

More about Thoughts

MICHAEL DUMMETT

Dramatis Personae

- Thesis 1: A thought is isomorphic with the sentence whose sense it is.
 Thesis 3: Every unambiguous sentence has a unique function-argument analysis.
- Sentence A1: a is parallel to b .
 Sentence A2: The direction of $a =$ the direction of b .
 Sentence B1: For every a , $f(a) = g(a)$.
 Sentence B2: The value-range of $f =$ the value-range of g .
 Sentence C1: There are just as many F 's as G 's.
 Sentence C2: The number of F 's is the same as the number of G 's.
 Sentence D1: There exist unicorns.
 Sentence D2: The number of unicorns is not nought.
 Sentence E1: Jupiter has four moons.
 Sentence E2: The number of Jupiter's moons is four.
- Thesis T: The two sentences in each of the pairs A to E express the same sense or have the same content.
- Criterion R: Anyone who grasps the thought expressed by each of a given pair of sentences must immediately recognize one as true if he recognizes the other as true.
- Principle K: If one sentence involves a concept that another sentence does not involve, the two sentences cannot express the same thought or have the same content.

Two fundamental theses In his exceedingly illuminating article "Thoughts" (see [1]), Dr. David Bell sets out a number of requirements that he believes that any successful philosophical theory of thoughts must meet. He believes that Frege's theory of thoughts comes closest, of any yet propounded, to meeting them; and he argues that, among the theses essential to that theory, are those he labels 'Thesis 1' and 'Thesis 3' (see *Dramatis Personae* above). These theses,

Received May 2, 1988; revised August 25, 1988