encephalitis: A case-control study. *Amer. J. Epidemiol.* **111** 415–424.

HAMILTON, M. A. (1979). Choosing a parameter for 2 × 2 table or 2 × 2 × 2 table analysis. *Amer. J. Epidemiol.* **109** 362–375.

HILL, A. B. (1965). The environment and disease: Association or causation? *Proc. Roy. Soc. Med.* **58** 295–300.

HILLER, R., GIACOMETTI, L. and YUEN, K. (1977). Sunlight and cataract: An epidemiologic investigation. *Amer. J. Epidemiol.* **105** 450–459.

HOLLAND, P. W. (1986a). Which comes first, cause or effect? *New York Statist.* **38** 1–6.

HOLLAND, P. W. (1986b). Statistics and causal inference (with discussion). *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **81** 945–970.

HOLLAND, P. W. and RUBIN, D. B. (1980). Causal inference in prospective and retrospective studies. J. Cornfield Memorial Lecture at the American Statistical Association Meetings. Unpublished manuscript.

HOLLAND, P. W. and RUBIN, D. B. (1983). On Lord's paradox. In *Principles of Modern Psychological Measurement: Festschrift for Frederick M. Lord* (H. Wainer and S. Messick, eds.). Lawrence Earlbaum, Hillsdale, N. J.

KEMPTHORNE, O. (1952). *The Design and Analysis of Experiments.* Wiley, New York.

LEHMANN, E. L. (1959). *Testing Statistical Hypotheses.* Wiley, New York.

LEHMANN, E. L. (1966). Some concepts of dependence. *Ann. Math. Statist.* **37** 1137–1153.

LILIENFELD, A. M. and LILIENFELD, D. E. (1980). *Foundations of Epidemiology,* 2nd ed. Oxford Univ. Press, New York.

MACMAHON, B. (1984). Coffee and cancer of the pancreas: A review. In *Coffee and Health* (B. MacMahon and T. Sugimura, eds.) 109–115. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory, Cold Spring Harbor, N. Y.

MACMAHON, B. and PUGH, T. (1970). *Epidemiology: Principles and Methods.* Little, Brown, Boston.

MANTEL, N. (1973). Synthetic retrospective studies and related topics. *Biometrics* **29** 479–486.

MANTEL, N. and HAENSZEL, W. (1959). Statistical aspects of retrospective studies of disease. *J. Nat. Cancer Inst.* **22** 719–748.

POPPER, K. (1959). *The Logic of Scientific Discovery.* Harper and Row, New York.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1984a). From association to causation in observational studies: The role of tests of strongly ignorable treatment assignment. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **79** 41–48.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1984b). Conditional permutation tests and the propensity score in observational studies. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **79** 565–574.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1984c). The consequences of adjustment for a concomitant variable that has been affected by the treatment. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. A* **147** 656–666.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1986). Dropping out of high school in the United States: An observational study. *J. Educat. Statist.* **11** 207–224.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. (1987). Sensitivity analysis for certain permutation inferences in matched observational studies. *Biometrika* **74** 13–26.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. and RUBIN, D. B. (1983a). The central role of the propensity score in observational studies for causal effects. *Biometrika* **70** 41–55.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. and RUBIN, D. B. (1983b). Assessing sensitivity to an unobserved binary covariate in an observational study with binary outcome. *J. Roy. Statist. Soc. Ser. B* **45** 212–218.

ROSENBAUM, P. R. and RUBIN, D. B. (1985). The bias due to incomplete matching. *Biometrics* **41** 103–116.

RUBIN, D. B. (1974). Estimating causal effects of treatments in randomized and nonrandomized studies. *J. Educat. Psychol.* **66** 688–701.

RUBIN, D. B. (1977). Assignment to treatment group on the basis of a covariate. *J. Educat. Statist.* **2** 1–26.

RUBIN, D. B. (1978). Bayesian inference for causal effects: The role of randomization. *Ann. Statist.* **6** 34–58.

RUBIN, D. B. (1980). Discussion of "Randomization analysis of experimental data: The Fisher randomization test," by D. Basu. *J. Amer. Statist. Assoc.* **75** 591–593.

SOLOMON, R. L. (1949). An extension of the control group design. *Psychol. Bull.* **46** 137–150.

WELCH, B. L. (1937). On the z-test in randomized blocks and Latin squares. *Biometrika* **29** 21–52.

YERUSHALMY, J. and PALMER, C. E. (1959). On the methodology of investigations of etiologic factors in chronic diseases. *J. Chronic Dis.* **10** 27–40.

Comment

Paul W. Holland

I am pleased to see that Rosenbaum's work is included in *Statistical Science*—for two reasons. First, observational studies are very common in scientific work and yet from a theoretical perspective they are poorly understood, often maligned and rarely subjected to serious formal analysis. Rosenbaum's discus-

Paul W. Holland is Distinguished Research Scholar and Director of the Research Statistics Group, Educational Testing Service, 21-T Rosedale Road, Princeton, New Jersey 08541.

sion here and elsewhere shows that a formal analysis can lead to useful, practical tools that can help in the design and analysis of nonrandomized studies. Such work ought to be widely publicized and *Statistical Science* is an attractive forum. Second, the particular formal analysis used here by Rosenbaum elaborates and extends the approach I call "Rubin's model" (Holland, 1986a, 1986b) and which I personally feel needs to become wider known and used by mathematical statisticians. My experience over the last 10 years has been that *any* problem involving causal inferences (e.g., inferences about the effects of treatments) is