

## SOME REMARKS ON SET THEORY III

by  
Paul Erdős

This paper continues the treatment of some problems which were discussed in two unnumbered earlier communications [1], [2] of the same title.

1. ON A PROBLEM OF TURÁN. Suppose that with every real number  $x$  there is associated a set  $S(x)$  of real numbers, called the picture of  $x$ , and subject to the restriction that  $x$  is not contained in  $S(x)$ . A pair of points  $x$  and  $y$  is then called independent provided neither point is contained in the picture of the other; a set  $E$  is called independent if each pair of points in  $E$  is independent.

In an oral communication, P. Turán asked whether the hypothesis that each of the pictures  $S(x)$  is finite implies the existence of an infinite independent set. Grünwald [5] showed that the answer is in the affirmative. Lázár [7] proved that there exists an independent set of power  $c$ . Fodor [3], [4] pointed out that Lázár's proof gives a stronger result: if no point  $x$  is a limit point of its picture  $S(x)$ , there exists an independent set  $E$  with  $\overline{\overline{E}} = c$  (throughout this paper, the symbol  $\overline{\overline{E}}$  denotes the cardinal number of  $E$ ).

The remainder of this section deals with other hypotheses on the pictures  $S(x)$ , and with the question whether or not these hypotheses imply the existence of independent sets of certain cardinalities.

**THEOREM 1.** The hypothesis  $\overline{\overline{S(x)}} < c$  does not imply the existence of an independent pair.

Let  $\Omega_c$  be the least ordinal of power  $c$ . We arrange the real numbers in a transfinite sequence

$$\{x_0, x_1, \dots, x_\xi, \dots\} (\xi < \Omega_c),$$

and for  $x = x_\alpha$  we define

$$S(x) = \{x_\beta \mid \beta < \alpha\}.$$

The example proves the theorem.

---

Received by the editors in November, 1953.

Research supported in part by the Office of Naval Research.