $Y$  is a topological vector space, we use similarly  $M_c(X, Y)$  to denote the space of convex-valued multifunctions in  $M(X, Y)$ . We set, further,  
 $M_{k,c}(X, Y) = M_k(X, Y) \cap M_c(X, Y)$ ,  $M_k^*(X, Y) = M^*(X, Y) \cap M_k(X, Y)$ , etc.

Next, given any countable ordinal number  $\alpha$ , a multifunction  $\phi \in M(X, Y)$  will be said to be of Baire class  $\alpha$  if for each open set  $G$  in  $P(Y)$  the set  $\phi^{-1}(G)$  is of additive class  $\alpha$  in  $X$ . Let  $\phi$  be said, further, to be of lower or upper

Baire class  $\alpha$  if for each open set  $U$  in  $Y$  the set  $\phi^{-1}(U^*)$  or  $\phi^{-1}(U_*)$  respectively is of additive class  $\alpha$  in  $X$ .

We shall use  $B_\alpha$  to denote the Baire class  $\alpha$  and  $LB_\alpha$  and  $UB_\alpha$  to denote the lower and upper Baire classes  $\alpha$  respectively. Thus  $LB_0$  and  $UB_0$  are the well-known classes of lower and upper semicontinuous multifunctions respectively, or briefly LSC and USC multifunctions respectively, and  $B_0$  is simply the class of continuous multifunctions (see e.g. [5, p. 173]).

The classes  $LB_\alpha$  and  $UB_\alpha$  have been considered by Kuratowski in one of his recent papers [6], under a different notation, where many of the known results on LSC and USC multifunctions have been extended to the general classes  $LB_\alpha$  and  $UB_\alpha$ . The results presented here are however new even for  $\alpha = 0$ .

Given any pair of multifunctions  $\phi, \psi \in M(X, Y)$ , we say  $\phi \subset \psi$  provided  $\phi(x) \subset \psi(x)$  for each  $x \in X$ . The multifunctions  $\phi \cup \psi$  and  $\phi \cap \psi$  are defined in turn by

$$(\phi \cup \psi)(x) = \phi(x) \cup \psi(x), (\phi \cap \psi)(x) = \phi(x) \cap \psi(x), x \in X.$$

Next, a sequence of multifunctions  $\{\phi_n\}$  in  $M(X, Y)$  will be said to converge to a multifunction  $\phi \in M(X, Y)$  if the sequence  $\{\phi_n(x)\}$  converges to  $\phi(x)$  in the Vietoris topology of  $P(Y)$  for each  $x \in X$ . Further,  $\{\phi_n\}$  will be called nondecreasing or nonincreasing if  $\phi_n \subset \phi_{n+1}$  or  $\phi_n \supset \phi_{n+1}$  respectively for each  $n$ . The multifunctions  $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n$  and  $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n$  are defined in turn by

$$\left(\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n\right)(x) = \left\{\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n(x)\right\}^-, \left(\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n\right)(x) = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n(x), x \in X.$$

Finally, if there exists a finite set of functions  $f_i: X \rightarrow Y$  ( $i=1, 2, \dots, n$ ) such that  $\phi = \bigcup_{i=1}^n f_i$ , then  $\phi$  will be called an elementary multifunction and  $\{f_i: i = 1, 2, \dots, n\}$  will be called

the elements of  $\phi$ .

We state here further a few elementary results on multifunctions. These results have been obtained in [6] in the case when  $Y$  is a compact metric space. Unless stated otherwise, we shall always assume  $\alpha$  to be an arbitrary countable ordinal number.

It is clear from the definitions that a multifunction  $\phi \in B_0$  iff  $\phi \in LB_0 \cap UB_0$ . For  $\alpha > 0$  we have, on the other hand,

1.1 THEOREM. If  $\phi \in M_k(X, Y)$  and  $Y$  is second countable, then  $\phi \in B_\alpha$  iff  $\phi \in LB_\alpha \cap UB_\alpha$ .

As regards the mutual relationship between the lower and upper Baire classes, we have

1.2 THEOREM. Suppose  $\phi \in M(X, Y)$  where  $Y$  is a perfect space.

(a) If  $\phi \in UB_\alpha$ , then  $\phi \in LB_{\alpha+1}$ .

(b) If  $\phi$  is compact-valued and in  $LB_\alpha$ , and if  $Y$  is further normal, then  $\phi \in UB_{\alpha+1}$ .

Thus if  $\phi \in M_k(X, Y)$ , where  $Y$  is a second countable perfect space, and if either (i)  $\phi \in UB_\alpha$  or (ii)  $Y$  is normal and  $\phi \in LB_\alpha$ , then  $\phi \in B_{\alpha+1}$ .

1.3 THEOREM. If two multifunctions  $\phi, \psi \in M(X, Y)$  are both in  $LB_\alpha$  or in  $UB_\alpha$ , then so is  $\phi \cup \psi$ .

Hence if all the elements of some elementary multifunction  $\phi \in M(X, Y)$  are in  $B_\alpha$ , it follows from Theorems 1.1 and 1.3 that  $\phi \in B_\alpha$  provided  $Y$  is second countable, and this holds for  $\alpha = 0$  without any hypothesis on  $Y$ .

To avoid further definitions, most of the results are presented here under the hypothesis of separability on  $Y$ . In the forthcoming paper we develop, however, a theory which applies to

nonseparable  $Y$  as well. An application of this theory yields extension of many results on the Baire classification of functions to functions with a nonseparable range. It yields also new results on the lower and upper Baire classes of real-valued functions which are defined similar to the Baire's definitions [1] of lower and upper semicontinuous functions.

2. Characterizations of  $LB_\alpha$  and  $UB_\alpha$ . We present here characterizations of multifunctions in  $LB_\alpha$  and  $UB_\alpha$  in terms of limits of monotone sequences of multifunctions in  $B_\alpha$ . These results are similar to the Baire's characterizations of lower and upper semicontinuous real-valued functions (see [1] or [4, p. 280]). There is however no duality between the classes  $LB_\alpha$  and  $UB_\alpha$ , and hence their characterizations are independent of each other.

Let us state first a general result on the Baire class of limits of monotone sequences of multifunctions.

2.1. THEOREM. Let  $\{\phi_n\}$  be a sequence of multifunctions in  $M(X, Y)$  and suppose  $Y$  is  $T_1$ .

(a) If  $\{\phi_n\}$  is nondecreasing and  $\phi_n \in LB_\alpha$  for each  $n$ , then  $\{\phi_n\}$  converges to  $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n$  which is in  $LB_\alpha$ .

(b) If  $\{\phi_n\}$  is nonincreasing and  $\phi_n$  is compact-valued and in  $UB_\alpha$  for each  $n$ , then  $\{\phi_n\}$  converges to  $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \phi_n$  which is in  $UB_\alpha$ .

2.2. THEOREM. Suppose  $Y$  is a separable metric space,  $\phi \in M^*(X, Y)$  is complete-valued and that  $\alpha > 0$ . Then  $\phi \in LB_\alpha$  iff it is the limit of a nondecreasing sequence of elementary multifunctions  $\{\phi_n\}$  whose elements are in  $B_\alpha$ .

The above theorem is easily seen to contain the selection theorem of Kuratowski and Ryll-Nardzewski [7]. It does not hold in

general for  $\alpha = 0$ . But we do have in that case the following theorem on convex-valued multifunctions which in turn contains two selection theorems of Michael [9].

2.3. THEOREM. Suppose  $Y$  is a metrizable locally convex space,  $\phi \in M_c^*(X, Y)$  and that one of the following two conditions holds:

- (i)  $X$  is normal,  $Y$  is separable and  $\phi$  is complete-valued,
- (ii)  $X$  is collectionwise normal and  $\phi$  is compact-valued.

Then  $\phi$  is LSC iff it is the limit of a nondecreasing sequence of elementary multifunctions  $\{\phi_n\}$  whose elements are continuous.

For the multifunctions in  $UB_\alpha$  we have similarly the following characterizations which hold for  $\alpha > 0$  and  $\alpha = 0$ .

2.4. THEOREM. Suppose  $Y$  is a locally compact separable metric space,  $\phi \in M_k(X, Y)$  and that  $\alpha > 0$ . Then  $\phi \in UB_\alpha$  iff it is the limit of a nonincreasing sequence of compact-valued multifunctions  $\{\phi_n\}$  in  $B_\alpha$ .

2.5. THEOREM. Suppose  $X$  is normal,  $Y$  is a separable normed vector space,  $\phi \in M_{k,c}^*(X, Y)$  and that there exists a continuous multifunction  $\psi$  in  $M_{k,c}(X, Y)$  such that  $\phi \subset \psi$ . Then  $\phi$  is USC iff it is the limit of a nonincreasing sequence of continuous multifunctions  $\{\phi_n\}$  in  $M_{k,c}(X, Y)$ .

3. Representation of multifunctions in  $B_\alpha$  as limits of elementary multifunctions in lower Baire classes. Let us state first a general result on the Baire class of limits of sequences of multifunctions.

3.1. THEOREM. Suppose  $Y$  is perfectly normal and let  $\{\phi_n\}$  be a

sequence of multifunctions in  $M(X,Y)$  which converges to  $\phi$ .

- (a) If  $\phi_n \in UB_\alpha$  for each  $n$ , then  $\phi \in LB_{\alpha+1}$ .
- (b) If  $\phi$  is compact-valued and  $\phi_n \in LB_\alpha$  for each  $n$ , then  $\phi \in UB_{\alpha+1}$ .
- (c) If  $\phi$  is compact-valued,  $Y$  is second countable and  $\phi_n \in B_\alpha$  for each  $n$ , then  $\phi \in B_{\alpha+1}$ .

The following theorem extends a well-known theorem on functions [5, p. 390] to multifunctions and it is easy to see that the result on functions is contained in this theorem.

**3.2. THEOREM.** Suppose  $Y$  is separable and metrizable,  $\phi \in M_k^*(X,Y)$  and that  $\alpha > 1$ . If  $\phi \in B_\alpha$ , then  $\phi$  is the limit of a sequence of elementary multifunctions  $\{\phi_n\}$  whose elements are in Baire classes lower than  $\alpha$ .

Moreover, if  $\alpha = \lambda+1$  where  $\lambda$  is a limit ordinal, then the elements of each  $\phi_n$  can be chosen to be in Baire classes lower than  $\lambda$ .

In the case when  $\alpha = 1$  we have, on the other hand,

**3.3. THEOREM.** Suppose  $\phi \in M_k^*(X,Y)$ , where  $X$  is normal and  $Y$  is a separable metrizable absolute retract (for metrizable spaces). Then  $\phi \in B_1$  iff it is the limit of a sequence of elementary multifunctions  $\{\phi_n\}$  whose elements are continuous.

The above theorem contains a similar result on functions which generalizes the existing results in that direction (see e.g. [5, p. 391] and Banach [2]).

Next, we obtain with the help of the above theorems an extension of the classical Lebesgue-Hausdorff theorem [5, p. 393] to multifunctions. The analytic classes of multifunctions are defined as usual using transfinite induction. The analytic class 0 consists of all continuous multifunctions and, for each countable ordinal  $\alpha > 0$ , the analytic class  $\alpha$  is defined to be

the class of all pointwise limits of sequences of multifunctions of analytic classes lower than  $\alpha$ .

3.4. THEOREM. Suppose  $\phi \in M_k^*(X, Y)$ , where  $X$  is normal and  $Y$  is a separable metrizable absolute retract. Then  $\phi$  is in analytic class  $\alpha$  iff it is in  $B_\alpha$  or  $B_{\alpha+1}$  according as  $\alpha$  is finite or infinite.

The same holds for a function  $f: X \rightarrow Y$  in terms of its analytic class as a function.

The last part of the above theorem generalizes all the existing versions of the Lebesgue-Hausdorff theorem due to Lebesgue [8], Hausdorff [4], Kuratowski [5, p. 393] and Banach [2].

4. Interposition theorems. We present here two interposition theorems on multifunctions which are similar to the interposition theorem of Hahn on real-valued functions (see [4, p. 281]).

4.1. THEOREM. Suppose  $\phi, \psi \in M(X, Y)$ , where  $Y$  is a separable metric space,  $\phi$  is compact-valued and  $\psi$  is complete-valued, and let  $\alpha > 0$ . If  $\phi \in UB_\alpha$ ,  $\psi \in LB_\alpha$  and  $\phi \subset \psi$ , then there exists a multifunction  $\theta \in B_\alpha$  such that  $\phi \subset \theta \subset \psi$ .

The above theorem does not hold in general for  $\alpha = 0$ . But we do have in that case the following theorem on convex-valued multifunctions. The weak continuity refers here to the continuity relative to the Vietoris topology generated by the weak topology of  $Y$ .

4.2. THEOREM. Suppose  $X$  is normal,  $Y$  is a separable reflexive normed vector space,  $\phi, \psi \in M_c(X, Y)$  and that one of the following conditions holds:

- (i)  $\phi$  is compact-valued and  $\psi$  is nonempty-valued,

(ii)  $\phi$  has nonempty weakly compact values and the dual space  $Y^*$  is separable.

If  $\phi \in \text{USC}$ ,  $\phi$  is LSC and  $\phi \subset \psi$ , then there exists a weakly continuous multifunction  $\theta \in M_C^*(X, Y)$  with weakly compact values such that  $\phi \subset \theta \subset \psi$ .

#### REFERENCES

1. R. Baire, Sur les fonctions des variables réelles, Ann. Mat. Pura Appl. (3) 3(1899), 1-123.
2. S. Banach, Über analytisch darstellbare Operationen in abstrakten Räumen, Fund. Math. 17(1931), 283-295.
3. K.M. Garg, A new notion of derivative, Real Analysis Exchange 7(1981-82), 65-84.
4. F. Hausdorff, Set Theory, Chelsea, New York, 1957.
5. K. Kuratowski, Topology, Vol. I, Academic Press, New York, 1966.
6. K. Kuratowski, On set-valued B-measurable mappings and a theorem of Hausdorff, Theory of Sets and Topology (in honour of Felix Hausdorff, 1868-1942), VEB Deutsch. Verlag Wissensch., Berlin, 1972, pp. 355-362.
7. K. Kuratowski and C. Ryll-Nardzewski, A general theorem on selectors, Bull. Acad. Polon. Sci. Sér. Sci. Math. Astronom. Phys. 13(1965), 397-403.
8. H. Lebesgue, Sur les fonctions représentable analytiquement, J. Math. Pures Appl. (6) 1(1905), 139-216.
9. E. Michael, Continuous selections. I, Ann. Math. 63(1956), 361-382.