

## A CONVERGENCE THEOREM FOR THE BIRKHOFF INTEGRAL

MAREK BALCERZAK, KAZIMIERZ MUSIAŁ

Dedicated to Lech Drewnowski on  
the occasion of his 70th birthday

**Abstract:** We propose an essential improvement of a convergence theorem for the Birkhoff integral. We also obtain the respective version of this result for the convergence associated with an ideal on  $\mathbb{N}$ .

**Keywords:** convergence theorems for integrals, Pettis integral, Birkhoff integral.

### 1. Introduction

Several kinds of integrals for Banach space valued functions are known. For each of them, convergence theorems are always important because of their possible applications. Recently, we have obtained a new Vitali-type convergence theorem for the Pettis integral [2] using the notion of scalar equi-convergence in measure for a sequence of Banach space valued functions. We will use it in the main result of this paper. Our purpose is to improve a convergence theorem for the Birkhoff integral due to Rodríguez [24]. Besides this, we provide the respective example witnessing that our improvement is essential, and we formulate a counterpart of the theorem for the convergence associated with an ideal on  $\mathbb{N} := \{1, 2, \dots\}$ .

Through the paper,  $(\Omega, \Sigma, \mu)$  stands for a complete probability space. A family  $\mathcal{F}$  of real-valued Lebesgue integrable functions on  $\Omega$  is said to be *uniformly integrable* if  $\sup\{\int_{\Omega} |f| d\mu : f \in \mathcal{F}\} < \infty$  and for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is  $\delta > 0$  such that  $\int_A |f| d\mu < \varepsilon$  for all  $f \in \mathcal{F}$  and  $A \in \Sigma$  with  $\mu(A) < \delta$ . Throughout,  $X$  is a real Banach space with its dual  $X^*$  and  $B(X) := \{x \in X : \|x\| \leq 1\}$ . For  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  we denote  $\mathcal{Z}_f := \{x^* f : \|x^*\| \leq 1\}$ .

We refer the reader to [6] and [18] for basic terminology from the theory of integral for vector-valued functions. A scalarly measurable function  $f$  is called *Pettis integrable* if  $x^* f \in L_1(\Omega, \mu)$  for all  $x^* \in X^*$ , and for each  $E \in \Sigma$  there

---

The work has been supported by the Polish Ministry of Science and Higher Education Grants: No. N N201 414939 – for the first author, and No. N N201 416139 – for the second author.

**2010 Mathematics Subject Classification:** primary: 28A20; secondary: 28B05, 40A30, 46G10

is  $\nu_f(E) \in X$  such that  $x^*\nu_f(E) = \int_E x^*f d\mu$  for all  $x^* \in X^*$ . Then  $\nu_f(E)$  is called the *Pettis integral* of  $f$  over  $E$  with respect to  $\mu$ . The Pettis integral is more general than the Bochner integral, usually treated as a counterpart of the Lebesgue integral for  $X$ -valued strongly measurable functions.

The space of  $X$ -valued Pettis  $\mu$ -integrable functions can be endowed with a norm defined by  $\|f\|_P := \sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \int_\Omega |x^*f| d\mu$ . It is known that in general this space is not complete. An equivalent norm can be defined by  $\|f\| = \sup_{E \in \Sigma} \|\int_E f d\mu\|$ . It follows from this fact that the convergence in the Pettis norm coincides with the uniform convergence of the integrals on the  $\sigma$ -algebra  $\Sigma$ . For a survey on the Pettis integral, see [18] (cf. also [17]).

A sequence  $(f_n)$  of  $X$ -valued scalarly measurable functions is called *scalarly convergent in measure* to a scalarly measurable function  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  if for each  $x^* \in X^*$  the sequence  $(x^*f_n)$  is convergent in measure to  $x^*f$ . The following Vitali-type theorem for Pettis integral is due to Musiał [16, Theorem 1] (see also [17, Theorem 8.1] and [18, Theorem 5.2]).

**Theorem 1.** [16] *Let  $f_n, n \in \mathbb{N}$ , be Pettis integrable functions from  $\Omega$  to  $X$  such that  $\bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} Z_{f_n}$  is uniformly integrable and  $(f_n)$  is scalarly convergent in measure to  $f$ . Then  $f$  is Pettis integrable and  $\int_E f_n \rightarrow \int_E f$  weakly for each  $E \in \Sigma$ .*

In [2] we introduced a stronger notion called a scalar equi-convergence in measure. Namely, we say that a sequence of scalarly measurable functions  $f_n: \Omega \rightarrow X, n \in \mathbb{N}$ , is *scalarly equi-convergent in measure* to a scalarly measurable function  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  if for every  $\delta > 0$  we have

$$\lim_n \sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \mu\{t \in \Omega : |x^*f_n(t) - x^*f(t)| > \delta\} = 0.$$

Note that, if a sequence of scalarly integrable functions  $f_n: \Omega \rightarrow X, n \in \mathbb{N}$ , is convergent to a scalarly integrable function  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  in the Pettis norm, then it is scalarly equi-convergent in measure to  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$ .

If  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  is a scalarly measurable function, we can define (cf. [2]) the following translation invariant F-norm

$$|f|_\mu := \inf \left\{ \lambda > 0 : \sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \mu\{|x^*f| \geq \lambda\} \leq \lambda \right\}.$$

The convergence in this F-norm is equivalent to scalar equi-convergence in measure.

Scalar equi-convergence in measure can be compared with other kinds of convergence as follows.

**Lemma 2.** [2] *Let  $f_n: \Omega \rightarrow X, n \in \mathbb{N}$ , and  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  be scalarly measurable functions. We then have (A)  $\Rightarrow$  (B)  $\Rightarrow$  (C)  $\Rightarrow$  (D) where*

- (A)  $(f_n)$  is  $\mu$ -a.e. convergent in the norm topology of  $X$  to  $f$ ;
- (B)  $\forall \delta > 0 \lim_n \mu_*\{\|f_n - f\| > \delta\} = 0$  ( $\mu_*$  is inner measure induced by  $\mu$ );
- (C)  $(f_n)$  is scalarly equi-convergent in measure to  $f$ ;
- (D)  $(f_n)$  is scalarly convergent in measure to  $f$ .

It was observed in [2] that no implication stated in Lemma 2 is reversible.

A new Vitali-type convergence theorem obtained in [2] is the following. It improves [24, Theorem 2.8] and [19, Corollary 5.3].

**Theorem 3.** [2] *Let functions  $f_n: \Omega \rightarrow X$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , be Pettis integrable and let  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  be scalarly measurable. The following conditions are equivalent:*

- (a)  *$(f_n)$  is scalarly equi-convergent in measure to  $f$  and  $\bigcup_n \mathcal{Z}_{f_n}$  is uniformly integrable;*
- (b)  *$f$  is Pettis integrable and  $\lim_n \|f_n - f\|_P = 0$ .*

*In particular, (a) implies that  $\lim_n \left\| \int_E f_n d\mu - \int_E f d\mu \right\| = 0$  uniformly with respect to  $E \in \Sigma$ .*

## 2. Results

In the recent years, a number of works have been devoted to the Birkhoff integral [4] located between the Bochner and the Pettis integrals (see [5], [22], [23], [24], [3]). A function  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  is called *Birkhoff integrable* with integral  $x = \int_\Omega f d\mu \in X$  if for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a countable partition  $(A_m)$  of  $\Omega$  with  $A_m \in \Sigma$  such that, for any choice of points  $t_m \in A_m$ , the series  $\sum_m f(t_m)\mu(A_m)$  converges unconditionally in  $X$  and  $\|\sum_m f(t_m)\mu(A_m) - x\| \leq \varepsilon$ . Cascales and Rodríguez [5] discovered that  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  is Birkhoff integrable if and only if  $\mathcal{Z}_f$  is uniformly integrable and has the Bourgain property. (A family  $\mathcal{H} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^\Omega$  is said to have the *Bourgain property* if for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  and every  $A \in \Sigma$  with  $\mu(A) > 0$  there are  $A_1, \dots, A_n \in \Sigma$ ,  $A_i \subseteq A$  with  $\mu(A_i) > 0$  and  $\min_{1 \leq i \leq n} \text{osc}(h|_{A_i}) \leq \varepsilon$  for each  $h \in \mathcal{H}$ .)

Several convergence theorems for the Birkhoff integral were discussed in [22], [23], [24] and [3]. Rodríguez showed in [22], [23] that the classical Lebesgue dominated convergence theorem need not hold for the Birkhoff integral. Following [3], we say that a family  $\{f_n: n \in \mathbb{N}\} \subseteq X^\Omega$  is *Birkhoff equi-integrable* if for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a countable  $\Sigma$ -partition  $(A_m)$  of  $\Omega$  such that for any choice of points  $t_m \in A_m$  we have:

- for each  $\delta > 0$  there is  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $\|\sum_{m \in M} f_n(t_m)\mu(A_m)\| \leq \delta$  for every finite set  $M \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  disjoint from  $\{1, \dots, k\}$  and all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  (in particular, each series  $\sum_m f_n(t_m)\mu(A_m)$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , converges unconditionally in  $X$ );
- $\|\sum_m f_n(t_m)\mu(A_m) - \int_\Omega f_n d\mu\| \leq \varepsilon$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Note that each member of a Birkhoff equi-integrable family is Birkhoff integrable and every infinite subset of a Birkhoff equi-integrable family is Birkhoff equi-integrable.

The following result was first proved in [3] for norm convergence, and shown again in a different way in [24] where also weak convergence was considered.

**Theorem 4 ([24], [3]).** *Let  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$  and  $f_n: \Omega \rightarrow X$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , where  $\{f_n: n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is Birkhoff equi-integrable. If  $(f_n)$  is convergent pointwise in norm (weakly) to  $f$  then  $f$  is Birkhoff integrable and  $\int_E f_n d\mu \rightarrow \int_E f d\mu$  in norm (weakly) for every  $E \in \Sigma$ .*

We propose the following improvement of this theorem:

**Theorem 5.** *Let  $(f_n)$  be a pointwise bounded sequence of Birkhoff equi-integrable functions  $f_n: \Omega \rightarrow X$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , which is scalarly convergent in measure to a function  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$ . If  $\mathcal{Z}_f$  is contained in the pointwise closure of  $\bigcup_n \mathcal{Z}_{f_n}$ , then  $f$  is Birkhoff integrable and*

$$\lim_n \int_{\Omega} |x^* f_n - x^* f| d\mu = 0 \quad \text{for every } x^* \in X^*. \tag{1}$$

Moreover, if the sequence  $(f_n)$  is scalarly equi-convergent in measure to  $f$ , then

$$\lim_n \|f_n - f\|_P = 0. \tag{2}$$

In particular,

$$\lim_n \left\| \int_E f_n d\mu - \int_E f d\mu \right\| = 0 \quad \text{uniformly with respect to } E \in \Sigma.$$

**Proof.** According to [24, Proposition 2.11] the set  $\bigcup_n \mathcal{Z}_{f_n}$  is uniformly integrable and has the Bourgain property. By the assumption,  $\mathcal{Z}_f$  is contained in the pointwise closure of  $\bigcup_n \mathcal{Z}_{f_n}$ , and we know that the Bourgain property is preserved by taking pointwise closures (cf. [21, Theorem 11]). Consequently,  $\mathcal{Z}_f$  has the Bourgain property. Applying the assumed convergence in measure, we obtain the uniform integrability of the set  $\mathcal{Z}_f$ . Then applying the Cascales-Rodríguez theorem [5], we get the Birkhoff integrability of  $f$ . Condition (1) follows from Theorem 1, and condition (2) is a consequence of Theorem 3. ■

It is obvious that the above result generalizes Theorem 4 in the case of weak convergence. However, to show that this improvement is essential, we need an example.

**Example 1.** Let  $(\Omega, \Sigma, \mu)$  be a non-atomic probability space such that there exists a sequence  $(E_n)_n$  of elements of  $\Sigma$  generating an algebra that is  $\mu$ -dense in  $\Sigma$ . If  $X$  is separable,  $l_1 \not\subseteq X$  and  $X^*$  is non-separable, then there exists a Pettis integrable bounded function  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X^*$  that is not weak\* equivalent to any strongly measurable  $X^*$ -valued function (see [14]). Without loss of generality, we may assume that for a lifting  $\rho$  on  $L_{\infty}(\mu)$  the function  $f$  satisfies for every  $x \in X$  the equality  $xf = \rho(xf)$ . It follows then from [17, Corollary 12.1] that the set  $\{xf: \|x\| \leq 1\}$  and then  $\mathcal{Z}_f$  have the Bourgain property. In virtue of [5],  $f$  is Birkhoff integrable.

For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  let  $\pi_n$  be the partition generated by the sets  $E_1, \dots, E_n$ . For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  let

$$f_n := \sum_{E \in \pi_n} \frac{(P) \int_E f d\mu}{\mu(E)} \quad \text{with the convention } 0/0 = 0.$$

One can easily check that  $\{(f_n, \sigma(\pi_n)): n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a bounded martingale; in particular, for each  $x^{**} \in X^{**}$ , the sequence  $\{((x^{**} f_n), \sigma(\pi_n)): n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a real valued

uniformly integrable martingale. Moreover,  $\mathbb{E}(x^{**}f|\sigma(\pi_n)) = x^{**}f_n$   $\mu$ -a.e. for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Hence, if  $\tilde{\Sigma} = \sigma(\{E_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\})$ , then  $\lim_n x^{**}f_n = \mathbb{E}((x^{**}f)|\tilde{\Sigma}) = x^{**}f$  in  $L_1(\mu|\tilde{\Sigma})$  and  $\mu$ -a.e.

If  $\{x_k : k \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a norm dense in  $B(X)$  then, one can extract  $N \in \Sigma$  of measure zero such that for each  $k$  and each  $t \notin N$  we have  $\lim_n x_k f_n(t) = x_k f(t)$ . Since

$$\sup_n \sup_{t \in \Omega} \max\{\|f_n(t)\|, \|f(t)\|\} < \infty,$$

it follows that  $\lim_n x f_n(t) = x f(t)$  for every  $x \in X$  and every  $t \notin N$ .

Set now, for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $g_n := f_n \chi_{N^c}$  and  $g := f \chi_{N^c}$ . It is obvious that  $g$  is Birkhoff integrable and  $g_n \rightarrow g$  pointwise in the weak\* topology. Since  $g$  is not scalarly equivalent to any strongly measurable function, no subsequence of  $(g_n)_n$  can converge a.e. weakly to  $g$ .

By the same reason,  $g$  cannot be a pointwise weak limit of any sequence of strongly measurable functions.

But  $X$  is separable, and so, due to Rosenthal's subsequence theorem, if  $x^{**} \in B(X^{**})$ , then there is a subsequence  $(y_k)_k$  in  $B(X)$  satisfying the equality  $\lim_k y_k = x^{**}$  in the weak\* topology of  $X^{**}$ . It follows that  $x^{**}g$  is in the pointwise closure of  $\{xg : \|x\| \leq 1\}$ . But each  $xg$  is in the pointwise closure of the set  $\{xg_n : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$ . This proves that  $\mathcal{Z}_g$  is contained in the pointwise closure of  $\bigcup_n \mathcal{Z}_{g_n}$ . ■

Recently, extensive studies have been developed in various applications of a generalized kind of convergence associated with an ideal (or, equivalently, with a filter) of subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ . (cf. [13, 20, 9, 10, 11, 8, 7, 1, 12]). If  $\mathcal{I}$  is an ideal of subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ , we say (cf. [13], [20]) that a sequence  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  of real numbers is  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergent to  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  if for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  we have  $\{n \in \mathbb{N} : |x_n - x| > \varepsilon\} \in \mathcal{I}$ . We then write  $\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n x_n = x$ . Note that the usual convergence implies  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergence, while the converse is not true in general. If functions  $f : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and  $f_n : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , are measurable, we say (cf. [1]) that  $(f_n)$  is  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergent in measure to  $f$  whenever

$$\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n \mu(\{t \in \Omega : |f_n(t) - f(t)| > \delta\}) = 0$$

for every  $\delta > 0$ .

The following Vitali-type theorem was proved in [2].

**Theorem 6 ([2]).** *Let  $(f_n)$  be a uniformly (Lebesgue) integrable sequence of functions  $f_n : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergent in measure to a measurable function  $f : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ . Then  $f$  is integrable and  $\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n \int_\Omega |f_n - f| = 0$ .*

For our purposes we need two else definitions. Let  $f_n : \Omega \rightarrow X$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $f : \Omega \rightarrow X$  be scalarly measurable functions. We say that  $(f_n)$  is  $\mathcal{I}$ -scalarly convergent in measure to  $f$  if  $(x^* f_n)$  is  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergent in measure to  $x^* f$  for each  $x^* \in X^*$ . We say (cf. [2]) that the sequence  $(f_n)$  is  $\mathcal{I}$ -scalarly equi-convergent in measure to  $f$  if for every  $\delta > 0$  we have

$$\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n \sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \mu(\{t \in \Omega : |x^* f_n(t) - x^* f(t)| > \delta\}) = 0.$$

The following result is an  $\mathcal{I}$ -version of Theorem 5.

**Theorem 7.** *Assume that  $(f_n)$  is a pointwise bounded Birkhoff equi-integrable sequence of functions  $f_n: \Omega \rightarrow X$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , which is  $\mathcal{I}$ -scalarly convergent in measure to a scalarly measurable function  $f: \Omega \rightarrow X$ . If  $\mathcal{Z}_f$  is contained in the pointwise closure of  $\bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} \mathcal{Z}_{f_n}$ , then  $f$  is Birkhoff integrable and*

$$\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n \int_{\Omega} |x^* f_n - x^* f| d\mu = 0 \quad \text{for every } x^* \in X^*. \tag{3}$$

Moreover, if  $(f_n)$  is  $\mathcal{I}$ -scalarly equi-convergent in measure to  $f$ , then  $\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n \|f_n - f\|_P = 0$ . In particular,

$$\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n \left\| \int_E f_n d\mu - \int_E f d\mu \right\| = 0 \quad \text{uniformly with respect to } E \in \Sigma. \tag{4}$$

**Proof.** To show that  $f$  is Birkhoff integrable we proceed as in the proof of Theorem 5 (the uniform integrability of  $\mathcal{Z}_f$  follows from the assumed convergence of  $(f_n)$ , the uniform integrability of  $\bigcup_n \mathcal{Z}_{f_n}$ , and Theorem 6). Condition (3) follows from Theorem 6 applied to the sequence  $(x^* f)$  for every fixed  $x^* \in X^*$ .

Assume that  $(f_n)$  is  $\mathcal{I}$ -scalarly equi-convergent in measure to  $f$ . Then we modify simply the argument used in the final part of the proof of Theorem 3 (cf. [2]). Fix  $\varepsilon > 0$  and pick  $\delta > 0$  such that  $\int_A |x^* f_n - x^* f| d\mu < \varepsilon$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $\|x^*\| \leq 1$  and  $A \in \Sigma$  with  $\mu(A) < \delta$ . By the assumption of the  $\mathcal{I}$ -scalar equi-convergence, pick  $E \in \mathcal{I}$  such that

$$\sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \mu(\{t \in \Omega: |x^* f_n(t) - x^* f(t)| > \varepsilon\}) < \delta \quad \text{for all } n \in \mathbb{N} \setminus E.$$

Then for all  $n \in \mathbb{N} \setminus E$  we have

$$\begin{aligned} \|f_n - f\|_P &= \sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \int_{\Omega} |x^* f_n - x^* f| d\mu \\ &\leq \sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \int_{\{|x^* f_n - x^* f| > \varepsilon\}} |x^* f_n - x^* f| d\mu \\ &\quad + \sup_{\|x^*\| \leq 1} \int_{\{|x^* f_n - x^* f| \leq \varepsilon\}} |x^* f_n - x^* f| d\mu < 2\varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$

This yields  $\mathcal{I}\text{-}\lim_n \|f_n - f\|_P = 0$  and consequently, condition (4) holds. ■

**References**

[1] M. Balcerzak, K. Dems, A. Komisarski, *Statistical convergence and ideal convergence for sequences of functions*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. **328** (2007), 715–729.  
 [2] M. Balcerzak, K. Musiał, *Vitali type convergence theorems for Banach space valued functions*, Acta Math. Sinica, English Ser. **29** (2013), 2027–2036.

- [3] M. Balcerzak, M. Potyrała, *Convergence theorems for the Birkhoff integral*, Czechoslovak Math. J. **58** (2008), 1207–1219.
- [4] G. Birkhoff, *Integration of functions with values in a Banach space*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **38** (1935), 357–378.
- [5] B. Cascales, J. Rodríguez, *The Birkhoff integral and the property of Bourgain*, Math. Ann. **331** (2005), 259–279.
- [6] J. Diestel, Jr. J.J. Uhl, *Vector Measures*, Math. Surveys **15**, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, Rhode Island, 1977.
- [7] G. Di Maio, Lj.D.R. Kočiniac, *Statistical convergence in topology*, Topology Appl. **156** (2008), 28–45.
- [8] R. Filipów, N. Mrozek, I. Reclaw, P. Szuca, *Ideal convergence of bounded sequences*, J. Symb. Logic **72** (2007), 501–512.
- [9] V. Kadets, A. Leonov, *Dominated convergence and Egorov theorems for filter convergence*, J. Math. Phys. Anal. Geom. **3**(2) (2007), 196–212.
- [10] V. Kadets, A. Leonov, *Weak and point-wise convergence in  $C(K)$  for filter convergence*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. **350** (2009), 455–463.
- [11] V. Kadets, A. Leonov, C. Orhan, *Weak statistical convergence and weak filter convergence for unbounded sequences*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. **371** (2010), 414–424.
- [12] A. Komisarski, *Pointwise  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergence and  $\mathcal{I}$ -convergence in measure of sequences of functions*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. **340** (2008), 770–779.
- [13] P. Kostyrko, T. Šalát, W. Wilczyński,  *$\mathcal{I}$ -Convergence*, Real Anal. Exchange **26** (2000/2001), 669–689.
- [14] K. Musiał, *Functions with values in a Banach space possessing the Radon-Nikodym property*, Aarhus University, Preprint Series **29** (1977).
- [15] K. Musiał, *Martingales of Pettis Integrable Functions*, Proc. Conf. Measure Theory (Oberwolfach 1979), Lecture Notes in Math. **794** (1980), 324–339.
- [16] K. Musiał, *Pettis integration*, Suppl. Rend. Circolo Mat. di Palermo, Ser II, **10** (1985), 133–142.
- [17] K. Musiał, *Topics in the theory of Pettis integration*, Rend. Istit. Mat. Univ. Trieste (School on Measure Theory and Real Analysis, Grado, 1991) **23** (1991), 177–262.
- [18] K. Musiał, *Pettis integral*, in: E. Pap (Ed.), Handbook of Measure Theory, Vol. I, II, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 2002, 531–586.
- [19] K. Musiał, *Pettis integrability of multifunctions with values in arbitrary Banach spaces*, J. Convex Anal. **18** (2011), 769–810.
- [20] F. Nuray, W.H. Ruckle, *Generalized statistical convergence and convergence free spaces*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. **245** (2000), 513–527.
- [21] L.H. Riddle, E. Saab, *On functions that are universally Pettis integrable*, Illinois J. Math. **29** (1985), 509–531.
- [22] J. Rodríguez, *On the existence of Pettis integrable functions which are not Birkhoff integrable*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **133** (2005), 1157–1163.
- [23] J. Rodríguez, *Convergence theorems for the Birkhoff integral*, Houston J. Math. **35** (2009), 541–551.
- [24] J. Rodríguez, *Pointwise limits of Birkhoff integrable functions*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **137** (2009), 235–245.

**Addresses:** Marek Balcerzak: Institute of Mathematics, Łódź University of Technology, ul. Wólczańska 215, 93-005 Łódź, Poland;

Kazimierz Musiał: Institute of Mathematics, University of Wrocław, Pl. Grunwaldzki 2/4, 50-384 Wrocław, Poland.

**E-mail:** marek.balcerzak@p.lodz.pl, musial@math.uni.wroc.pl

**Received:** 6 June 2013; **revised:** 28 June 2013