

Review of
**W. D. HART (ED.), *THE PHILOSOPHY OF
MATHEMATICS***

New York: Oxford University Press, 1996
vi + 316 pp. ISBN 0-19-875119-2 and ISBN 0-19-875120-6 (Pbk)

IGNACIO ANGELELLI

This is a collection of thirteen previously published papers on the philosophy of mathematics. Here is the list of authors and titles, in their order within the volume: P. Benacerraf: *Mathematical truth*, W. V. Quine: *Two dogmas of empiricism*, W. D. Hart: *Access and inference*, M. Dummett: *The philosophical basis of intuitionistic logic*, Ch. Parsons: *Mathematical intuition*, P. Maddy: *Perception and mathematical intuition*, W. W. Tait: *Truth and proof: the platonism of mathematics*, H. Putnam: *Mathematics without foundations*, G. Boolos: *The consistency of Frege's "Foundations of arithmetic"*, D. Isaacson: *Arithmetical truth and hidden higher-order concepts*, St. Shapiro: *Conservativeness and incompleteness*, H. Field: *Is mathematical knowledge just logical knowledge?*, Ch. Parsons: *The structuralist view of mathematical objects*. Aside from these thirteen papers, there is an *Introduction* by the editor, *Notes on the contributors*, and *Suggestions for further reading*.

I will describe the main points of each contribution, interjecting, here and there, my comments on some of the numerous themes discussed (in my references, I will just give the page number, omitting "p." or "page").

Benacerraf's paper, as well as much of Hart's anthology (as it appears from Hart's *Introduction* and from the fact that Benacerraf's paper is number one in the selected sequence)¹ hinges on "Benacerraf's dilemma", which is that the requirements of *truth* and *knowledge* cannot be both satisfied in the philosophy of mathematics. On the one

© 2000 *Modern Logic*.

¹In the *Index of Names* "Benacerraf" boasts 19 references, second only to Quine (22) and ahead of Hilbert and Russell (17), Gödel, Frege and Putnam (16). These figures, however, may have to be revised because the index of names is not accurate in the sense of not listing all pages in which a name occurs (*e.g.* "Cantor", "Husserl" are on 302 but this page is not mentioned in the index).