EXAMPLE OF A PROPER SUBGROUP OF S_{∞} WHICH HAS A SET-TRANSITIVITY PROPERTY¹

BY GERALD STOLLER

Communicated by A. M. Gleason, November 16, 1962

S. M. Ulam, on page 33 of his book, A collection of mathematical problems, poses the following question: Let G be a subgroup of S_{∞} [the group of all permutations of the integers] with the property that for every two sets of integers of the same power whose complements are also of the same power, there exists a permutation g of G which transforms one set into the other. Is $G = S_{\infty}$ (Chevalley, von Neumann, et al.)?

The answer to this question is no!

We change the problem immaterially by taking S_{∞} to be the group of all permutations of the natural numbers rather than the integers; this is helpful since all infinite subsets of the natural numbers are order-isomorphic. A subgroup G which is transitive (wherever possible) on the set of all subsets of the natural numbers is defined by means of a finiteness condition.

Let N be the set of natural numbers with the usual ordering. Consider the set G of all $\sigma \in S_{\infty}$ satisfying the condition:

(F) there exist $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_k, B_1, B_2, \dots, B_k$ subsets of N such that $\bigcup_{i=1}^{k} A_i = N = \bigcup_{i=1}^{k} B_i$ and in addition, for all $i, \sigma: A_i \rightarrow B_i$ is an order-isomorphism.

Call $\{(A_1, B_1), (A_2, B_2), \dots, (A_k, B_k)\}$ a class of order-pairs for σ . Let $\sigma, \tau \in G$ where $\{(A_1, B_1), \dots, (A_k, B_k)\}$ & $\{(C_1, D_1), \dots, (C_q, D_q)\}$ are classes of order-pairs for $\sigma \& \tau$ respectively. It is easily seen that

$$\left\{(\sigma^{-1}[B_i \cap C_j], \tau[B_i \cap C_j]): i \in \{1, \cdots, k\} \& j \in \{1, \cdots, q\}\right\}$$

is a class of order-pairs for $\tau\sigma$, so that $\tau\sigma\in G$. Also $\sigma^{-1}\in G$ since $\{(B_1, A_1), (B_2, A_2), \cdots, (B_k, A_k)\}$ is a class of order-pairs for σ^{-1} . Consequently (since G is obviously nonempty) G is a subgroup of S_{∞} .

That G has the property stated in the problem is clear since subsets of N having the same power are order-isomorphic. The (at most) two order-isomorphisms needed allow us to define an element of G as required.

An element ρ of S_{∞} which reverses arbitrarily long strings of natural numbers cannot be in G. For example, ρ can be given by: $\rho(m) = (n+1)^2 - (m+1-n^2)$ where $n^2 \leq m < (n+1)^2$. Suppose that ρ satis-

¹ Research supported by N.S.F. Graduate Fellowship Number 22113 (1962-1963).